Structure and Dynamics of Women Harassment at Workplace: A Case Study of Islamabad

By

Ms. Usama Waheed

PIDE2016FMPHILDS04

Supervisor

Dr. Huma Haque

Co-Supervisor

Dr. Zulfiqar Ali

Department of Development Studies

Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad

Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
P.O. Box 1091, Islamabad, Pakistan

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that this thesis entitled: *"Structure and Dynamics of Women Harassment at Workplace: A Case Study of Islamabad"* submitted by Ms. Usama Waheed is accepted in its present form by the Department of Development Studies, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad as satisfying the requirements for partial fulfillment of the degree in Master of Philosophy in Development Studies.

Supervisor:

Dr. Huma Haque
Visiting Professor
Department of Development Studies
Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
Islamabad

Co-Supervisor:

Dr. Zulfiqar Ali
Assistant Professor
Department of Development Studies
Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
Islamabad

External Examiner:

Dr. Rao Nadeem Alam
Assistant Professor
Department of Anthropology,
Quaid-i-Azam University
Islamabad

Head,
Department of Development Studies:

Dr. Zulfiqar Ali
Assistant Professor
Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
Islamabad

Date of Examination: August 27, 2019

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to my parents Mr. Waheed uz Zaman and Ms. Shabana Waheed who always believed in me. They always supported and encouraged me to fulfill my dreams. Their support during the MPhil made me to dedicate this to them.

Acknowledgement

First of all, I would like to thank Almighty for giving me all the health and strength to complete my thesis dissertation. Secondly, I would like to express more than a gesture of thanks to my respondents, who would always make this excursion and study as priority than theirs daily routine work. Thirdly, I feel privileged to have worked with my research supervisor Dr. Zulfiqar Ali Kalhoro and Co-supervisor Dr. Huma Haque. This work has completed with their guidance, and most importantly their teachings of subject and research area. Without their deadlines and regular meetings it could have made this work difficult for me to complete.

Precious acknowledgements to my all friends who helped in every way they could but two names in my friend list are very special Kanwal Bajwa and Zara Bajwa who made my life complete. Their company and support always encouraged me to do more. Special thanks to my brothers, Wassan Ali Waheed and Ahmed Ali Waheed who played a role of remedy in my stress and made me laugh throughout writing my dissertation. Last but not the least, my dear ones Medina Saeed and Harrem Saeed.

(Usama Waheed)

Abstract

This dissertation focuses on structure and dynamics of women's harassment in Ufone, Islamabad, Pakistan. The study aims to see how both genders understand female harassment, how socio-cultural and economic factors affect the incidence of harassment, and how the sociocultural ideology constructing both genders in the larger society contributes towards women's harassment at workplace. It also aims at seeing how the larger culture and organizational culture affects reporting of the incidence of female harassment. The fieldwork conducted for this research used qualitative research strategy and the data collection techniques used include observer as participant, focus group discussions, semi structured and unstructured interviews. The study found that a lot of women faced physical, psycho-emotional and verbal harassment at workplace. The socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards female harassment include misogynistic upbringing of sons, patriarchal mind-sets regarding power and authority, frustration in men e.t.c. The study also found that reporting of female harassment at workplace is based on women's confidence and boldness, and it also depends on family support. The study shows that most women do not report sexual harassment at workplace because of the fear of victim blaming and their need to keep their jobs.

Keywords: Female harassment at workplace, misogynistic culture, patriarchy, organizational harassment committees, class background

Table of Contents

List of Figure

List of Table

Chapter 1

1. Introduction

Since the last two decades, women harassment at workplace has been a major concern for the Scholars of Social Science. Every country defines women harassment in a slightly different way which means that there is no universal definition for the term. Considerable amount of scholarly work has been done on this issue globally, regionally and within Pakistan.

According to Christopher Uggen and Chika Shinohara (2009) sexual harassment in US means gendered discrimination on the spectrum of race, age, religion and national origins. They point out that in contemporary US, working women are quite aware of what constitutes women harassment and a large number of victims of harassment tend to report it. As compared to US however, in Japan the idea of women harassment is rather recent. The first case of harassment here was reported in 1992. The authors go on to point out the major differentiating factors with reference to women harassment at workplace in both countries. These factors are: age, income, work sector and motherhood. They argue that in recent times due to increased level of legal awareness among working women the proportion of women reporting workplace harassment has gone up in both countries. Building on the work of Uggen and Shinohara (2009) as presented above, McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone in their 2012 work assert that authority, gender non-conformity and sex proportion are also significant factors in terms of women becoming victims of harassment.

