

**CONSTRAINTS TO DECENTRALIZATION
AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT; HISTORICAL
PERSPECTIVE**



By

Ghulam Haider

Supervisor

Dr. Nasir Iqbal

PIDE School of Social Sciences

Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad

2022



Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad
PIDE School of Social Sciences

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that this thesis entitled: “**Constraints to Decentralization and local Government: Historical Perspective**” submitted by **Ghulam Haider** is accepted in its present form by the PIDE School of Social Sciences, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad as satisfying the requirements for partial fulfillment of the degree in Master of Philosophy in Public Policy.

Supervisor:

Dr. Nasir Iqbal

Signature: _____

External Examiner:

Dr. Rao Nadeem Alam

Signature: _____

Head,

PIDE School of Social Sciences: Dr. Hafsa Hina

Signature: _____

Acknowledgment

Beginning with millions of thanks to Allah Almighty for enabling me to achieve my post-graduation degree. I feel deep sense of gratitude to my supervisor Dr. Nasir Iqbal for his timely suggestions, guidance and critical evaluation throughout the journey of my thesis. His guidance improved my understandings in my topic in particular and in the field of public policy in general. I praise my father MANAK ALI and elder brother Muhammad Ismail for educating me and my mother for her unconditional love and emotional support in my good and bad times. Thanks are also extended to my siblings for supporting me from primary education till my Post-Graduation.

I am extremely thankful to Dr. Iftakhar Ahmed, Dr. Hafsa Hina and sir Ahmed Hassn (UOS) for their constructive guidance in my research journey. Internet is my real facilitator

I am extremely grateful to my friends Kamilbabar, KashifAkash and Amana Ali for their emotional support in the journey of research in specific and constructive discourse on socio-economic issues in general. Last but not the least; I am thankful to Dr. AbrarZahoor for his support

Abstract

The local government of Pakistan has had limited control in the state due to the decentralised system which has been implemented in the country. The representing government due to the historic events of the military dictatorship established in the name of democracy as well as the lack of willingness of the upper level of the governance ensuring the delivery of the public service in an effective manner. This study has the aim of identifying the causes of the constraints that the representing government present the local government leaving an impact on the governance and decentralisation. In the light of the subjective nature of the study, the secondary qualitative method with the interpretive approach was adopted for this research. Through this, the researcher compare and contrasted the existing understanding with the findings developed in the current research. The analysis conducted determined that the constraints presented to the local government are driven by the political abuse of governmental power in a historic event. Apart from that, it was assessed that certain laws of the established to protect the decentralisation restrict the local government as these limits their direct intervention in the delivery of public service. The assessment further identified that the institutional instability is driven by the unwillingness of the upper tier of the local government and the political instability due to the differences in the federal and provincial laws also majorly contributes to these constraints. The reforms in the decentralisation system are recommended for the enhancement of the role of the local government in the governing of Pakistan.

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1	7
INTRODUCTION	7
1.1 Background of the research	7
1.2 Rationale	8
1.3 Statement of the Problem.....	9
1.4 Research Question	9
1.5 Objectives	10
1.6 Organisation of the thesis.....	10
1.7 Significance.....	11
CHAPTER 2	13
LITERATURE REVIEW	13
2.1 Introduction.....	13
2.2 Theories.....	13
2.2.1 Pakistan's local government system.....	13
2.2.2 Concept of decentralisation of governance.....	15
2.2.3 Link of decentralisation with democracy.....	18
2.2.4 History of centralisation and decentralisation.....	20
2.2.5 Governance constraints to decentralisation	21
2.2.6 Political constraints to decentralisation	23
2.2.7 Institutional constraints to decentralisation	24
2.2.8 Role of bureaucratic inertia.....	25
2.2.9 Theoretical conceptualisation	27
2.3. Literature GAP.....	29
2.4. Chapter Summary	30

CHAPTER 3	31
METHODOLOGY	31
3.1 Introduction.....	31
3.2 Research philosophy	31
3.3 Research method.....	32
3.4 Research approach	32
3.5 Secondary Data collection	33
3.6 Literature Search Strategy.....	33
3.7 Data Analysis	34
3.8 Research Ethics	35
3.9 Position of the Researcher	36
CHAPTER 4	38
ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION.....	38
4.1 Introduction.....	38
4.2 Content Analysis.....	38
4.2.1 Pakistan’s weak state structure throughout history.....	38
4.2.2 Historical perspectives on federal and local government divisions.....	40
4.2.3 Constraints for Local Governments in Pakistani Law	41
4.2.4 Possible solutions to removing constraints for local governing bodies.....	43
4.3 Discussion	45
4.3.1. Reasoning behind representative governments remaining wary of empowered local governments in Pakistan	45
4.3.2. Perceived threat of federal governments to their control in the upper levels of governance reflected in Pakistani law.....	47
4.4 Chapter Summary	49
CHAPTER 5	50

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION 50

5.1 Conclusions 50

5.2 Recommendations 51

5.3 Future Research..... 52

References..... 54

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the research

The objective of this paper is beyond the scope of tracing the history of local government. Still, it is useful to mention some areas that contribute to the understanding of current decentralisation reforms. In the period before British India, there was no elaborate tradition of local government in the most modern sense of the term. However, there existed a simple framework for local governance in rural areas. This was an urban panchayat (effectively a space of five people) that exercised administrative, legal and occasionally developmental functions (Shahid&Kalim, 2021). However, geographically and historically, panchayats had not existed throughout the country and neither in all the different time periods. But this system of urban governance has existed to a greater or lesser extent in different periods of history in India. In terms of delegation, there were rarely panchayats that could be considered to represent entire towns and cities, and they regularly targeted influential families, the upper classes and large cattle breeders (Khayam& Ahmad, 2020). It should also be noted that the panchayat was not the only form of city government in British India. The appointment of chiefs is one example of various forms of rural administration, although, during Mughal and British rule, chiefs were delegated by the central government rather than urban autonomy (Afteb, 2019).

Given that the development of self-government was driven by the preparation of political groupings at both the general and higher levels after freedom, it is not surprising that little importance was given to the local government, which had little influence on the development of self-government because of its stronger links with Britain. As a result, in 1947, Punjab had a number of useful local governments, such as city panchayats and civic chambers, although these were largely composed of unelected people. Once autonomy was achieved, there was no real commitment to interaction, despite official statements (Afteb, 2019). In January 2000, the current decentralisation measures were announced by General Pervaiz Musharraf as a plan to "devolve power" and implemented through a local government resolution to be completed by September 2001 (Chandio, n.d.). On the other hand, the local government's commitment to 'devolving power' is not a simple matter. There are several parts of this reform that are worth presenting in this section. In addition to the abandonment of the administrative and consumption obligations of

local government, decentralisation has mainly led to conflicting changes in the strength of powers, the accountability of the strength of powers (political or administrative), and the nature and extent of financial resources available. In addition, the decentralisation cycle was not uniform across all agencies, and the degree of decentralisation varied widely between different offices and administrative units in the sector (Shahid&Kalim, 2021). The reform was achieved relatively quickly under military conditions and then when there was no regular or officially elected government in power. The reform is, therefore, still a process of movement and has continued to change even by the time of this entry. "Although we can anticipate some of these changes, we need to be cautious about calling the current devolution the last one".

1.2 Rationale

The core rationale of conducting this research is to identify the reasons for constraints presented by the representative government for local governments, impacting decentralisation and governance. Several studies can be found regarding the benefits of decentralisation in the local governments in Pakistan, such as the researches of Ahmad and Abu Talib (2013); Ahmad & Talib (2015), Aslam & Yilmaz (2011); Iqbal & Nawaz (2010). However, the publications have failed to demonstrate and identify implications that are playing a negative role or have become deterrents in decentralisation and passing of governance at the local level in the country. Moreover, the studies lack in highlighting the importance of local governments for enhancement of local areas and development of people by means of delivering new opportunities and bettering the conditions of local regions (Akhtar, 2014; Karim, 2016). Additionally, the motivations why representative governments are wary of local governments have not been elaborated in detail in the current literature with a historical perspective (Haider & Badami, 2010; Khan, 2017). There is a need to identify implicative insinuations for implementing permanent or temporary measures for empowering local government systems from a historical perspective. This is because a historical perspective delivers understanding regarding what has shifted over the years, and how behaviours, policies and actions of the government have changed. It allows identifying whether reasons for constraints by the representative government are forceful, justified or a mere act of power and authority. This research, therefore, intends to contribute to the current literature by means of filling the identified gaps with a historical perspective to add value to the current body

of work. The study also aims to inform the importance of designing policies so that hindrances in the path of passing governance and decentralisation at the local level are mitigated.

1.3 Statement of the Problem

The primary problem of this research concerns the inefficient role of representative government in passing governance and decentralising empowered local governments in Pakistan. Due to this, local governments have to face various constraints, including limited revenue, provision of incentives for public services, funds from higher government levels, high dependency on federal and provincial budgetary transfers, and lack of coordination between the commission and local governments. Attributing to the aforementioned constraints, local governments are not capable of embracing community empowerment and participation for developing local capacity for development, poverty reduction, and change at the local level. There is a need to identify the causes of constraints coming from higher and representative governments and their implications for local governments.

Despite highlighting the significance of decentralisation, gaps exist between the development preferences of ordinary citizens and the policy priorities of the candidates for local government positions. Moreover, even after the recognition of local government as the third tier of government, the current representative government does not agree with passing powers to this tier which significantly presents gaps in the sustainability of local governments. Considering this, there is a huge gap between practice and theory because ground realities are far from decentralisation and governance of local governments. If the current gaps are not bridged, the system will continue to face the same destiny as faced by prior local governments. Provided that the existing system may retain for a long time, fair time to local governments are needed to be delivered so that they can show potential to meet citizens' expectations that can play a vital role in the development at the grass-root level.

1.4 Research Question

Why the representative governments have remained wary of empowered local governments in Pakistan, perhaps seeing them as a threat to their control in the upper levels of government, this wariness, too, is evident in the existing Acts?

1.5 Objectives

Pakistan's local government system is being established in stages, and this has been happening at many levels. Pakistan faced many difficulties during its early independence; hence this research has addressed this week's state structure in the analysis. Currently, the state administration has survived with some short and temporary policies or measures. Because of this, local governments have to encounter a number of constraints, including inadequate revenue, facility of inducements for public services and high dependence on central and regional financial transfers. Local administrations have been used efficiently for this purpose and have industrialised a funding policy. Hence, the key objective is stated below:

To identify the reasons for constraints presented from the representative government for local governments, impacting decentralisation and governance.

1.6 Organisation of the thesis

The structure of this study has been divided into five sections which are further divided into subsections. The chapters are explained below:

Chapter one: This chapter is the introductory chapter of the thesis. It has provided a thorough understanding of the context of the study as well as the rationale of why the study has been conducted. The chapter has provided the problem statement concerning the issues which led to the conduct of this research. The chapter has also included the objectives of the study as well as the significance of conducting the research.

Chapter two: This chapter is associated with the review of the key literature available on the topic of the study. The literature review has provided a comprehensive review of the theories that are related to the study as well as a critical analysis of the past research and their findings. This chapter has also provided the research gap that is pertinent in the existing body of knowledge.

Chapter three: This chapter is a research methodology that comprises the description of the methods and techniques that have been adopted in this study. It has covered the research design, approach and philosophy, which are applicable to the topic of the study and its objectives. The chapter has also provided a detailed account of data collection methods that have been adopted in this research. Moreover, the data analysis technique has also been defined in this study.

Chapter four: The chapter is known as data analysis and discussion. In this chapter, the researcher has included the analysis of the data, which is according to the data analysis technique mentioned in the method chapter. The chapter has also included the discussion of the objectives in which the findings have been analysed and compared, and contrasted with the previously conducted studies. In addition to this, the discussion has also determined if the objectives of the study have been achieved with the help of the findings.

Chapter five: This chapter is comprised of the conclusion and recommendations of the study. It has also included the overall summary of findings as well as recommendations for future researchers. A comprehensive conclusion of the study has also been provided in this chapter.

1.7 Significance

It is seen by strategy reviewers, the IMF and donor countries as a key element in creating majority governments at the grassroots level. Decentralisation is also an important prerequisite for donor development assistance worldwide. Being that democratisation has become a central idea presented by donor countries and global financial institutions in the creative world though, decentralisation across the spectrum of majority rule also gained greater importance, which is the main significance of this study.

Moreover, democratic decentralisation can be characterised as a method that brings the communication of public administration closer to the buyer, improves the responsiveness of the central government to the demands of the people, improves the skills and nature of public administration, and involves subordinate units to involve more people (Hussain et al., 2021). Above all, it strengthens a culture based on consultation at the local level. One study cites greater recognition of the head of state, greater interest of various social groups in dynamic activities, and greater accountability of leaders as obvious benefits of decentralisation. In Pakistan, the cooperation of ethnic groups in local development is linked to the Decentralisation Plan, adopted in 2000 as part of the decentralisation strategy after the declaration of the Local Government Framework and implemented in 2001.