In South African context, scholars have argued that Sexual harassment includes physical behavior such as rape, inappropriate touching and sexual attacks. Sexual harassment also includes verbally abusive conduct to include dirty jokes, sex related videos and unwanted talk about life and sex. It is pointed out that also included in sexual harassment are inappropriate non-verbal behavioral patterns like whistling and display of unwelcome gestures etc. (Chicktay, 2010). James E. Gruber (1998) sees women harassment at workplace in the context of Canada where he explains that the extent of women contact with men is a key predictor of incidence of harassment. While addressing harassment he discusses different types of harassment to include, sexual comments, sexually derogatory remarks and circulation of sexually inappropriate

materials. Male predominance is a significant predictor of physical threats and sexual materials. Predominantly male environments are more physically hostile and intimidating than other work environments. Women are more apt to be stalked, touched or grabbed. Second, men are more apt to physically mark their work environments with sexually objectifying material. On the other hand, informational methods are less successful than proactive methods in reducing incidents of sexual harassment. The author argues that proactive strategies include requiring employees to attend training sessions and creation or enlargement of existing positions within the organization to handle harassment complaints. According to the study, women in workplaces with proactive strategies were less likely to be the targets of offensive sexual comments or questions and to be physically threatened. Lyn Quine (2002) asserts that contemporary literature identifies workplace bullying as a major occupational stress or among health professionals in United Kingdom. It is argued that medical students suffer extremely high levels of mistreatment or bullying during training, which increase with progression through medical school, spilling over into the early professional years. 37% of junior doctors reported being bullied and 84% had experienced at least one bullying behavior. Black and Asian doctors were more likely to be bullied than other doctors. The study shows a pattern of discrimination at all levels in the medical profession from application to medical school, job application, and the distribution of awards to consultants.

Moving on to South Asia, scholars have pointed out that there is a wide range of female workplace harassment in this geographical area too. Paramita Chaudhuri (2008) has argued that even when there are laws against harassment, most of the organizations in India do not have a complaints committees that are supposed to address the cases of harassment and that is why the application of Vishaka[1] guidelines remains limited. Paramita Chaudhuri (2007) explains that Supreme Court of India in 1997 recognized sexual harassment in the workplace as a violation of human rights. To understand women's experiences of sexual harassment in the health sector, an exploratory study was conducted in 2005–2006 among 135 women health workers, including nurses, administrative, doctors, health care attendants and other non-medical staff working in 2 private and 2 government hospitals in Kolkata, West Bengal, India. Four types of experiences of harassment were reported by 77 women who experienced 128 cases of female harassment: 27 women experienced unwanted touch, 45 women experienced psychological harassment, 41

---

[1] Vishaka judgment is compulsory to be implemented in the workplace in India to deal with harassment. It consists of series of guidelines or rules.

women experienced verbal harassment and 15 women experienced sexual gestures. None of the women reported rape or forced sex but a number of them knew of other women health workers who had experienced these. The women who experienced harassment were hesitant to complain, because of fear of losing their jobs or being stigmatized, and most of women were not aware of proper channels for redress.

Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis (2013)'s work in Bangladesh argues that in this country adolescent girls face sexual harassment named as "eve teasing" in the public places. Despite taboos and strict norms regarding female modesty and gender segregation it is normal for boys to harass girls as they gain pleasure from it and it shows their masculinity. The authors point out that in the context of Bangladesh girls do not say anything against harassment because they are afraid of losing their honor and that of their families, they are also afraid that people will blame them for provoking the boys. Young people get information about sex through videos and magazines etc. (Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis, 2013).

Shamelka A. Perera and Shashini Abeysinghe in their (2017) work point out that sexual harassment is increasingly becoming an issue in the Sri Lankan society with females facing a lot of harassment in public transport, workplaces, on the streets etc. The target group included 50 working women, male legal officer working for the Employers' Federation of Ceylon and male police officer. Authors found out that sexual harassment at workplace is extremely stressful for victims and sometimes permanently upset their psychological and mental well-being. It creates hostile work environment for employees which produces loss of productivity and worker inefficiency. The authors argue that because of the lack of general understanding and legal awareness of the offence among working women the victims do not pursue their claims.

There also is considerable amount of research conducted on this issue in Pakistan. For example, Gadit and Mugford (2008) point out that there is a massive amount of female harassment and bullying in Pakistani workplaces particularly among psychiatrists. Many psychiatrists as per these scholars were subjected to personal work and verbal abuse in which senior psychiatrists ask their juniors to do some personal favors. Most of the victims do not report such incidents because of the nature of the society and cultural norms of the region (A A M Gadit and G Mugford, 2008). Ali and Kramer (2014) in their work argue that despite having formal policies against sexual harassment in the country, cultural factors influence the policy implementations. Females tend to hide their experience of harassment due to socio-cultural concepts like shame, inhibition

and female modesty. They do not discuss the issue with their family due to the fear that they will be accused of violating the religious or local norms of modesty. When some of the women dare to report harassment they do not get any supportive response from the authorities to be and no appropriate action is taken against the offender (Ali and Kramar, 2014).

Munir Moosa Sadruddin in his (2013) work has focused on studying female harassment in private and public institutions in Karachi. He points out that female harassment in these institutes is the reflection of gender biasness and racial discrimination. He further argues that it is observed harassment upsets and mentally assaults individuals and causes psycho-somatic disorders. His respondents were of the view that harassment is purposeful and it is in the form of mental and sexual abuse. Gestures and use of unethical words are frequently used at these workplaces and thus harassment is promoted. It is pointed out that sexual harassment is normally practiced by seniors or bosses. Bosses or senior management staff indulges harassing behavior by threatening and offering higher positions to female colleagues. It was reported by his respondents that most of the women don't discuss this issue with others, particularly with the head of organization due to the societal pressure, fear of insult, powerful position of the harassers and personal and job security. The author asserts that although his female respondents were uncomfortable about harassment that they had to face at workplace but they were not aware of Bills or Laws addressing this issue. When the respondents were asked whether they knew about the Women's Right Bill, only 4 respondents knew about it, this shows that although the bill has been passed but most women are not aware of it. Due to this unawareness many harassed women don't take any step against those who harassed them.

Nighat Yasmin and Sadia Jabeen (2017) conducted a research to examine the psychological effects of harassment on working women in private as well as public sectors organizations in Lahore. They also studied the coping strategies adopted by the harassed women in their locales. The authors point out that over the last decade the number of working women has increased and their vulnerability to female harassment at workplace has also increased around the globe. Their research shows that there is more harassment in private sector as compared to the public sector. The major factors responsible for this difference could be job security in government sector. They point out that in government sector, people stay at one place for a long time and do not want to earn disrespect as they have to work with the same people. Owing to this fact, they try to keep themselves away from acts of harassing women. In private sector, people join and leave job

more frequently. They can indulge in harassing behavior before leaving job since they know that they are leaving the job soon and the organization will not do anything against them. The authors also argues that no anti-harassment laws exist in private sector thus the incidence of harassment is higher in the same. The study found out that in private sector, majority of the harassed women were anxious and depressed on a severe level while this experience was moderate in public sector.

1.1 Statement of the Problem

Broad area of my research is women harassment at workplace where age, income, education, status of women effects the harassment. I am arguing that women in higher positions, those who possess more power and are aggressive and confident report harassment. I further argue mostly women do not claim or report harassment because of the culture, strict norms and the fear of losing their jobs, respect and modesty. Instead of having policies and laws related to harassment there are obstacles in the implementation process.

Given my broader area of interest I have narrowed down my broader area into the research problem that is **Structure and Dynamics of Women Harassment at Workplace: A Case study of Islamabad** and I saw this problem in organization namely; Ufone. I have chosen this organization because I have connections there and harassment committee is working there.