This decentralisation plan claimed that the new local governance framework would provide a basis for local governance through the creation of active networks that would further

describe and strengthen the regions. This study is extremely important because of a number of factors, including the increasing decentralisation of local government, historical perception awareness and also the local government development. This is because, with greater decentralisation, local contributions can initiate collaboration with key grassroots partners, facilitating aid transfer and neighbourhood development. The arrangement of local government factors should be familiar with protecting the interests of local networks through their dynamic cooperation in the development cycle and dynamic, supporting them with clear regulatory obligations and no political obstacles.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

Accountability in governmental institutions is considered to be a vital aspect as it shows that each aspect is working effectively and efficiently in resolving their local issues at the grass-root level. The main factor to consider is that, at times, the governmental institutions do not look into local affairs directly but hire local representatives that are tasked with taking care of the situation (Yilmaz, Beris& Serrano- Berthet, 2010). However, Khan (2011) highlighted that the notion of implementing decentralisation and governance at the local level would help in achieving better results, rather than having a centralised system overlooking every issue at local and national levels. The centralised system does not help in resolving all issues. In this chapter of the study, the literature review has been carried out in light of the research objectives and topic of the study. The chapter will conclude with a summary of the main findings of the literature review by highlighting the gap.

2.2 Theories

The theories that are used in the current study are mainly focused on the local government system of Pakistan, along with focusing on decentralisation of governance and different aspects related to the decentralisation aspect in the government in terms of political, governance and institutional constraints.

2.2.1 Pakistan's local government system

Pakistan is a federal republic with a bicameral elected parliament that comprises of two houses. These are Senate and the National Assembly. The country has a governmental system based on which the entire country functions. According to Ahmad and Abu Talib (2013), with the government, there are three aspects that are the judiciary, executive and legislature. The authors further described that the judiciary is mainly the system that comprises of judges. The judicial system is focused on the authoritative adjudication of controversies regarding the implementation of laws in different situations.

On the other hand, the executive government is the type of government that is tasked with the day-to-day management of the state. Rezaee, Hasanain and Khan (2015) highlighted that the executive is not supposed to make laws or understand them. Individuals' part of the executive government is led by the head of government. The legislature government is the type of government that comprises of two houses, which is what has been implemented in Pakistan.

Arif et al. (2010) highlighted that the Local Government Ordinance (LGO) was endorsed by the Musharraf government in 2001. The purpose was to decentralise powers from the central to local governments, which is not the first effort to make the local provision of services strong, or the fiscal autonomy and accountability to citizens. It is imperative to note that the Basic Democracies System of the late 1950s and the New Social Contract of the mid-1990s also had similar objectives. However, the power was then recentralised. It is vital to note that the LGO is considered to be unique in the constitutional defence owing to its reforms. In December 2003, the local-government variations were incorporated into the 1973 Constitution. President Musharraf cushioned the construction of decentralisation against alteration or revoked for six years.

The local government comprises of two forms, which are local government and local self-government. Beshi and Kaur (2020) highlighted that the local government is the administration comprising of local areas that are run by an appointed bureaucracy. On the other hand, the local self-government is the management of local areas that are run by its voting agents.

There are specific constitutional provisions set for the local government in Pakistan. The local government is protected by the constitution in Articles 32 and 140-A. It should be noted that Article 32 states, "*promotion of local government institutions. The state shall encourage local government institutions composed of elected representatives of the areas concerned, and in such institutions, the special representation will be given to peasants, workers and women*" (Pakistan, 2018). Article 140-A states, "*Each province shall, by law, establish a local government system and devolve political, administrative and financial responsibility and authority to the elected representatives of the local governments*" (Pakistan, 2018). Moving further, Soomro and Chandio (2013) highlighted that the local government in the majority part of Pakistan is empowered by provincial legislation. In the case of federally administered tribal areas

(FATA), the local government guideline draft was prepared in 2012 on the demand of tribal leaders. However, as it was not approved by the President, the local government system does not exist in FATA currently.

The structure of the local government in Pakistan is based on the federated structures of a three tier-system of district, tehsil and union councils, which is owing to the 2001 LGO (Ullah, 2017). The author further highlighted that each level has a specific set of functions and service responsibilities. The main emphasis is on agriculture, community growth, education and health at the district level. On the tehsil level, municipal substructure services are the main focus. At the union level, community-based services are the main focus. It is imperative to note that the level of government is combined through a bottom-up planning system, the council electoral preparations, and certain processes for observing service delivery.

Apart from the aforementioned aspects, there is also the aspect of ministerial oversight in the local government. According to Myerson (2014), at the federal level, the Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination emphasises on a management role. Nonetheless, the local governments are shaped through provinces, and due to this, the ministerial oversight tends to deal with the local government departments at the provincial level. Every department is led by a specific provincial minister of the local government.

Considering the aforementioned notion, it has been observed that constraints that tend to occur in the decentralisation and governance of the local level mainly arise from the various aspects that are part of the local level. It is important that the ministers at the local level, as well as the local bodies that have been created for each specific area, are being emphasised upon.

2.2.2 Concept of decentralisation of governance

Al Farid Uddin (2018) highlighted that decentralisation is mainly an administrative improvement to partition and distribution of central government establishments, activities, rights, and errands related to the unsociable grassroots managerial components. The author further stated that governance, on the other hand, is perceived as an administrative innovation that helps with the effective application of organisational arrangements and reforms. The decentralised government is mainly about introducing the provision to democratic state-run, whole state

affairs, grassroots supremacy and better public services. The decentralised supremacy helps in the allocation of the power and expert to the remote level management (Hankla& Downs, 2010). It helps in empowering the local level administrative wings, along with improving the active public participation. The decentralised governance is linked with ensuring that there is sound and sustainable governance taking place.

According to Aslam and Yilmaz (2011), there is a vital process of administration of decentralisation regarding its comprehensive application in the substantial amount of countries and intense penalties regarding the way governance is carried out. There are specific features related to the decentralisation aspect that are defined below:

Governance origination

Ahmad and Abu Talib (2013) highlighted that decentralisation emphasises on broad avenues for governance. The authors further highlighted that the approach allows people to participate, be able to hold higher authorities accountable and obtain transparency from them. Moreover, it also focuses on eradicating the dictatorship and sovereignty of the central government that allows the development of governance.

Triggering local government

In this aspect, decentralisation makes the local government system strong through delegation power. These powers are distributed among the local authorities (Nadeem, 2016). The grassroots individuals are able to receive opportunities that help in the contribution to the governance system. It is imperative to note that this approach will boost the powers of the people and help them in being able to hold the authorities accountable.

Making use of local resources

According to Mbate (2017), the faraway resources of the country has known to remain unexploited owing to the backing of the administration. The author further stated that decentralisation helps with creating opportunities that make use of the local resources of a nation. When a country is able to make use of its local resources, the notion of purchasing more resources from external aspects tend to decline significantly.

Contributing to the administrative matrix

When there is the implementation of decentralisation, the local level officials and grassroots are able to make use of the opportunity to play a part in the organisational activities of the country (Jabeen, Farwa&Jadoon, 2017). This approach would allow the local officials and grassroots to take part in the decision-making aspect of the organisational operations in the country. Their suggestions and views would be considered towards the strategies that are being implemented for the purpose country's betterment or policy-making aspect.

Organisational management

According to Shah (2017), the decentralisation aspect recovers the managerial actions through regionalisation and allotting the authority and accountability. The author further stated that within the organisational management, any form of regulatory barriers to governance is removed. This ensures that each region is given the task to deal with its own set of managerial activities and any constraints that it faces in implementing strategies or policies. Moreover, this particular approach also makes it easier for the Federal government to be able to take accountability from the regional level regarding various projects that are assigned to them for completion. It should be stated here that a check and balance notion would be implemented here.

Communication with the remote area

This last aspect emphasises on the central and local management that communicate quickly and frequently through the provision of decentralisation of government (Kharl, Abbass&Oghai, 2018). The authors further stressed on the notion that when there is effective communication, it leads to having better administrative and service governance. In simple terms, the aspects of decentralisation and governance being implemented in this particular aspect would allow the local level government to communicate with specific remote areas. Moreover, it is important that effective communication strategies are put in place, which means that local administrators should be able to convey to the people residing in remote areas about the services that would be provided to them and how it would be beneficial for them.

In the context of the present research, decentralised governance would help in resolving constraints that occur at the local level. The role of the federal is to ensure that governments are able to manage state affairs in an efficient manner. The government would ensure that the government endeavours are made further strong. By resolving the constraints aspect, the local

level government would be able to ensure that it is implementing the aspect of decentralisation and governance in an effective way.

2.2.3 Link of decentralisation with democracy

Sengupta and Corbridge (2013) highlighted that there is a strong link between decentralisation and democracy as both are interrelated. The decentralisation aspect mainly paves the way for democracy to take place and allows people participation to take the central role. The notion of decentralisation and governance at the local level in Pakistan is about ensuring that the local bodies that are created for the purpose of taking responsibility of their specific areas are able to be taken for accountability.

Misra (2013) highlighted that the link between decentralisation and democracy works in a specific way. The local government work towards educating people regarding the responsibility of government and democracy. The next step is that the local governments help in recruiting and training the new political leadership that looks towards aspiring the national-level leadership. The third step is for the local government to ensure that participants of the greatest number of citizens in the political and democratic procedures. This leads to local governments being more proximate to the public than towards the central government. The local government becomes answerable to the public and has to ensure that it is able to implement all the promises that the local government had made to the public. The accountability factor plays a significant role.

According to Ziegenhain (2016), the local authorities tend to offer a window of democratic occasion for the public to declare and excerpt higher heights of accountability from government officers. The author further highlighted that the procedure is assisted owing to the fact that local politicians are closer to the people; in terms of geographical, social and economic aspects. It is imperative to note that the local governments play a vital role in economic growth by helping to assemble resources that are required to offer and uphold basic services that are needed by the local community and facilitating information exchange, services and innovation.

However, Mbate (2017) asserted that, at times, the local government is not able to perform to the best of its abilities when it is in constant interaction with the people. The author further stated that people tend to become more aware of the local government's work and start

holding them accountable on a regular basis. This makes it difficult for the local government to work as, at times, strategies are not implemented at the specific time mentioned, and there are various delays that tend to occur. Therefore, the constant interaction in light of the democratic can cause the local government to not carry out their work effectively.

In the context of the current research, it is imperative to note that in a country like Pakistan, the aspect of accountability is non-existent. The notion of local government being constantly connected with the public is something that has not been happening in the country for a long time. Saud and Khan (2016) highlighted that in a country like Pakistan, the aspect of democracy's credibility is often questionable owing to the incompetence of democratic regimes and their inability to trickle down to the general public as a way for resolving the problem. The authors further demonstrated that the combination of having powerful individuals in positions and having weak institutions in place resulted in the lack of accountability and bypassing the institutional frameworks that usually occurs due to the political elites. Pakistan, as a country, has always been limited to the ballot box, which is used for the purpose of the legislature. As a combination, the political parties have resisted the internal elections because they are dominated by powerful families or one family, in some scenarios. Kakar (2017) noted that the democracy in Pakistan had been based on faulty foundations of electoral fraud, corruption and criminalisation of the political process. The elite power structures tend to have a disproportionate number of seats in the legislature and tend to hijack the political, electoral and legislative procedures. Any kind of change that occurs in government usually affects the policy-making or legislation as successive governments tend to have similar faces as same families keeping coming back to power due to family connections or due to inter-marriages.

The dictatorial rule of Pakistan is perceived as the prime example of devolution of power or the local government systems. The country's history shows that military rules have always focused on being more proactive regarding implementing local governments systems in direct contrast to the civilian rulers in being hesitant towards a system. The concept of General Ayub Khan regarding basic democracy and General Zia ulHaq's local governments and Majlis-e-Shura shows the purpose of perpetuating power for the military dictators rather than devolving power to the masses.

2.2.4 History of centralisation and decentralisation

The phenomenon of centralisation and decentralisation is deeply embedded in the European tradition. The mostly contradictory but somewhere always intertwined steps of the two processes have fundamentally shaped the image of the social fabric of Europe that has unfolded since the new age - at both the political and administrative levels (Møller&Skedsmo, 2013). It can also be stated that the centralisation of the centre against the periphery hegemony and generally the city's rule over the region. The process of centralisation established in modern Europe can be divided into several stages. The royal absolutism in the 18th century following his formation of nation-states was followed by centuries in which centralisation was to achieve the national unity of sovereign states (Osborne, 2015). The centralisation significantly contributed to the development of Europe for better and greater can be made it possible force her use of resources. The most important changes affected the organisation of the state and civil conditions: on the one hand, it is valid throughout the country's legislation was created, which is on the same judicial power, on the other hand, the single administrative system came into force. The centralisation efforts can be attributed to large-scale projects realisations, which insulate the population history liquidated (Devroe&Petrov, 2014). These included the development of road and rail networks, postal and telecommunications systems, highways, and air transport. They could make it possible to reach out to citizens of the city; and, conversely, they proved to be an excellent tool to his city easily against his hold on the countryside under the control (Devroe&Petrov, 2014).