I have operationalized my research problem into following research questions:

1.2 Research Questions

1. What is the structural division of labour and demographic profile of the organization?
2. What are socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards women harassment at workplace?
3. How do people (both genders) conceptualize harassment at workplace and what are ideological structures that lead to the incidence of women harassment in my research locale?
4. What are the procedural structures and contextual realities that contribute towards a victim to report or not to report the incidence of harassment in the selected organization?

1.3 Objectives

1. To see the oregano-gram of the organization and gendered division of labour within the organization and terms of reference for every position.

2. To understand the socio-cultural and economic factors of the larger culture from where the workers come as well as the same at the workplaces being investigated.

3. To study the perception of men and women in the organizational settings being researched around the issue of harassment.

4. To study, understand and document the mechanisms of addressing workplace harassment in my locales and to find out elements in the larger culture as well as in the organizational culture that lead toward women harassment.

1.4 Key Terms

1. Structural division of labour

The term Structural division of labor has been defined in different ways as Business Dictionary defines it as "A type of organizational configuration that groups together those employees who are responsible for a particular product type or market service according to workflow. The divisional structure of a business tends to increase flexibility, and it can also be broken down further into product, market and geographic structures". The term is also defined by Encyclopedia of Britannica as "the separation of a work process into a number of tasks, with each task performed by a separate person or group of persons. Breaking down the work into simple repetitive tasks eliminates unnecessary motion and limits handling of tools and parts".

I merged the definition given by Business dictionary and Encyclopedia of Britannica in this way this helped me to see how and on what basis work is assigned differently to men and women in the organization. I have used these two definitions as it is more comprehensive.

2. Gendered division of labour

I have reviewed 3 definitions to start with O. Ejderyan, R. Tuor says the term "division of labor" is defined as the work which is divided between women and men based on gender roles (ILO report, 2008). Chafetz defines it as, "undergirding all systems of gender stratification is a gender-based division of labor, by which women are chiefly responsible for different tasks than are men" (Cohen, 2004, p. 239-252). Elgarte (2008) uses the definition of gendered division of labor given by Okin (1989), Bubeck (1995) and Fraser (1996) where they talked about gendered division as "prescribing a specialization in paid productive work for men and unpaid reproductive work for women – has been regarded by a number of feminist scholars as the primary cause of women's social and economic inequality" (Elgarte, 2008, p. 2).

I merged the definitions of gendered division given by that of O. Ejderyan, R. Tuor and Chafetz where I saw how work is divided between men and women in the organization according to their gender. I have used this definition in my current work as it is precise and complete.

3. Socio-cultural factors

The idea of the term in Business dictionary states as "set of beliefs, customs, practices and behavior that exists within a population". Cambridge dictionary defines it as factors "related to the different groups of people in society, their habits, traditions and beliefs". Gonzalez (2001)'s conceptualization of socio-cultural factors is that as "Socio-cultural factors usually exert their influence within a family structure. Examples of socio-cultural factors are belief and value system, attitudes, acculturation levels, socialization goals and practices, language use at home, etc." (Razmjoo and Movahed, 2009, p. 61).

I have used the definition of Gonzalez (2001) for explaining how socio-cultural norms and patterns affect harassment, what is in their socialization or how they socialize or what they learn from culture that contribute to do harassment. I have used this definition because it has covered all the dimensions related to my research.

4. Economic factors in a society

According to Investopedia economic factors influence "how a particular group, or socioeconomic class, behaves within society including their actions as consumers". Encyclopedia of Britannia defines that "economic sociology describes the relationships between economic activity, the rest of society, and changes in the institutions that contextualize and condition economic activity. Economic sociologists do focus on individuals; it is generally to examine the ways in which their interests, beliefs, and motivations to act are mutually constituted through the interactions between them. It allows economic sociologists to consider power, culture, organizations and institutions as being central to an economy".

I have used the definition of Encyclopedia of Britannia because it is explained well, and I have used this in my current research to understand how economic factors influence harassment at workplace.

5. Ideological structure

The concept of Ideology is defined in Oxford Dictionary as "a system of ideas and ideals, especially one which forms the basis of economic or political theory and policy". Ted (1995) defines the term as "a collection of normative beliefs and values that an individual or group holds for other than purely epistemic reasons". Loewenstein (1953) defines the term as "a consistent integrated pattern of thoughts and beliefs explaining man's attitude towards life and his existence in society, and advocating a conduct and action pattern responsive to and commensurate with such thoughts and beliefs" (Gerring, 1997).