The latter trend has triggered the fight against centralisation the most. Centralisation met with serious resistance when it found itself confronted with local and rural traditions, as the latter had its roots far deeper in European history than the changes that took place in the modern age (Bush, 2016). Reason - despite the government's official discourse - of local interest, such as a specific form of identity fought battle, the first level of the country primary against the national interest. The centralisation of the authority decentralisation paradigm is significantly dented, which reached the same results in technical and social development (Houdret&Harnisch, 2019). The practice established in the United States is fundamentally more democratic, as it asserts the strength and momentum of the countryside. The European Union in the form of a two-Installation tries to coordinate benefits: the higher he and general interests of a coherent and consistent policy designed to assemble, while local problems as the broader decentralisation

prevail (Bos, 2013). The essence of devolution is that the local-territorial body is hierarchically subordinated to the central management, its power is delegated power, its decisions are made under the professional and organisational management of the superior body, it has no or limited discretion and its decisions are usually subject to review. This delegated power extends to the specific scope within which the given organisation, person, or person has been given decision-making authority (Devroe&Petrov, 2014). The so-called decentralised body is not authorised to carry out tasks that can be undertaken voluntarily. In the context of the present research, decentralised governance would help in resolving constraints that occur at the local level (Bos, 2013). The role of the federal is to ensure that governments can manage state affairs efficiently. The government would ensure that the government endeavours are made further strong.

In the case of decentralisation, there is essentially a division of power and labour between the central and local organisations (Torjesen et al., 2017). Empowering the local organisation results in greater autonomy and does not create organisational subordination to central management. However, it is extremely important to note that the self-government autonomy of local bodies does not mean state sovereignty either, we cannot speak of absolute autonomy even in the case of the greatest degree of decentralisation, and local-territorial bodies are part of a unified state (Quezada, Walton & Sharma, 2016). Decentralisation is the counterpart of centralisation, in a non-equivalent form, of course. It is important to emphasise, however, that centralisation and decentralisation are not a zero-sum relationship with each other, not alternatives to each other, but complementary. Given that the development of self-government was driven by the preparation of political groupings at both the general and higher levels after freedom, it is not surprising that little importance was given to the local government, which had little influence on the development of self-government because of its stronger links with Britain (Bush, 2016). This decentralisation plan claimed that the new local governance framework would provide a basis for local governance through the creation of active networks that would further describe and strengthen the regions.

2.2.5 Governance constraints to decentralisation

Decentralisation is the principle of administering government which is challenged by centralisation. Decentralisation produces local government. There is a division of authority as well as the availability of adequate space to interpret the authority given to lower government

units (Halásková&Halásková, 2014). The group that defines decentralisation as revolution and concentration states that the concrete form of adhering to this principle is the existence of autonomous regions. Governance plays an important role in the context of providing public goods and services as decentralisation increases in various countries (Azfar, Kahkonen, Lanyi, Meagher & Rutherford, 2018). This includes the delegation of fiscal authority to the regions. In theory, fiscal decentralisation is believed to improve governance and encourage local governments to be more responsible and responsive. Despite becoming an increasingly popular policy, many countries have and will fail to achieve an effective fiscal decentralisation system due to a lack of good governance (Wu, Li, Hao, Ren & Zhang, 2020). The design of a decentralised system does not have a strong concept. One of them is caused by the absence of a clear expenditure assignment and is constrained by the policy harmonisation system between the centre and the regions. In addition, the design of a fiscal decentralisation system that does not take into account the dependence of excessive transfers from the central budget is also a serious obstacle (Dafflon, 2015). There is a vital process of administration of decentralisation regarding its comprehensive application in a substantial amount of countries and intense penalties regarding the way governance is carried out.

Although decentralisation can conceptually increase the effectiveness of public spending, central governments often assume that their legitimacy will decrease (Rodríguez, 2018). Moreover, in several countries analysed, there are also concerns about political competition and weakening the political power of the ruling party at the centre. This decentralisation system is very good because the goal is for democracy, meaning that power is in the hands of the people so that the community can participate in political administration, not only the division of authority between the centre and the regions, delivery of finances, the principle of justice (Smoke, 2015). It's just that in practice there are always people or individuals who abuse the authority in this system or elites who abuse power for their interests and not for the community. So there are problems that always harm the people and these problems often occur at the local level because in the last 10 years it has been dominated by success stories of consolidation between the local and the oligarchs, both in the political, social, and economic areas (Kersting& Vetter, 2013). In this aspect, decentralisation makes the local government system strong through delegation power. These powers are distributed among the local authorities. The grassroots individuals can receive opportunities that help in the contribution to the governance system.

2.2.6 Political constraints to decentralisation

As the doctrine points out, decentralisation is a transfer of competence from the central to the local level. In other words, the centre lets the local authorities do what they see fit, given the needs at the local level (Olum, 2014). This solution has been accepted and enshrined in law, given that local authorities, given the relatively small territory in which they operate, have a closer relationship with residents and are able to assess how to act so that to ensure the satisfaction of the local public interest (Gash, Randall, & Sims, 2014). The principle of decentralisation comes with another, the principle of local autonomy, enshrined both at the constitutional level and the legal level. The division of state power and state tasks theoretically has two dimensions, horizontal and vertical. The horizontal division of power and labour affects the relationship and division of labour between central state bodies (Gash, Randall, & Sims, 2014). A central government that is not strong institutionally often causes decentralisation to be ineffective. An example of a weak system at the centre is political instability. Furthermore, the unpreparedness of the central government can also be seen in the supervision and optimisation of the system of taxes and other levies managed at the central level (Ssonko, 2013). In the case of several countries, obstacles to decentralisation can also be caused by conflicts between local governments and traditional tribes. In addition, there is also resistance from those in power informally, such as interest groups that have a strong political base in the regions.

The impact of history and colonial influence on the traditional pattern of power in the region can be one of the political constraints to decentralisation (Ssonko, 2013) This historical background has an impact on the potential that regional units then do not carry out their decentralised functions because their human resources do not have career goals that are in line with the goals of decentralisation (Cole, 2014). Decentralisation is also an arena for corruption, collusion, and nepotism because it often happens in presidential elections, governor elections, and district/mayor elections their desire to be elected they use all means so that they can occupy the stage of power and that is very bad and that could be a problem of undermining the democracy (Wright, 2017). Dilemmas in the implementation of decentralisation occur mainly related to basic public services, although they can still be implemented and improved in quality, in practice, it is quite difficult to fulfil. This is because the implementation of decentralised regional autonomy means an increase in the burden of regional government obligations (Wright,

2017). The transfer of these obligations and functions is not easy and takes a long time to achieve.

It will be even more complex if some regions are reluctant to accept the delegation of tasks. Furthermore, more regional budgets are allocated for personnel expenditures (Wright, 2017). The weak acquisition of regional revenue as a result of the limited tax authority is also related to the issue of the integrity of national development, both aspects of planning and the realisation of development (De & Nag, 2016). There is also the problem of the readiness of local government officials to carry out their authority. It is important to note that this autonomy is by no means absolute and has limitations in the field in which it applies - it is only the executive level (Zaidi, Bigdeli, Langlois, Riaz, Orr, Idrees & Bump, 2019). Decentralisation (and autonomy) has an administrative character, the local public authorities carrying out exclusively public administration activities, which imply their observance of the constitution and laws (Zaidi et al., 2019). When there is the implementation of decentralisation, the local level officials and grassroots are able to make use of the opportunity to play a part in the organisational activities of the country.

2.2.7 Institutional constraints to decentralisation

Institutional decentralisation is an important aspect in terms of a democratic state. It deviates the authorities from the central government to the local singular state or city government. In another context, decentralisation is the transfer of local state measures and control to the local state government which is elected from the local state seats and state assembly (Neri, 2019). When there are numerous benefits of decentralisation, there are also some constraints to institutional decentralisation. It includes the decentralisation of merit and interest to the locals and specifically to the locals from the poor class. In terms of a study Vall-Prat & Rodon, (2017), it was stated that decentralisation is specifically introduced to control and manage the needs of the poor class as the central government could not be able to handle a specified and local manner. But unfortunately, decentralisation in the present world is only be ruled by the elite class and also work for them rather than the poor of the country.

In similar, another study An & Hou (2019) had mentioned that instead to raise the poor class to the upper level, decentralisation in the countries are in favour of the lead class. As the

concept which is needed to be controlled by the local pools are eventually in the hands of the elite class also work for the welfare of the elite class. Hence, in accordance with to study of Olum(2014), it was concluded that local governments and affairs could be managed in an optimised manner through decentralisation, but in the context of the present-day world, political parties are only focused on the developments before the coming elections to gain votes. This is considered as the main constraint of decentralisation due to which the local needy or poor get ignored by both local and central governments. In contrast, a study stated another constraint to institutional decentralisation is accountability and corruption at the local level. In this context, different authors have reflected the corruption enlargement in the decentralisation framework (Spoann, et al., 2018).

In the context of a study by Boadway& Dougherty (2018), it was demonstrated that in the decentralisation government if the elected representative is involved in corruption, it would become complex for the central government to progress at the local level. Unless the locals elect the representatives who belong to the central government. An author Vall-Prat &Rodon (2017) on the other hand contributed to identifying the decentralisation constraints which highlights the complex and non-productive relation of the central government and decentralise government which impacts the production and working of both centralise and decentralised authorities and indirectly they affect the locals and poor of the state (Walker, 2015). Furthermore, a study also pointed out the nonuniform policy-making as well as the duplication of work in case of differences in the local and central government officials (Gren, 2018). As in different countries such as Pakistan, the provincial government and the central government opposed each other decisions and policies which eventually affect the performance and equipped double costing in the context of duplication of services.

2.2.8 Role of bureaucratic inertia

Bureaucratic inertia is a situation in which the bureaucratic rules and tasks of a foundation become awkward and deadly that the organisation cannot effectively perform its tasks at the centre. Eventually, the bureaucratic organisation will become self-perpetuating and its centre will be driven by established conventions rather than by core activities and objectives (Purnomo, et al., 2021). The end point of bureaucratic inertia is when the organisation expands

independently of its core area of development. For example, a law firm might open a new workplace in an existing area for development purposes, regardless of whether there is interest in that area in running the centre (Ghaffari&Rostamniya, 2017). In this aspect, the term 'bureaucratic inertia' is used as a synonym for 'official inertia' and 'government inertia', i.e. the sense of reluctance to choose a decision that will lead to a more socially efficient outcome. Inertia can be the result of an ideal combination of factors: the risk aversion of government officials, formalisation, and the presence of a guiding structure that emphasises choice limitation. The formalised dynamic cycle in bureaucratic organisations is designed to promote development. However, instead of being responsive to potential change, such cycles are seen as overly bureaucratic, which hinders progress (Purnomo, et al., 2021). As a result, agencies are less inclined to improve because of the complexity of rational real-life factors and, in the long run, a culture of risk aversion. Bureaucratic inertia is also evident in government officials who use their discretion to improve alternatives even when there are specific requirements. In accordance with Hong &Teh, et al (2019), bureaucratic inertia also depends very much on how much bureaucrats tend to recognise how such policies, developments, or changes affect the interests of public employees. Policies that are compatible with the interests of the bureaucracy can be adjusted effortlessly since the means of implementation require little change or twisting. However, policies that are not in line with the wishes of civil servants are not implemented in practice. The larger the organisation, the more pronounced the bureaucratic inertia.

According to Biddulph (2019), the failures of the administration have always been blamed for every single problem the country faces. This is partly because the bureaucratic formalities and administrative noise surrounding every move by the public and government agencies have prevented them from acting decisively. In Pakistan, government institutions and their normal work are controlled by the executive, and also rely on it to oversee everything (Ghaffari&Rostamniya, 2017). However, over a long period, government officials and public institutions have moved away from their actual intended responsibility of serving the public and moved to apply their status to the people they promised to serve. This unbridled and in most cases illegitimate exercise of power increases every time a popularity-based system is replaced by a tyrannical principle. This has also led to huge levels of corruption and nepotism, as people know they are not accountable to anyone.

2.2.9 Theoretical conceptualisation

Administrative theory

The administrative theory was introduced by Henri Fayol who demonstrated the managerial aspects in the context of the organisation and human behaviour. The administrative theory is based on the subdivision of activities into different departments (Thompson, et al., 2017). This theory is also referred to as the theory of departmentalisation as the perception of departmentalisation is reflected in the context of achieving a common goal with the collaboration of different activities and groups (Edwards, 2018). Similarly, in the context of the organisation, administrative theory reflects the effective classification of departments depending on the kinds of operations and services of an organisation.

In accordance with Mustafa et al (2019), the administrative theory was produced in contradiction of the Taylor “scientific management theory” which emphasises on the working efficiencies of the workers rather than the management and the managerial structure. Henri Fayol integrated this theory with describing pre-measures that are needed in the context of efficient working. Henri fayol added that management efficiency should be considered as the basic step to standardise an organisation (Yong-jun, 2018). As the operations and working efficiency is regarded as the second priority after optimising the overall management. In this regard, Henri Fayol produced 14 management principles which are emphasising on the work division, responsibility and authority, Discipline, Command unity, Directive unity, genera interest and individual subordination, personnel remuneration, centralisation, scalar chain, equity, order, tenure stability, initiative, and individual unity (Zang& Wang, 2018).

Kerala model Methodology

The Kerala model is a development methodology used in the Indian state of Kerala. The model is illustrated by results showing robust social indicators such as high earnings, access to health care, extravagant aspirations, low neonatal mortality, and low fertility rates that are often comparable to those in developed countries, despite a low per capita wages at all levels (Chathukulam&Tharamangalam, 2021). These results and the variables causing them are seen as the typical aftermath of the Kerala model. The Kerala model has several indicators of high material and personal satisfaction associated with low per capita wages that benefit almost the entire population of Kerala (KODUVAYAKKAL, n.d.). In addition, high personal material

satisfaction is achieved through wealth and asset restructuring programs. Furthermore, there is considerable political support and activism among regular people and committed pioneers at all levels (Pillai, 2018). The people of Kerala and reputable institutions have had the choice to work within largely equitable concepts to which their activities have contributed.

The elements that have contributed to Kerala's achievement are attributed to significant land changes and the Food with the planned program, which focuses on low-cost shops and projects for young students, children, and mothers (Ariyari, 2019). This also concerned about easy access to necessary and safe health care; capacity building, especially among women, through free and universal primary and elective education; compensation for demanding gardening and home gardens; affordable transport, and rural electrification. In accordance to Azad, (2020), equitable involvement of the poor and workers, for example in trade unions and urban associations, and social development through the establishment of community societies and other grassroots activities to promote conservation, encouraging interaction with the general public on environmental conservation issues. Some attribute of Kerala's prosperity to a combination of one or more of the following factors Kerala's ability to undertake public activities such as the training of labourers and modern professionals by radical groups, the dissemination of skills, especially among women, and the defence of women's rights (although in most cases these rights were the result of very unexpected factors) (Pillai, 2018). This also included addressing social imbalances, reducing inequalities in pay and access, and developing and supporting social development in their home countries. As one study has shown, it is the 'social justice' model that best describes the Kerala experience.

Laswell's model Policy cycle

The term 'policy cycle' refers to the intermittent examples of systems that eventually lead to the creation of public policy. The advantage of dividing these methods into stages (agenda setting, planning, and implementation) is that they provide useful insights into dynamic cycles (Dunn, 2018). Above all, the policy cycle approach provides a way of looking at the practical factors involved in the sectorisation of public policy. The idea of the policy cycle was developed in the 1950s by Harold Laswell in the United States. At the time, it was described as the science of public policy as interdisciplinary, critical thinking, clearly standardised, and almost disturbing

(Jann&Wegrich, 2017). Based on these attributes, Laswell proposed the concept of the policy cycle, which he divided into seven main dynamic phases. Although the three attributes for political thinking proposed by Laswell have withstood daily challenges, his regression model is now heavily criticised for the piecemeal way in which it treats information variables (Althaus&Threlfall, 2021). Currently, the consensus in the review field is that the model should be divided into five key stages: agenda setting, policy planning, public policy dynamics, policy implementation, and policy evaluation. each of the five phases is important, but three of them, agenda-setting, policy definition, and policy implementation, are crucial to understanding the policy cycle (Capano&Pritoni, 2020).

Agenda-setting, the most important stage of the policy cycle, is the cycle in which a social situation is identified and considered a 'public problem' that is not currently subject to social or normal regulation and has no place in the private sphere so that it becomes the focus of debate and controversy in the media and legislation and the focus of controversy (Adam & Bauer, 2018). Agenda-setting is a key stage in the policy cycle, as its elements have a decisive influence on general policies and the policies derived from them. Depending on the case, various scholars have focused on the elements of information that are relevant for policy decisions taken at this stage (Jann&Wegrich, 2017; Liang, et al., 2020). Their study has led to the conclusion that agenda-setting is a socially evolved interaction in which entertainers and foundations, influenced by their belief systems, play a key role in determining the issues and challenges that require action against the government.

2.3. Literature GAP

The literature has covered a large part of the aspects of decentralisation and its related constraints. As such there are various gaps that are needed to be focused on with the depth explanation and concerns utilisation. In the views of (Olum, 2014; Wu, Li, Hao, Ren & Zhang, 2020) there is a need to classify implicative insinuations for implementing permanent or temporary measures for empowering local government systems. In this manner, local governments have to face various constraints, including limited revenue, provision of incentives for public services, funds from higher government levels, high dependency on federal and provincial budgetary transfers, and lack of coordination between the commission and local

governments (Wright, 2017; Capano&Pritoni, 2020). There is a need to identify the causes of constraints coming from higher and representative governments and their implications for local governments.

2.4. Chapter Summary

The review of the literature has identified a number of themes within which plausible findings from the previous research have been included. It has been found in the literature that the legislature government is regarded as the type of government which is consisted of two houses and this type of government has been implemented in Pakistan. The review has provided the description of the concept of decentralised government and it has been found that the decentralised government is primarily about presenting the provision to democratic state authorities, whole state matters, popular sovereignty and improved public services. The decentralised power aids in the distribution of the power and proficiency to the remote level management. However, it has been argued in the literature that the design of a decentralised structure does not have a robust concept as it is instigated by the lack of a strong expenditure transfer and is reserved by the policy coordination system amid the centre and the regions.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

The methodology chapter is based on the research frameworks and approaches used in context conducting research analysis. In accordance with research, the methodology chapter is considered an essential aspect of research as well as for the research findings and results (Beck, 2020). In this manner, another author mentioned that data analysis and methodology are the most required elements in terms of conducting research (Kummer, 2019). This chapter is emphasising on the various components of the methodology including research philosophy, research approach, research design, secondary data collection, and data analysis. At the end of the chapter, research ethical concerns and limitations are also discussed.

3.2 Research philosophy

The research philosophy is considered as a framework that reveals the back thoughts and mindset of the author in terms of analysis and findings. According to a study Sherif (2018), research philosophy is rated a top priority aspect specifically in terms of conducting secondary analysis. This part of the methodology plays an important role in terms of analysis and generating findings. There are several types of research philosophies such as interpretivism, positivism, realism, socialism, and various others (Beck, 2020). Concerning the present research, it has applied the interpretivism philosophy as it dictates the social and positive aspects. Furthermore, interpretivism philosophy is mainly focused on the theory and subjective elements in terms of conducting analysis and proposing the findings. The main reason for using the interpretivism philosophy is the secondary nature of the study and the subjective and theoretical requirements of the following research. In the context of research, the interpretivism approach is based on the theoretical understanding of the previous literature and findings and their concern to interpretation with accepting different thoughts and perceptions (Ruggiano& Perry, 2019). With concerning this study, another reason using interpretivism philosophy is the nature of producing theoretical results and analysis.

3.3 Research method

The research method is referred to as the procedure or structure through which the analysis is conducted. As per research, conducted analysis is carried out based on the selected research methods which conclude findings as per their nature and properties (Sherif, 2018). There are three main types of research methods that are generally used in these types of research. These methods are a qualitative method, quantitative method, and mixed research method. The qualitative method refers to the previous and subjective findings of the research whilst the quantitative method referred to the numerical data and findings. The third method is referred to as the mixed method which emphasis both aspects such as subjective and quantitative as this method is the combination of qualitative and quantitative research frameworks.

Concerning the present research, it is using the qualitative method due to its subjective and secondary nature. According to a study, the qualitative research method is considered as most ideal aspect for the secondary literature analysis and findings (Kummer, 2019). The qualitative research method allows the researcher to analyse the theoretical and subjective data or literature. It is also used in order to generate theory-based results and findings. Moreover, the basic reason for adopting the qualitative method is to analyse the secondary findings in a structured and convenient manner.

3.4 Research approach

The research approach is a type of structure or design that identifies the process and structure through which the analysis is carried out and which types of findings will be achieved. There are two basic types of research approaches as inductive approach and the deductive approach. The inductive approach is considered as an approach that helps in generating findings in a generalised manner whilst the deductive approach is referred to as the approach which proposes specified results based on the research aims and objectives (Sherif, 2018). Concerning the present study, it is based on the inductive approach as it lies on secondary literature and findings. Due to which inductive approach is considered as the most suitable as it allows the researcher to conclude the generalised findings. According to Sakamoto et al (2018), the inductive approach is one of the most suitable frameworks which helps in proposing the results which could be publically useful to other areas of research too. Another main reason for using

the inductive approach is the subjective nature of the study also demands a kind of approach which could demonstrate findings comprehensively with concerning generalised aspects.

3.5 Secondary Data collection

The secondary data collection is perhaps the main aspect of the research analysis and methodology. In accordance with research, data collection is rated as the essential aspect of the methodology section as it helps in identifying the sources of gathering data based on the research problem. In terms of data collection types, there are two main types' of data collection methods named primary data collection and secondary data collection (Beck, 2019). The primary data collection is based on the primary or fresh data that is to be gathered through various approaches such as surveys and interviews. Whilst secondary data collection is referred to as the data gathering from secondary sources such as previous literature and findings, articles, books, etc. As far as the following research is concerned, it is using secondary data collection due to the secondary nature of the study. In this aspect, secondary data is gathered through internet sources such as Google scholar, amazon books, research gate, academia, and many other sources and books as well. The main key in terms of secondary data collection is the correct style of searching which is relying on the keywords related to the study aims and objectives.

3.6 Literature Search Strategy

For extracting relevant and appropriate secondary sources, a search strategy was adopted with the assistance of the PICO (Population, Intervention, Comparison, and Outcome) framework to determine core aspects of the research questions. Kloda, Boruff and Cavalcante (2020) stated that the PICO framework assists in articulating a search strategy after identifying the core concepts and aspects, that needed to be present in the sources selected so that the research question is appropriately answered. The framework enabled to decompose the key components of the formulated research question as follows:

P –Population (representative and local governments)

I –Issue or Intervention (constraints to decentralisation and governance at the local level)

C – Comparison (none – because the only influence on local government is being assessed and no comparison is being made between representative and local governments)

O – Outcome (Impact on local government empowerment)

After determining the main concepts of the research question, keywords were set for searching sources over databases. For this purpose, a research objective was undertaken to search for accurate and authentic sources. Gavgani and Vahed (2017) inferred that key terms or search words are used for finding feasible evidence and knowledge concerning the research subject. The search terms entered into databases included “representative government”, “constraints to decentralisation and governance”, “impact on local government empowerment”, “reasons for constraints to decentralisation and governance”. These search terms were entered into selected databases of Google Scholar, JSTOR, EBSCO and Library of Congress on the grounds of their suitability and wide range of sources for including relevant information and data. Three search strategies were adopted that were first entered into the database of Google Scholar. The first search strategy involved the keyword of “constraints to decentralisation and governance”, which showed 7900 results. After, the second search strategy was applied in which the previous keyword was combined with another keyword of “representative government” with the help of the “AND” Boolean operator, which decreased the search hits. Grewal, Kataria and Dhawan (2016) defined that Boolean operators of NOT, AND, AND NOT and OR permit to link various search words together for contracting the search area over the databases. In the third search strategy, the keyword of “impact on local government empowerment” was added, which further reduced the search results. The same search strategies were applied to the rest of the chosen databases and filters of English language, full text and other filters were applied as per the format of databases.

3.7 Data Analysis

Data analysis is the procedure of structurally implementing logical and statistical methods to demonstrate and explicate, recap and condense, and scrutinise data (Ott and Longnecker, 2015). Data analysis allows cleaning, transforming and modelling gathered data to evaluate general patterns and trends to draw implicative insinuations. In the current research, the content analysis method was adopted to make effective, systematic and replicable inferences via

interpreting texts from secondary sources extracted from databases. According to Neuendorf (2017), content analysis develops proof of the reliability of qualitative data, delivers valuable insights into history, language and human thoughts, and offers analytical insights into intentions and trends of a group, institution or individual via evaluation of qualitative data. The purpose and objective of content analysis are to highlight the qualitative content in the form of objective knowledge from articles, documents and books to comprehend views, theories and perceptions about the phenomenon under discussion and address information conveyed by authors, scholars and researchers concerning the field of study (Prior, 2014). The unit of data analysis for content analysis is the representative and local governments.