I merged the definition of Ted and Loewenstein in my current study to see people's ideas, thoughts and beliefs used to harass women at workplace and to understand the perceptions in their mind for harassing them at workplace. I have used this definition because it is more widely explanatory and multidimensional than others.

6. Procedural structure of organization

KU (University of Kansas) center for community health and development in collaboration with the World Health Organization defines this term as an exercise that "a process of establishing and arranging clear ways to work together and get things done. When groups engage then they take steps to (a) organize the effort (i.e., form a structure, determine clear roles and responsibilities, levels of authority) and (b) Support the members (i.e., establish protocols for decision-making and conflict resolution, create a communication plan)". Hold and Antony (1991) define it as "Structure is not a coordination mechanism and it affects all organizational process. Organizational structure refers to the models of internal relations of organization, power and relations and reporting, formal communication channels, responsibility and decision-making delegation is clarified" (Ahmadya, Mehrpourb, and Nikooraavesh, 2016, p. 456).

I have used the definition of KU (University of Kansas) center to see how procedural authority or organization deals with the incidence and reporting of women harassment. I have used this definition because it is better explained than other definitions.

7. Contextual realities

Berger (1967) defines the term as "it is distinct from biological reality or individual cognitive reality, representing as it does a phenomenological level created through social interaction and thereby transcending individual motives and actions". American Association for Marital and Family Therapy (2004) defines the term as it "recognize contextual and systemic dynamics (e.g.

gender, age, socioeconomic status, culture∕ race∕ ethnicity, sexual orientation, spirituality, religion, larger systems, and social context" (cited in Esmiol, Knudson-Martin, and Delgado, 2012, p. 573).

I have used the definition of American Association for Marital and Family Therapy to understand the contextual realities of men and women of the selected organizations to find out as to which culture and ethnicity they came from and also to see the contextual realities of the selected organizations that how it affects the women harassment. I have used this definition as it looks into all dimensions of contextual realities including spirituality, religion and social context.

Chapter 2

Methods and Methodology

Kothari (2004) defines research methodology as method of solving research problem thoroughly. According to Rajasekar, Philominathan and Chinnathambi (2006) research methodology is "Essentially, the procedures by which researchers go about their work of describing, explaining and predicting phenomena are called research methodology. It is also defined as the study of methods by which knowledge is gained. Its aim is to give the work plan of research" (Rajasekar, Philominathan and Chinnathambi, 2006, p. 5). Research methods refer to all those procedures and methods that are used by the researcher to accumulate data appropriate to his/her study. Methods are defined as procedures employed by a researcher to gather data (Bryman, 2015). Methodology thus is the basis of the research design used by a researcher in the research project. The research design employed in the current research is combination of descriptive and explanatory research designs.

2.1 Research Strategy

There are two different research strategies namely quantitative and qualitative. While discussing quantitative research strategy Kothari (2004) suggests method used in this strategy can be divided into three groups. The first group includes methods that are used to collect primary data from the field. The second group includes statistical techniques that are used for establishing relationships between various indicators and/all various pieces of data and the unknowns. The third group includes methods through which the accuracy of the obtained results is evaluated (Kothari, 2004).

According to Denzin and Lincoln (2008) qualitative researchers deal with socially constructed reality and they also unearth the way in which social experiences are created and given meaning. Contrary to the quantitative research methods which represent the world numerically, the way of qualitative research strategy is to represents the world in a narrative form (Heppner et al., 1999). I have used Qualitative Research Strategy for the current research.

2.2 Research Design

Majumdar (2005) defines research design as a framework that allows the researcher to "answer two basic questions (a) does the research provides answers to the basic research objectives and

(b) if yes how well it does so" (Majumdar, 2005, p. 119). He asserts that for answering these questions, researchers must be sure about the strategy and planning that he is going to use. In qualitative research four major types of research design can be used namely descriptive research design, exploratory research design, explanatory research design and experimental research design.