Content in content analysis is the presence of particular themes, words and notions within gathered qualitative sources to evaluate meanings, associations and presence of particular concepts. As per Calik and Sözbilir (2014), content also includes social interactions and communication without the direct involvement of research participants, following a structured process, and accessing high-quality sources, which can easily be replicated by future researchers. In the current research, content in this research concerned themes, words, concepts, arguments and theories that assisted in analysing the subject matter. Thereby yielding outcomes with high quality, transparency and reliability. In this manner, the researcher was capable of determining reasons behind constraints that representative government presents for local government in their empowerment in Pakistan. The content analysis allowed to inspect patterns in relevance to the prior research question via discussing the interpretation of what the data meant and reaching insinuations concerning the content of the text (Graneheim, Lindgren & Lundman, 2017). Therefore, content analysis was the best fit for this study as it enabled a determination of the implied aspects of gathered content, simplifying unstructured content, recognising relationships and trends, presenting and evaluating findings of content, and justifying arguments to yield results from a variety of sources.

3.8 Research Ethics

Regardless of the primary or secondary nature of the study, ethical considerations remain a key part of the entire research process and therefore credibility of the research outcome as well. According to the study of Dooly, Moore and Vallejo (2017), ethics within research practices enable the researcher to claim truthfulness in meeting objectives and validity of research

questions. Therefore, to ensure that the research problem identified is provided with a solution in an appropriate manner, methodological aspects also include ethical obligations. The foremost ethical consideration to be made in secondary studies is to avoid researcher bias. As stated by Olteanu et al. (2019), it is highly likely that secondary studies can be biased to the researcher's pre-formed opinions, as personal views can be showcased in qualitative text-based studies. To avoid such an outcome and refrain from irrelevant personal opinions of the researcher or any other personnel, this study has been done in a structured scientific manner. This includes forming a literature search strategy that has set the basis for accessing, reviewing and then choosing certain research articles over others. In this way, articles with keywords and scientific credibility have been included in this study, regardless of the fact that their content may oppose the views of the researcher.

On the other hand, plagiarism is another aspect of research ethics that encourages scientific studies to be well referenced and avoid copying others' works (Helgesson & Eriksson, 2015). In case, plagiarism exceeds the allotted amount, then it jeopardises the credibility of the whole process of research. Therefore, to avoid plagiarism in this study, the researcher has opted to paraphrase sentences that are being used from other studies, while interpretation of other studies findings has been done in own words. Rivera and Vásquez-Velásquez (2015) also add that avoidance of plagiarism can also be done through well-referenced work, with a well-updated bibliography at the end of the study. Similarly, in this study, the researcher has maintained a reference list, with in-text citations for sentences where other studies' data has been used. In this way, plagiarism has been avoided and for data used, references have been used to give proper credit. In the context of research ethics, the research of Gelman (2017) further adds that for scientifically led studies, it is pertinent that the researcher remains honest in published data on the subject. Therefore, another fulfilment of ethical considerations is to avoid false interpretation or bending data to appease the researcher's perspectives, instead, objectivity has been maintained in phrasing other studies to avoid spreading misinformation.

3.9 Position of the Researcher

As a researcher, this student is qualified to conduct this research due to their credentials on the topic being evaluated of public policy and governance. As the researcher has been a student of governance and public policies and has received practical experience in the field,

which is why skill sets of critical analysis, literature review and evaluation of practical data are present.

CHAPTER 4

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Introduction

In chapter four of research studies, results and collected data is usually presented and analysed through counter assessment with other bodies of work. Therefore, in this study as well, the researcher has opted to first present data in the analysis portion of this chapter, titled content analysis. This is followed by a discussion of key points, using findings from content analysis and interpreting them through scientific studies. In this way, the chapter has been used to form critical conclusions, based on multiple perspectives of knowledge. To further answer the research question asked in chapter one of this study, analysis has not been conducted generally of the overall topic. Instead, content analysis has been divided into four main portions that answer the research question in four main perspectives. These include the structure of local governments through the history, federal and local government conflicts in the country's history, the law of Pakistan imposing constraints on local bodies and possible solutions to the aforementioned problems. In this way, the practice of constraining local governments has been analysed in three different sub-headings, while solutions undertaken by local bodies through funding and other case studies have been analysed as well. In this way, this chapter has been written to answer the research question established initially, which is done through a discussion on two main parts of the research questions. In the discussion section, literature that opposes the collected information or supports a certain point of view has been used to solidify the results and finally frame conclusions that fully answer the research question.

4.2 Content Analysis

4.2.1 Pakistan's weak state structure throughout history

Since achieving independence in 1947, Pakistan has spent long time periods under military rule (Javaid&Latif, 2017). As per Kaplan (2013), it was in 2008 that the country was able to completely transit from military to rule to democracy. In 2013, the country managed a handover from one democratically elected government to the next for the first time in its history (Gul, 2018). Haqqani and Ahmad (2018) stated that due to moving between weak civilian governments and strong military rulers, Pakistan has failed to establish a healthy political structure and institutions, an impartial judiciary, a lasting democracy and a flourishing economy.

This is because the country has coped with an acute sense of insecurity in the midst of continuing identity crisis. In this regard, Malik (2010) asserted that it is due to the incapability of Pakistan to forge a national identity that has contributed to an intensification of linguistic, ethnic and regional nationalism that has fragmented and splintered the nation. The most apparent example is of the splintering that occurred in 1971 because the government failed to inform the requirements of the ethnic Bengali community that contributed to East Pakistan choosing to become an autonomous state of Bangladesh (Memon et al., 2011). Another aspect highlighted by Long (2015) is that deep-rooted conflicts with India and among provinces since separation have prevented Pakistan from obtaining real stability of state attributing to political instability. This is why it is deemed as a “weak state” as the government has some level of authority and is capable of delivering fundamental needs. However, Masud et al. (2013) argued that Pakistan has yet to reach the status of “failed state” as the Islamabad government has little to no control over bigger parts of the country, particularly, KPK and Waziristan.

Moving deeper into history, Ayyub Khan’s era played a major role as to why the Pakistani state is still weak to this day since he aimed to replace parliamentary government with a Basic Democracies system based on which he wanted to remove ill impacts of politicians on the nation (Qasmi, 2010). However, as per Javaid and Latif (2017), the Basic Democracies system did not empower citizens to participate in the political and democratic procedures, however, it opened opportunities to buy votes, and conduct bribes and corruption from limited voters who had authority and permission to vote. Additionally, as per Long (2015), during the era of Yahya Khan, the military regime fragmented politics and societies in Pakistan as the 1970 general elections revealed social conflict and regionalism dominated politics despite efforts to control its establishment. Moreover, conspiracy against Mujibur Rahman of Awami League with military leadership by West Pakistan led to the dismemberment of Pakistan in 1971 that discredited both army and civilian bureaucracies due to which Pakistan Political Party (PPP) came into power, only to contribute to further weakening of the state (Memon et al., 2011). This is because the sole focus was made on Punjab and Sindh only. Moreover, the constitution for a political structure grounded on a semblance of a national consensus by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was suspended by General Zia ul-Haq that could have contributed to the establishment of a democratic state a lot earlier.

In 1973, when martial law was lifted and a new democratic era was announced, no significant changes were seen as it only led to boycott from political parties (Memon et al., 2011). The democratic system became haphazard and corrupt as it was grounded on the bureaucratic elites and squabbles of the military, which was reinforced by Nawaz Sharif in 1990 when he became Prime Minister (Javaid & Latif, 2017). Nawaz Sharif soon faced disapproval from many fronts as he was possibly corrupt and was deemed as power-hungry since he forced out army chief and chief justice from the Supreme Court. Malik (2010) alluded that it was the first ruling period of Nawaz Sharif in 1990 that corruption grew stronger in the system. Since then several prime ministers and presidents have been elected including Pervez Musharraf, Yousuf Raza Gillani, Asif Ali Zardari and Nawaz Sharif being elected 2 more times (Gul, 2018). Nonetheless, the struggle towards a democratic Pakistan has not been stopped as most of the people in power have focused on maintaining their own platform of power. The long-existing political instability has plagued the nation due to unevenly established constituent units. Apart from the military and civilian forms of governments, issues of economic inequities, mass illiteracy, national security and integration also explain the extent of political instability that Pakistan continues to face.

4.2.2 Historical perspectives on federal and local government divisions

After independence, the first local government system was implemented in 1958 when the military assumed power via Ayyub Khan (Malik & Rana, 2019). Basic Democracies Ordinance 1959 developed new local governments as the only representative tier of government. The purpose was to cultivate pro-military leadership and control the centre at the local level (Ahmed, Saleem & Iftikhar, 2012). However, Cheema, Mehmood and Khan (2018) contradicted that Ayyub Khan introduced the system to have control over the power of government except as a tokenistic approach. After, as per Batool (2014), a short local government term ruled under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, however, during General Zia ul-Haq's regime, the military-ruled the state from 1977. Local governments were then reformed and revised in 1979 that remained till 2000 under the control of the military by Zia ul-Haq (Karim, 2016). Nevertheless, the era of Zia ul-Haq and Ayyub Khan delivered huge importance of local government, however, no efforts were made to encourage local governments via delivering them with constitutional protection. No constitutional protection led to local governments being vulnerable to the whims of representatives and other governments in the tiers that led to

suspension (Arif et al., 2010). Nonetheless, Abbasi and Mussarrat (2015) stated that after the death of Zia ulHaq, the systematic weakening of the political party structure by means of local government by the military in Pakistan started. This resulted in the civilian government resisting any useful efforts to decentralise authority and power after 1988. It was during Musharraf's Presidency that a new Local Government Ordinance 2001 was introduced that gave power to the system till 2008 (Malik & Rana, 2019). Under Zardari's rule, it became possible for provinces to legalise the local government system of their choice and different provinces opted for different local governments that are still in effect today.

On the other hand, East Pakistan's separation in 1971 led to the concept of the federal government as Punjab dominated all other provinces and the minor provinces were compelled to follow the majority of Punjab in the parliament (Tariq, Malik & Qumber, 2018). Therefore, KPK, Sindh and Baluchistan demanded federalism that led to the representation of smaller provinces in the Senate. Thus, a federal structure in 1973 was formed that created identification of core linguistic communities with their allocated federation units, which also exacerbated ethnic conflict (Waseem, 2010). The federal system in Sindh has given birth to discrimination against minorities and Muhajrs. Regardless, Khan (2010) inferred that other provinces got their homelands legally recognised as federating units of the country under their own provincial governments. This is because federalisation in the Senate significantly improved the authenticity and visibility of ethnic majorities in every province. However, Khalid (2020) asserted that the weaknesses of federal parties including PML (Pakistan Muslim League) and PPP have provided space for their coalition partnership with ethno regional parties, which has slackened the power of federation over provinces in the current years. Ahmad (2010) propounded that federalism is a sign of shared sovereignty that remains elusive despite Pakistan having moved towards relative liberalisation of cooperation and coordination principles between and among provinces. Federal governments, thereby, under military and civilian setups depict an intention to control the power at the cost of provinces.

4.2.3 Constraints for Local Governments in Pakistani Law

Constraints for local government on Pakistani land can be dated back to the British rule over the Sub-Continent. According to the research conducted by Chaudhary and Swamy (2020), Punjab Land Alienation Act 1900 is an example of such a practice that avoided transfer of land under the governance of local bodies, and instead centralised it to the established government of

the British monarchs. On the other hand, the Punjab Pre-Emption Act 1913 is another example of a similar law enacted by the English government that prohibited transferring lands from agricultural classes to non-agricultural classes, giving power to the centre for making such decisions. The reason for doing so has been highlighted in the research of Makhdoom (2015), which states that central government formed by colonial powers did so to solidify their own vested interests in the region for natural resources. On the other hand, Judd (2005) claims it to be due to the need for suppressing local people, which entailed suppression of local governments as well. Kamran (2016) has even argued that this mentality of centre's power has been transferred from the colonial rulers to established democratically elected federal governments in Pakistan. Therefore, precursors for the Pakistani law that allows constraining local governments can be linked with the country's colonial history.

The next phase in Pakistan's history with a change of law is the Basic Democracies Ordinance 1959, which was established under General Ayub's dictatorship, after the dissolution of central and provincial assemblies (Musarrat, 2021). Under BDO, a four-tiered system was maintained that started from the lowest union council to chairman union council, elected official and chairman (Musarrat, 2021). However, even with reforms, Karim (2016) argues that intrinsically this reform constrained local governments, as real power was given to federally run institutions, like the District Commissioner office. The next stage comes under the dictatorship of General Zia-ul-Haq, who after the dissolution of assemblies again formed various local government ordinances for transfer of power at the local level. The study of Zaidi (2019) explains that in the time between 1979 and 1981, several laws were enacted that furthered a dictatorial perspective of divide and rule. Under this strategy, Zia-ul-Haq enacted laws that encouraged the formation of collaborative classes of local-level politicians, which were given authority over local government (Zaidi, 2019). This collaborative aspect of the rule emphasises the federal centralisation of power, as local governments although administrative bodies, acted in the interests of the central power. To further understand the differentiation between the local governments of Ayub and Zia, Karim (2016) conducted an assessment. The study found that little to no change exists between the financial power allotted to the local government under both laws, as the DC had the ultimate power to change, stop, abolish or introduce local body projects (Karim, 2016).