For my research, given my research questions I have used the descriptive research design. Majumdar defines the descriptive research design as a design that "enables the researcher to obtain precise and accurate description of the characteristic of the phenomena or a particular social group being study to determine the frequency with which some events and characteristics occur in the population or sample of the study and the associations that exist among them. A descriptive research design also allows investigation of some social and psychological aspect of group and people of community" (Majumdar, 2005, p. 114). I have used descriptive research design for my research because it helped me to describe the relationship between harassment and proportion of men and women in the organization and its link with the authority or position. It also allowed me to describe the culture of the organization of my locale and the culture from where they come. All this can be best done through using a descriptive research design.

2.3 Units of Data Collection

Units of data collection (UDC) can be objects, entities, individuals, groups or processes that are explored by the researcher to obtain data relevant to his/her research questions. For the current study I have used following units of data collection:

> UDC 1: Sampled women were selected along the axis of pay scale or position as it provided me the information of women experiences about harassment and how they are discriminated due to their gender.
>
> UDC 2: Members of harassment committee in the organization were selected as they provided information about reporting and procedures to deal with the issue of harassment and how does the culture of the organization contribute towards a victim to report or not to report harassment.
>
> UDC 3: Sampled men were selected along the axis of pay scale or position. The reason for selecting this UDC was that it gave information that why men harass

women, what is the perception and ideology, behind their actions and how society and culture influence them to do harassment.

UDC 4: Secretary in the office of Women Ombudsperson[2] Islamabad was selected as he has the information about the cases of harassment which were reported. Moreover, it has helped me to get the required relevant information.

2.4 Methods

Given the research strategy I have used, following methods were employed in my research.

2.4.1Rapport Building

Qualitative research aims at gaining an in-depth understanding of various dimensions of the phenomenon being study, and for in-depth understanding researcher has to go to field and create a relationship of trust and confidence with the people living there. Rapport building enables the researcher to get accepted by the community as one of them, that is why it is an essential part of qualitative research. While building rapport the researcher explains the project to the community members and answers all their queries about the same in a fashion that is culturally appropriate and acceptable. I have used this technique in the initial phases of my research for UDC1 through UDC4 because without rapport building it was impossible to get all the information from any of these UDCs.

2.4.2. Interviews

Interview is a recognized method of qualitative research as well as quantitative research. Interviews are widely used to access people's experiences, their inner perceptions and conception of reality. Interviews can be divided into three categories: structured interviews, semi-structured interviews, and unstructured interviews (Fontana and Frey, 2005). Given my research questions I have used unstructured interviews, semi-structured interviews, and focus group discussion.

2.4.2.1 Unstructured Interviews

According to Bernard "unstructured interviews are based on a clear plan that the researcher keeps constantly in mind. These interviews, however, are characterized by a minimum of control over the informants' responses. The idea is to get people to open up and let them express

---

[2] It is an office which deals with the issue of harassment complaints.

themselves in their own terms and at their own pace" (Bernard,1994, p. 209). I have used unstructured interviews at the stage of rapport building and continue to use this method throughout my fieldwork with all UDCs. This method helped me to get information from the women about their experience of harassment and its effect on their personal and professional lives and to ask men about their perception of harassment.

2.4.2.2 Semi-Structured Interview

Harrell and Bradley (2009) define semi-structured interview as a flexible form of interview. It is also referred to an interview guide. Interview guides are used to collect in-depth qualitative data as they are comprised of very broadly worded questions. A semi-structured interview involves formulating an interview guide which is divided into several segments according to the issues on which data is required. For each segment the researcher formulates 2 or 3 very broadly framed questions. Out of each question there arise numerous other questions based on the answers of the respondents. Numerous questions arise within each broad question. Researcher does extensive probing for each broad question. It allows the researcher to obtain in-depth information about the major areas of interest that he has, while leaving the ownership of the interview in the hands of the interviewee. I have used semi-structured interviews with UDC 1 and UDC 3.

2.4.2.3 Focus Group Discussion

The focus group discussion is an interview where the researcher learns through conscious, unconscious psychological, semi-conscious and socio-cultural characteristics and processes of the group members or various groups (Basch, 1987). The researcher is meant to learn about biographies and life of the particular group. They intend to be more specific being guided or unguided in structure (Edmunds, 1999). One Focus group discussion has been done with the members of harassment committee. So, I have used this method for UDC 2.