Furthermore, the weakening of the political system under Zia's dictatorship enabled the rise of personally interested politicians who formed local governments with an aim of receiving funds (Alam&Wajidi, 2013). The personality-based patronage in different provinces further encouraged family or dynastic politicians to rise, with local body funds being used to further voter base only (Abbasi and Mussarrat, 2015). Therefore, even between the democratic phase of Zia-ul-Haq's and Pervez Musharraf's dictatorship, the federal governments due to their own insecurities failed to give power to local bodies. Under Pervez Musharraf's dictatorship, Alam and Wajidi (2013) have highlighted the series of laws that began from January 1999 to August 2001, with the purpose of devolution of power from the centre. Under these laws, local bodies were given greater control over their own decisions, local body elections were conducted throughout the country, but financially these authorities were still controlled by the military dictatorship (Sultana &Issa, 2021)). After Musharraf, the 18th amendment has been hailed as a historic moment, as powers from the federal were given at the provincial level (Shah, 2012). However, even then the financial conflicts, tax issues and funds' allocation alongside opposition of the local and federal governing bodies has failed to give proper decentralised authority to local governing bodies, even today (Sultana &Issa, 2021).

4.2.4 Possible solutions to removing constraints for local governing bodies

Devolution of power from the centre to the local governing bodies is needed within a country for several administrative reasons. In the study conducted by (Abdullahi and Chikaji (2017) it has been made clear that for grass root level administrative work for the good of the people, it is a local government with adequate knowledge that cannot deliver on goals. Federal governments, even with their vast resources and power, still cannot fix local issues, owing to the lack of experiential knowledge on socioeconomic factors in the locality (Abdullahi&Chikaji, 2017). This is why the need for local government is imperative in the case of Pakistan, although in reality, the local government remains misshapen and underfunded. As a consequence, at the provincial level discrepancies occur in the case of Pakistan over possible solutions to the removal of these constraints.

For instance, in KPK, local governments have been strengthened via provincial aid. As stated by Lalzaman et al. (2017), the variance in local cultures of KPK has led the provincial government to further categorise local bodies from the lowest level of union council to even

tehsils and district level government. In this way, the addition of further two hierarchies for governance has been used to increase local governing power. In 2017, the provincial government also promised allocation of 30% provincial funds to trickle down to the lowest levels of the local government (Lalzaman et al., 2017). However, as the year was for elections, therefore claims made were not fully implemented. As Badshah, Rehman and Muhammad (2018) have stated that by 2018, only 8% of the total funds could be given to local bodies. The rest has been tarnished owed to government corruption at various levels and inadequacy of planning on spending the 30% funding (Badshah, Rehman & Muhammad, 2018). Therefore, incompetency coupled with corruption has led to decreasing power of local governing bodies. On the other hand, the case of Punjab is different to KPK, as provincial and federal government divisions remain highly impactful. For Punjab, at the local level mostly elected officials at the tehsil or union level belong to PML-N, but the federal government is of PTI (Rid & Murtaza, 2019). This division of political views, especially due to the political conflict that remains between these two political parties has led to distrust. In the case of Sindh, a similar political division remains at three levels. Firstly, the lack of trust between the federal government of PTI and the provincial government of PPP has led to underfunded provincial planning (Rid & Murtaza, 2019). Secondly, the political distrust between the provincial government of PPP and urban level governance of MQM has led to a historic conflict at the provincial and local levels of governance (Syed & Khan, 2019). As a result, funds that are rightfully for the local population, fail to reach them, as political conflict, distrust, corruption and personal vested interests fail to prioritise public social good. Syed and Khan (2019) have even argued that in Sindh, the power of local parties like MQM has been a major cause for provincial as well as federal governments to not only legally constrain local government's power, but also financially dissuade them. In this way, most of the development projects done are planned by the provincial and federal governing bodies, who fail to incorporate local perspectives (Nishtar et al., 2013). As a consequence, the provinces remain under political allegiance conflicts, with each party member trying to prove their honesty, by undermining the greater good of society or the interests of the local population. However, in Baluchistan, the case is much more different. The study of Ahmed and Baloch (2015) has explained that the lack of accountability of local bodies in the province has led to ghost workers, with closed offices and service centres. As a result, the local body, even though present on paper, remains absent from doing any real work. Considering these setbacks, it can be argued that possible solutions to

removing constraints for local governments are a complicated notion that involves reviewing the honesty and truthfulness of governing work at all levels of the hierarchy. Depending upon issues that persist for each province, possible solutions can be offered to crack down on corruption or to dissuade political parties from setting up loyalty based programs only. Apart from this, dynastic politics is another issue that can be pinpointed as the cause for issues in local governance, with Mushtaq, Ibrahim and Kaleem (2013) suggesting an end to identity politicisation.

4.3 Discussion

4.3.1. Reasoning behind representative governments remaining wary of empowered local governments in Pakistan

From the historical perspective obtained for Pakistan and the overall region of Sub-Continent, it can be argued that government wariness or sense of insecurity stems from the colonist past of the area. As under British rule, the colonisers remained wary of the local government, avoiding any chance of giving power to the local population, similar scenarios can be seen in the Pakistan of today. Stemming from this coloniser attitude, Makhdoom (2015) has even concluded that laws and legislation of Pakistan today reflect a similar attitude of the ruling elite and the ruled. This can be one of the reasons for government wariness, as historically the ruled populace has been against ruling parties. However, when applied to democratically elected governments, a similar perspective cannot be established. Instead, considering the findings of this study, it can be argued that governments remain wary of local governing bodies, due to the threat that they pose to the centralisation of power. In this regard, the study of Rezaee, Hasanain and Khan (2015) can be discussed, as it provides a similar perspective. In the study, it has been stated that federal governments in Pakistan have remained insecure, as the regional insecurity has determined equilibrium within Pakistani politics as well. Further, as Pakistan's history has been engulfed by dictatorships of various individuals, therefore it further adds to the insecurity of power, even at the federal level. Considering this information it can be argued that insecurity of power at the federal level has been transgressed into colonist based policies that avoid giving power to the locals of the population. As a result, the local bodies for governing, including the tehsil, union councils etc. Although are present, their power in matters of public interest remains close to zero.

Not only colonist past, but historically the wariness of local bodies can be pinpointed to political unrests in the country as well. Findings have revealed that under dictatorship rules, dissolution of elected assemblies led to the formation of local bodies for governance however, even with such strategies of strengthening local bodies, power ultimately remained at the hands of the central government. The study of Ahmad and Abu Talib (2013) has provided a similar perception of dictatorship in Pakistan, and highlighted Zia-ul-Haq's policies of collaborative politicians. In this way, local governing bodies have never been given complete authority, funding and the freedom to act in the local public interest. Instead, they have been used as vessels for furthering the political interests of government federal level individuals. Therefore, the reason behind wariness can also be pinpointed to the lack of trust that federation has with provincial or even local level governments, while the motivation of political growth of individuals at the local level has further dilapidated the function of these institutions.

Although, historically dictatorship and colonisers can be blamed for the inadequate of local governing bodies, in the present age wariness of federal government is invested with political allegiance. As seen in literature, the case of both Sindh and Punjab's local governments have been eradicated from their core function, through underfunding and providing no freedom. Owing to the variance in political party allegiance and divisions at local, provincial and federal levels have resulted in funding projects that support similar political interests.

However, the political deviation is not the only cause, as corruption still remains rampant. In the research of Ahmed and Baloch (2015) and Lalzaman et al. (2017), the case of Baluchistan and KPK have been highlighted to prove this point. From these studies, it can be identified that corruption remains a highly impactful and rampant issue in strengthening local bodies, which further adds to the wariness of governments. As stated by (Olum, 2014), funds for local governing bodies have been seen to be used for running political campaigns. As a consequence, the federal government chooses to avoid directly funding programs that are corrupt and feed the interests of their opposition. In conclusion, it can therefore be stated that corruption at every level of the hierarchy within governing bodies, including the bureaucracy of the country, as well can be blamed for the wariness of federation and subsequent weakness of local governments.

4.3.2. Perceived threat of federal governments to their control in the upper levels of governance reflected in Pakistani law

The research of Batool (2014) introduced the idea of dictatorship as the potential threat to the federal government as it affected the power of the governing body in the region. Likewise, it was identified that despite the era of Zia ulHaq and Ayyub Khan putting emphasis on the federal government, laws were not constituted by these military dictators for the protection of the rights and power through the development of appropriate laws. In addition to this, the research on the subject conducted in the current study provide support to this idea as Malik and Rana (2019) in their research suggested that the laws such as The Basic Democracies Ordinance 1959 were introduced for the establishment of new local government in the country. This acted as an active threat to the local government as Ayub Khan dissolved the higher tier of the government elected in the light of democracy. The act proved to be a method for gaining control over the centre and supporting the military leadership under the façade of the local government. The researcher solidified this and stated that the democracies introduced through the laws in Pakistan according to history does not empower citizens nor does it provide support to the local government which developed a wariness between the representing government and the local government. The comparison and contrasting of the evidence gathered from different existing studies and the research overviewed in the literature review suggested that the political history of Pakistan has shaped the current caution against the local government due to the laws being a threat to democracy.

After the dismissal of the Pervaiz Musharraf, new laws for the development of the regional governments in the provinces were developed (Zaidi, 2019). This allowed different provinces to establish the needed power for meeting the needs of the region and empowering citizens. Tunio and Nabi (2021) in the presented research further studied this concept and suggested that prior to the expiry of the restriction on bringing amendments to the local government ordinance of 2001 in the year 2009, a new regulatory system in Baluchistan under the Local Government Act in 2010 was introduced. Following this, the other provinces passed their laws in 2013. On the other hand, Qureshi (2020) identified the differences in these regional laws and regulatory systems as the cause of the decline in the capability of the fiscal management of the local government. Likewise, the research of Olum (2014) suggested that the differences in the different government regulations result in the lack of political stability of the

local government. The political and institutional instability of the local government due to the discrepancies in the different representation governments present a threat to the control of the upper level of the government in the country of Pakistan.

In addition to this, pieces of literature referred in the second chapter of this study summarised that the laws of the provincial governments such as the excessive power given to the provincial governments for the delivery of the public service to citizens lead to the development of constraints against the local government (Rana, 2020). The research of Muhula (2019) likewise identified that this weak external control of the local government in Pakistan due to the lack of effective oversight and the distributed internal control mechanism constraining the local government functions against the high tier of the locally elected government. One such example of the low reach of Pakistan's local government is the Interim Constitution of 1972 as article 144 of this law allowed the federal government to provide a verdict on a matter of the provinces however it was needed to be requested by the provinces (Rana, 2020). This restricted the right and the purpose of the upper level of the local government and limited the reach of the governmental matters on provincial perception and the acceptance of its authoritative role. Wright (2017) similarly identified that there is a significant increase in the burden of the regional government obligations through the implementation of laws safeguarding them. This in addition to the problem of the readiness state of the local government declined the interest of citizens which needs to be considered by the local government. Zaidi et al. (2019) studies the limitation to the upper tier of the local government of Pakistan and suggested that the lack of absolute details of the anatomy of laws preserving the right of the local government develops limitations on the executive level which threatens their democratic position in the country. Overviewing the different understandings presented in the literature and studied during the research, it is concluded that the laws of Pakistan supporting decentralization of the provincial governments led to the development of certain limitations for the upper tier of the local government as it limited their intervention in the state matters which reduces their efficiency as the highest tier of the state responsible for the national security and wellbeing of citizens.

4.4 Chapter Summary

In this chapter of research analysis and discussion, the main purpose has been to answer the research question asked in the initial chapter. For this, the chapter has first presented research findings in the content analysis section, which is followed by a critical discussion. Historical perspectives on Pakistan's more than 70-year history have been given, in accordance with local government role throughout the different timelines. In terms of local bodies' role in Pakistani history, the findings have revealed that the part played by union councils has remained limited. Further, the colonist history of the region and post-independence governance structures have remained similar in the attitude of the federal governing bodies i.e. distrust and insecurity of won power.

Therefore, the answer the question of reasons behind government wariness of local governments, it can be concluded that political equilibrium and corruption have been foremost precursors. On the other hand, the state of local governance also remains ineffective currently, as the results have indicated that even now within provinces, political opposition and corruption have hindered local government function. Possible solutions to this problem, therefore stem from specific issues prevalent in specific cases, which can vary from province to province and even local body to local body.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

5.1 Conclusions

This research is focused on the discussion of a variety of different constraints which are for the decentralization and the ways of governance locally. The study considers the historical perspective of the subject and presents the reasons for the constraints presented by the representing governments to the local governments leaving an impact on the decentralisation and governance. For the development of the conclusive understanding of derived objectives, the secondary analysis was carried out inquiring the information identifying the reason of the representative governments remaining wary of empowered local governments in Pakistan. The literature referred to in this aspect summarised that due to the inconsistent focus on different aspects which were developed in the light of the Local Government Ordinance (LGO) which was presented by Musharraf in the year 2001. However, under the consideration of the history of disagreement over the division of power between different local tiers of government and between the bureaucrats, the military and the elected government officials have been the constant cause of their wariness that is present. Different pieces of writing presented by the authors referred to in the literature section identified that as the approach of Pakistan's bureaucracy of governing the country without any elected representatives resulted in disdain due to the unjust distribution of power. In addition to this, a variety of Military dictatorships including those of Ayub Khan, Yahya Khan, Zia UIHaq and Pervez Musharraf have brought changes in the different institutions of the local government for the shifting of power in order to legitimise their regimes under the surface of democracy. This has developed a biased understanding of the representative governments and the local governments. Following this, the civilian governments have opted to oppose the distribution of resources with other tiers of governments. The research is due to the lack of power among the provincial governments on the federal level. A variety of studies focused on the idea of decentralisation and the lack of interest of the local government in the decentralisation of power in an effective manner has also caused the wariness between the two governments which results in the constraints presented to them.

Different pieces of literature discussed in the research has identified that democracy through decentralisation is the absolute focus of the representative government as it has the

tendency to ensure the development of a sustainably sound government. This justifies the lack of support provided by this government to the local government which has a strong emphasis on the attainment of centralised power in the state. The decentralised power distribution in the state of Pakistan has the tendency to enhance the concept of accountability in the state which is currently non-existent. This is found to be the component that allows government representatives to have an interaction with the citizens of the state as the means of addressing the problems which are significantly considered the cause of lack of the progression of the country. The findings are driven from the analysis also identified that despite the presence of democratic governance most of the countries like Pakistan failed to provide a fiscal decentralisation due to the absence of a competent government. This results in the absence of the development of a decentralised system in the country leading to the equal sharing of resources in the state. The researches focused on this and provided support to the idea as these summarised the concept that the local government in most of the countries put great emphasis on the abundance of the central budget which leads to a loss of the regional needs of the budgetary value among the representative government acting as a major constraint in the implementation of the democratic system of governance resulting in the constant resistance against the local governance.

The comparison and contrasting of the evidence with the abundant literature referred to in the section summarised that the development of constraints against the local government by the representing governments which has a historic background. It was also assessed that it is driven in the light of the need for democratic governance in the state resulting from the lack of distribution of power among the regional and the local government. The constraints are also found to be driven by the abundance of history and the abuse of power against the provincial governments in the sector which caused the representing governments to be wary of the local ones.

5.2 Recommendations

In the light of the derived conclusions in this research, it has been identified that there is a lack of a balanced system in the state of Pakistan between its local and the representative government. This is identified to be due to the absence of the focus in the decentralized system for the distribution of power among the different provincial governments. In the light of this, the

following recommendations are presented in order to overcome the current constraints to the local government in the state:

- Due to the centralized governing system being introduced by the British in the pre-independence period and military in the post-independence period, it is recommended to develop the method of decentralization in the country.
- In the light of the difference between the need for centralised and the decentralised power between the governments in the state, it is suggested that common ground is developed through the method of just distribution of the resources among the provinces.
- Lastly, the elected local governments are needed to be limited in terms of the decision of their expenditures is in the forms of fixed establishment costs and bring the public services to come under their purview.

5.3 Future Research

The research presented by Van Haelter, Vos and Voets (2021) identified that there is a proficient need for further exploration of the causes of the constraints which are met by the local government due to the lack of appropriate understanding of the possible issues. This leads to the development of the need for further exploration of this subject discussed in the current study. Ali (2018) supported this and comprehended that there is a pressing need for the assessment of the role of dictatorship as the cause of wariness between the local and the representative government. Furthermore, the evaluation of the lack of power of decision making provided to the representative governments has the tendency to enhance of opportunity for the development of solutions crucial to the situation. The absence of the contribution of local government in the public services is another act that causes constraints for it in the country (Afteb, 2019). This develops a vacuum between the country's governing body and the needs of the citizens which results in the sole responsibilities of meeting the need of people on the representing government. In light of these, future research conducted on this subject needs to focus on the different aspects of the governing system in Pakistan in terms of resource and responsibility distribution. These studies also would have the prime consideration of the historical aspect of dictatorship and study the extensive details of the abuse of power under the façade of democracy. The research conducted in future also needs to consider the absence of public service responsibilities among

the local government and present solutions for the enhancement of the understanding of local issues.

References

- Abbasi, M. Z., & Mussarrat, R. (2015). Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in Pakistan During Musharraf Regime. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 35(2).
- Abbasi, M. Z., & Mussarrat, R. (2015). Devolution of Powers to Local Governments in Pakistan During Musharraf Regime. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 35(2).
- Abdullahi, M., & Chikaji, A. (2017). Local government and development: challenges and way forward. *Community Development Journal*, 14, 106-130.
- Afteb, M. (2019). Decentralisation and the Provision of Public Services: A Case Study of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.
- Ahmad, M. S., & Abu Talib, N. (2013). Local government systems and decentralisation: evidence from Pakistan's devolution plan. *Contemporary Economics*, 7(1), 33-44.
- Ahmad, M. S., & Talib, N. B. A. (2015). Empowering local communities: decentralisation, empowerment and community driven development. *Quality & Quantity*, 49(2), 827-838.
- Ahmad, R. (2010). The Endemic Crisis of Federalism in Pakistan. *Lahore Journal of Economics*, 15.
- Ahmed, M., & Baloch, A. (2015). Political Economy of Balochistan, Pakistan: A Critical Review. *European Scientific Journal*, 11(14).
- Ahmed, M., Saleem, S., & Iftikhar, I. (2012). Political system of Pakistan: Analysis of Political Structure of Local Bodies in Pakistan. *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences*, 2, 1-11.
- Akhtar, G. K. H. (2014). MANAGING LOCAL GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN. *The Government-Annual Research Journal of Political Science.*, 3(03).
- alFarid Uddin, K. (2018). Decentralisation and Governance.
- Alam, M., & Wajidi, M. A. (2013). Pakistan's Devolution of Power Plan 2001: A brief dawn for local democracy?. *Commonwealth Journal of Local Governance*, (12), 20-34.
- Ali, S. M. (2018). *Devolution of power in Pakistan*. United States Institute of Peace.
- An, Z., & Hou, Y. (2019). Centralised versus decentralised subnational debt and soft budget constraint: evidence from China. *Journal of Public Finance and Public Choice*, 34(2), 173-188.

- Arif, S., Cartier, W., Golda, A., & Nayyar-Stone, R. (2010). The local government system in Pakistan: Citizens perceptions and preferences. *The Urban Institute IDG Working Paper: Washington, DC*, 43-44.
- Aslam, G., & Yilmaz, S. (2011). Impact of decentralisation reforms in Pakistan on service delivery—An empirical study. *Public Administration and Development*, 31(3), 159-171.
- Azfar, O., Kahkonen, S., Lanyi, A., Meagher, P., & Rutherford, D. (2018). Decentralization, governance and public services: The impact of institutional arrangements. In *Devolution and development* (pp. 45-88). Routledge.
- Badshah, L., Rehman, A. U., & Muhammad, N. (2018). Political determinants of voting behaviour in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. *Liberal Arts and Social Sciences International Journal (LASSIJ)*, 2(1), 1-10.
- Batool, L. (2014). Electoral System in Local Governments: A Case Study of Pakistan. In *International Conference on Local Representation of Power in South Asia*.
- Beck, C. T. (2019). Secondary qualitative data analysis in the health and social sciences. Routledge.
- Beck, C. T. (2020). Secondary traumatic stress in maternal-newborn nurses: Secondary qualitative analysis. *Journal of the American Psychiatric Nurses Association*, 26(1), 55-64.
- Beshi, T. D., & Kaur, R. (2020). Public trust in local government: Explaining the role of good governance practices. *Public Organization Review*, 20(2), 337-350.
- Boadway, R., & Dougherty, S. (2018). Decentralisation in a globalised world: Consequences and opportunities.
- Bos, F. (2013). Economic theory and four centuries of fiscal decentralisation in the Netherlands. *OECD Journal on Budgeting*, 12(2), 9-60.
- Bush, T. (2016). School Leadership and Management in England: The Paradox of Simultaneous Centralisation and Decentralisation. *Research in Educational Administration & Leadership*, 1(1), 1-23.
- Calik, M., & Sözbilir, M. (2014). Parameters of content analysis. *EgitimveBilim*, 39(174).
- Chandio, A. R. LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN PAKISTAN: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES.

- Chaudhary, L., &Swamy, A. V. (2020). A policy of credit disruption: the Punjab Land Alienation Act of 1900. *The Economic History Review*, 73(1), 134-158.
- Cheema, A. R., Mehmood, A., & Khan, F. A. (2018). Challenges to Citizen-Driven Local Governance: Lessons from Pakistan. *unpublished paper*.
- Cole, A. (2014). Not saying, not doing: Convergences, contingencies and causal mechanisms of state reform and decentralisation in Hollande's France. *French Politics*, 12(2), 104-135.
- Dafflon, B. (2015). The assignment of functions to decentralized government: from theory to practice. In *Handbook of multilevel finance*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- De, I., & Nag, T. (2016). Dangers of decentralisation in urban slums: A comparative study of water supply and drainage service delivery in Kolkata, India. *Development Policy Review*, 34(2), 253-276.
- Devroe, E. L. K. E., &Petrov, M. A. N. O. L. (2014). Policing in Sofia. From centralisation to decentralisation. *European Journal of Policing Studies*, 2(1), 30-60.
- Dooly, M., Moore, E., & Vallejo, C. (2017). Research Ethics. *Research-publishing. net*.
- Gash, T., Randall, J., & Sims, S. (2014). Achieving political decentralisation. *Institute for Government*.
- Gavvani, V. Z., &Vahed, N. (2017). 184: Key Word Validity Ratio (KWVR); A Tool For Validity Of Keywords For Building An Accurate Literature Search Strategy. *BMJ open*, 7(Suppl 1), bmjopen-2016.
- Gelman, A. (2017). Ethics and statistics: honesty and transparency are not enough. *Chance*, 30(1), 37-39.
- Graneheim, U. H., Lindgren, B. M., &Lundman, B. (2017). Methodological challenges in qualitative content analysis: A discussion paper. *Nurse education today*, 56, 29-34.
- Gren, J. (2018). The Eurosystem and the Single Supervisory Mechanism: institutional continuity under constitutional constraints.
- Grewal, A., Kataria, H., &Dhawan, I. (2016). Literature search for research planning and identification of research problem. *Indian journal of anaesthesia*, 60(9), 635.
- Gul, Z. (2018). Democratic institutional development in the light of current chaos in Pakistan.
- Haider, M., &Badami, M. G. (2010). Urbanisation and local governance challenges in Pakistan. *Environment and urbanisation ASIA*, 1(1), 81-96.

- Halásková, M., & Halásková, R. (2014). Impacts of Decentralization on the local government Expenditures and public Services in the EU Countries. *Lex Localis*, 12(3), 623.
- Hankla, C., & Downs, W. (2010). Decentralisation, governance and the structure of local political institutions: Lessons for reform?. *Local Government Studies*, 36(6), 759-783.
- Haqqani, H., & Ahmad, T. (2018). Reimagining Pakistan. *Transforming A Dysfunctional Nuclear State*, Noida: Harper Collins Publishers India, 97-8.
- Helgesson, G., & Eriksson, S. (2015). Plagiarism in research. *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy*, 18(1), 91-101.
- Houdret, A., & Harnisch, A. (2019). Decentralisation in Morocco: a solution to the ‘Arab Spring’?. *The Journal of North African Studies*, 24(6), 935-960.
- Hussain, S., Hali, S. M., Ahmad, R., Iqbal, S., & Iftikhar, H. (2021). Fiscal decentralisation and poverty alleviation: A case study of Pakistan. *Poverty & Public Policy*.
- Iqbal, N., & Nawaz, S. (2010). Fiscal decentralisation and macroeconomic stability: Theory and evidence from Pakistan.
- Jabeen, N., Farwa, U., & Jadoon, M. (2017). Urbanisation in Pakistan: a governance perspective. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 54(1), 127-136.
- Javaid, U., & Latif, A. (2017). Historical Analysis of Successive Governments in Pakistan: A History of First Six Decades, 1947-2007. *Pakistan Vision*, 18(1).
- Judd, C. M., McClelland, G. H., & Ryan, C. S. (2011). *Data analysis: A model comparison approach*. Routledge.
- Judd, D. (2005). *The lion and the tiger: the rise and fall of the British Raj, 1600-1947*. Oxford University Press.
- Kakar, A. (2017). Local government and Pakistan's reluctant political elite. *South Asia@ LSE*.
- Kamran, T. (2016). Pakistan's first decade: democracy and constitution—a historical appraisal of centralisation. In *Constitution-making in Asia* (pp. 106-121). Routledge.
- Kaplan, S. (2013). Power and politics in Pakistan. *Expert Analysis: Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre*, April.
- Karim, A. S. (2016). Local governments under military regimes in Pakistan: a comparative analysis. *Pakistan Perspective*, 21(1).

- Karim, A. S. (2016). Local governments under military regimes in Pakistan: a comparative analysis. *Pakistan Perspective*, 21(1).
- Kersting, N., & Vetter, A. (Eds.). (2013). *Reforming local government in Europe: Closing the gap between democracy and efficiency* (Vol. 4). Springer Science & Business Media.
- Khalid, I. (2020). Politics of Federalism in Pakistan: Problems and Prospects. *South Asian Studies*, 28(1).
- Khan, A. Q. (2017). Local Government and Judiciary in Pakistan after 2010. *Pakistan Perspective*, 22(1).
- Khan, M. (2010). Ethnic federalism in Pakistan: Groups, federal structure & construction of ethno-linguistic identity. *mimeographed paper, Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS)*.
- Khan, N. (2011). DEVOLUTION AND POLITICAL ACCOUNTABILITY SOME INSIGHTS FROM PAKISTAN. *Gomal University Journal of Research*, 27(1), pp.7-90.
- Khan, N., Kundi, G. M., Shah, B., Khan, A., & Kamal, S. (2012). The prospects of new local government system: An empirical study of the local government in District Dera Ismail Khan (DIK). *Journal of Public Administration and Policy Research*, 4(2), 42-49.
- Kharl, S. H., Abbass, K., & Oghai, N. (2018). Governance decentralisation in Pakistan: An analysis of district council and its power. *International Journal of Latest Research in Humanities and Social Science (IJLRHSS)*, 1(5), 56-60.
- Khayam, M. U., & Ahmad, I. (2020). Decentralisation of Environment in Pakistan: Issues in Governance. *Policy Perspectives*, 17(2), 101-116.
- Kigume, R., Maluka, S., & Kamuzora, P. (2018). Decentralisation and health services delivery in Tanzania: Analysis of decision space in planning, allocation, and use of financial resources. *The International journal of health planning and management*, 33(2), e621-e635.
- Kloda, L. A., Boruff, J. T., & Cavalcante, A. S. (2020). A comparison of patient, intervention, comparison, outcome (PICO) to a new, alternative clinical question framework for search skills, search results, and self-efficacy: a randomized controlled trial. *Journal of the Medical Library Association: JMLA*, 108(2), 185.

- Kummer, S., Walter, F. M., Chilcot, J., Emery, J., Sutton, S., & Scott, S. E. (2019). Do cognitive heuristics underpin symptom appraisal for symptoms of cancer?: A secondary qualitative analysis across seven cancers. *Psycho-oncology*, 28(5), 1041-1047.
- Lalzaman, D., Naz, A., Khan, N., Khan, W., & Nasar Khan, S. (2017). Understanding Problems Faced by Local Body Elected Members in District Dir Lower Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Pakistan. *J. Soc. Sci*, 3(3), 1-8.
- Long, R. D. (2015). *A history of Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.
- Makhdoom, T. (2015). Shufa: A Dead Law Walking. Available at SSRN 2699068.
- Malik, A. (2010). *Political survival in Pakistan: Beyond ideology*. Routledge.
- Malik, M., & Rana, A. (2019). The History of Local Governance in Pakistan: What Lessons to Learn?.
- Masud, M. H., Ahmmed, H. U., Choudhury, A. H., & Mostafa, M. R. (2013). Pakistan: On the Way to be Failed State?. *Mediterranean Journal of Social sciences*, 4(1), 63-63.
- Mbate, M. (2017). Decentralisation, Governance and Accountability: Theory and Evidence. *Journal of African Democracy and Development*, 1(2), 1-16.
- Memon, A. P., Memon, K. S., Shaikh, S., & Memon, F. (2011). Political Instability: A case study of Pakistan. *Journal of Political Studies*, 18(1), 31-43.
- Misra, S. N. (2013). Democracy, Development and Decentralisation: Rural Development Through Institutional Intervention. *Odisha Review*, 126.
- Møller, J., & Skedsmo, G. (2013). Norway: Centralisation and decentralisation as twin reform strategies. In *Transnational influences on values and practices in Nordic educational leadership* (pp. 61-72). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Muhula, R. (2019). *Pakistan at 100: Governance and Institutions*. World Bank.
- Musarrat, R. (2021). Basic Democracy System and Role of Bureaucracy in Islamic Republic of Pakistan.
- Mushtaq, A. Q., Ibrahim, M. U. H. A. M. M. A. D., & Kaleem, M. U. H. A. M. M. A. D. (2013). Dynastic politics in Pakistan. *International Journal of History and Research (IJHR)*, 3(4), 1-12.

- Myerson, R. (2014). Constitutional structures for a strong democracy: considerations on the government of Pakistan. *World Development*, 53, 46-54.
- Nadeem, M. (2016). Analysing good governance and decentralisation in developing countries. *Journal of Political Sciences and Public Affairs*, 4(3), 209-220.
- Neri, S. (2019). Economic crisis, decentralisation and health inequalities: the case of Italy. *Universal Health Coverage*, 103.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2017). *The content analysis guidebook*. sage.
- Nishtar, S., Boerma, T., Amjad, S., Alam, A. Y., Khalid, F., ulHaq, I., & Mirza, Y. A. (2013). Pakistan's health system: performance and prospects after the 18th Constitutional Amendment. *The Lancet*, 381(9884), 2193-2206.
- Olteanu, A., Castillo, C., Diaz, F., & Kıcıman, E. (2019). Social data: Biases, methodological pitfalls, and ethical boundaries. *Frontiers in Big Data*, 2, 13.
- Olum, Y. (2014). Decentralisation in developing countries: preconditions for successful implementation. *Commonwealth Journal of Local Governance*, (15), 23-38.
- Osborne, S. (2015). Learning from Anangu histories: Population centralisation and decentralisation influences and the provision of schooling in tri-state remote communities. *The Australian Journal of Indigenous Education*, 44(2), 127-138.
- Ott, R. L., & Longnecker, M. T. (2015). *An introduction to statistical methods and data analysis*. Cengage Learning.
- Pakistan. (2018). THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT SYSTEM IN PAKISTAN. [Online]. Accessed from <http://www.clgf.org.uk/default/assets/File/Country_profiles/Pakistan.pdf> [9 August 2021]
- Pius Kulipossa, F. (2004). Decentralisation and democracy in developing countries: an overview. *Development in practice*, 14(6), pp.768-779.
- Prior, L. (2014). Content analysis. *The Oxford handbook of qualitative research*, 359-379.
- Qasmi, A. U. (2010). God's Kingdom on Earth? Politics of Islam in Pakistan, 1947–1969. *Modern Asian Studies*, 44(6), 1197-1253.
- Quezada, G., Walton, A., & Sharma, A. (2016). Risks and tensions in water industry innovation: Understanding adoption of decentralised water systems from a socio-technical transitions perspective. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 113, 263-273.

- Qureshi, A. S. (2020). Groundwater governance in Pakistan: From colossal development to neglected management. *Water*, 12(11), 3017.
- Rana, M. A. (2020). Decentralization Experience in Pakistan: The 18th Constitutional Amendment. *Asian Journal of Management Cases*, 17(1), 61-84.
- Rezaee, A., Hasanain, A., & Khan, Y. (2015). Crowdsourcing government accountability: Experimental evidence from Pakistan. *Unpublished manuscript*.
- Rid, S. A., & Murtaza, N. (2019). The Local Government System In Sindh: A Critical Analysis Of The Sindh Local Government Act 2013. *The Government-Annual Research Journal of Political Science.*, 7(7).
- Rivera, H., & Vásquez-Velásquez, A. I. (2015). In-house plagiarism and editorial unaccountability. *Journal of bioethical inquiry*, 12(1), 21-23.
- Rodríguez, V. E. (2018). *Decentralization in Mexico: From reforma municipal to solidaridad to nuevofederalismo*. Routledge.
- Ruggiano, N., & Perry, T. E. (2019). Conducting secondary analysis of qualitative data: Should we, can we, and how?. *Qualitative Social Work*, 18(1), 81-97.
- Sakamoto, S., Putalun, W., Vimolmangkang, S., Phoolcharoen, W., Shoyama, Y., Tanaka, H., & Morimoto, S. (2018). Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay for the quantitative/qualitative analysis of plant secondary metabolites. *Journal of natural medicines*, 72(1), 32-42.
- Saud, A., & Khan, K.A. (2016). Decentralisation and Local Government Structures: Key to Strengthening Democracy in Pakistan. *Journal of Political Studies*, 23(2).
- Sengupta, C., & Corbridge, S. (Eds.). (2013). *Democracy, development and decentralisation in India: continuing debates*. Routledge.
- Shah, A. (2012). The 18th constitutional amendment: glue or solvent for nation building and citizenship in Pakistan?. *The Lahore Journal of Economics*, 17, 387.
- Shah, A. (2017). Fostering fiscally responsive and accountable governance: Lessons from decentralisation. In *Evaluation & Development* (pp. 81-107). Routledge.

- Shahid, M., & Kalim, R. (2021). Empirical Implications of Decentralisation Dimensions and the Role of Political Institutions in the Economic Growth of Pakistan. *Empirical Economic Review*.
- Sherif, V. (2018, May). Evaluating preexisting qualitative research data for secondary analysis. In *Forum: qualitative social research* (Vol. 19, No. 2, pp. 26-42). Freie Universität Berlin.
- Smoke, P. (2015). Rethinking decentralization: Assessing challenges to a popular public sector reform. *Public Administration and Development*, 35(2), 97-112.
- Soomro, A. N., & Chandio, A. A. (2013). Challenges to Good Governance: A Case Study of Issues in Local Government System of Pakistan. *Journal of African & Asian Local Government Studies*, 2(4).
- Spoann, V., Fujiwara, T., Seng, B., & Lay, C. (2018). Municipal solid waste management: Constraints and opportunities to improve capacity of local government authorities of Phnom Penh Capital. *Waste Management & Research*, 36(10), 985-992.
- Ssonko, D. K. (2013). Decentralisation and Development: Can Uganda now pass the test of being a role model?. *Commonwealth journal of local governance*, (13/14), 30-45.
- Sultana, T., & Issa, M. (2021). Evolution, Restructuring, and Effectiveness of Belgian Local Governments: Lessons for Pakistan. *Journal of European Studies* (02589680), 37(1).
- Syed, K. H., & Khan, I. (2019). Challenges to the Electoral Politics of PPP in Sindh in 21st Century.
- Tariq, M., Malik, M. S., & Qumber, G. (2018). Prospects of Federalism in Pakistan. *Global Social Sciences Review*, 3(2), 358-370.
- Torjesen, D. O., Foss Hansen, H., Pinheiro, R., & Vrangbæk, K. (2017). The Scandinavian model in healthcare and higher education: recentralising, decentralising or both?.
- Tunio, F. H., & Nabi, A. A. (2021). Political decentralization, fiscal centralization, and its consequences in case of Pakistan. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 7(1), 1924949.
- Ullah, R. (2017). LOCAL GOVERNMENT SYSTEM IN THE FEDERALLY ADMINISTERED TRIBAL AREAS (FATA), PAKISTAN: PAST, PRESENT AND FUTURE. *Central Asia*, 80(1).
- Vall-Prat, P., & Rodon, T. (2017). Decentralisation and regional cabinet size: the Spanish case (1979–2015). *West European Politics*, 40(4), 717-740.

- Van Haelter, B., Vos, D., & Voets, J. (2021). Drivers of reform implementation in local government: a qualitative comparative analysis. *Public Money & Management*, 1-9.
- Walker, B. J., Adger, W. N., & Russel, D. (2015). Institutional barriers to climate change adaptation in decentralised governance structures: Transport planning in England. *Urban studies*, 52(12), 2250-2266.
- Waseem-LUMS, M. (2010). Federalism in Pakistan.
- Wright, V. C. (2017). Turbulent terrains: The contradictions and politics of decentralised conservation. *Conservation and Society*, 15(2), 157-167.
- Wu, H., Li, Y., Hao, Y., Ren, S., & Zhang, P. (2020). Environmental decentralization, local government competition, and regional green development: Evidence from China. *Science of The Total Environment*, 708, 135085.
- Yilmaz, S., Beris, Y., & Serrano-Berthet, R. (2010). Linking local government discretion and accountability in decentralisation. *Development policy review*, 28(3), pp.259-293.
- Zaidi, S. A., Bigdeli, M., Langlois, E. V., Riaz, A., Orr, D. W., Idrees, N., & Bump, J. B. (2019). Health systems changes after decentralisation: progress, challenges and dynamics in Pakistan. *BMJ global health*, 4(1), e001013.
- Zaidi, S. S. Z. (2019). Local Government Under Army Rule: A Comparative Analysis of Zia ulHaq and Pervez Musharraf Local Government System.
- Ziegenhain, P. (2016). Decentralisation and its impact on the democratisation process. In *Rethinking Power Relations in Indonesia* (pp. 39-52). Routledge.