2.4.3 Observer as Participant

Observer as participant is a technique which enables the researcher to go into the community where he does not live but spent extended time. The researcher does not become a part of the community as well as the community does not consider him/her as their part or member. The researcher participates in selected or few activities of community, not in all activities. He / she try to observe each and everything of the community in detail which help him / her to analyze and understand the situation of the community. This technique has used throughout my

fieldwork. It allowed me to gain an in-depth insight into the situation of women who are victims of harassment and how their lives and jobs are affected and what are their views about the functioning of the committee.

2.5 Sampling

"In qualitative research the issue of sampling has little significance as the main aim of most qualitative inquiries is either to explore or describe the diversity in a situation, phenomenon or issue. Qualitative research does not make an attempt to either quantify or determine the extent of this diversity. You can select even one individual as your sample and describe whatever the aim of your inquiry is" (Kumar, 2005, p. 165). The size of qualitative research samples are determined by the response rate. If response rate is large, the sample usually is small and vice versa (Sarantakos, 2012). In the current research I have used purposive sampling method for all UDCs except UDC1 and UDC 3. With UDC 1 and 3 I have done stratified random sampling.

2.5.1 Stratified Random Sampling

It is a probability sampling method defined by Sarantakos (2005) as a method "in which the target population is divided into a number of strata, and a sample is drawn from each stratum. The resulting sub-samples make up the final sample of the study. The strength of this procedure is that it allows all population groups to be-represented in the final sample" (Sarantakos, 2005, p. 158).

I have used this sampling method with UDC 1 and UDC 3. This method utilized while administering semi-structured interview. While apply it on UDC 1 and 3 I have stratified women and men in my research locales with respect to their official positions or pay scales. After women and men were stratified I have selected 15 women and 8 men.

2.5.2 Purposive Sampling

"Purposive or judgmental sampling enables you to use judgment to select cases that will best enable you to answer your research question/s and to meet your objective. This form of sampling is often used when working with small sample and when you wish to select cases that are particularly informative" (Neuman 2005 cited in Saunders et al, 2009, p. 238).
I have used purposive sampling with all of these UDC 2 and UDC 4. I have decided to use purposive sampling with all UDCs because qualitative research requires small samples and

purposive sampling is best for that. It is also appropriate because it allows the investigator to choose people from each UDC in accordance with their area of specialization and their expertise in the particular field.

2.6 Case Study Method:

According to Tellis (1997) "Through case study method, a researcher is able to go beyond the quantitative statistical results and understand the behavioral conditions through the actor's perspective. Case study helps explain both the process and outcome of a phenomenon through complete observation, reconstruction and analysis of the cases under investigation" (Zainal, 2007, p. 1). Yin (1984:23) defines case study research method "as an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and in which multiple sources of evidence are used" (Zainal, 2007, p. 2). I have used this method to understand the details of the phenomena of harassment at workplace. The use of this method allowed me to collect four in-depth case studies about harassed women from various private organization, semi government and government organizations. These 4 case studies are presented in narrative form in chapter 6.

2.7 Locale

For UDC 1, 2 and 3 my locale was Ufone located at Block J, 92 Nazim-ud-din Rd, F-7/1 Blue area, Islamabad. The members of harassment committee in the organization were interviewed in their office spaces in Ufone. There are two towers known as Ufone Tower and Islamabad Stock Exchange Tower at Jinnah Avenue, Blue Area of Islamabad. Ufone tower was my locale. Ufone tower was built in 2010 at the main avenue in the Blue area, Islamabad. In Ufone tower restaurant and gym is also there. Ufone Tower is 371 feet in height. It has a covered area of 597318 square feet. In Ufone, there are 20 female employees and 260 male employees approximately. Total floors are 28. Ufone has ground floor, 10th to 19th floor whereas 1st to 9th and 20th to 24th floors are of tenants. Other than Ufone, there are 8 to 9 offices/tenants in the building.

Pak Telecom Mobile Limited (PTML) is a wholly owned subsidiary of Pakistan Telecommunication Company Limited (PTCL) that started its operations in January 2001 under the brand name Ufone. As a result of PTCL's privatization, in 2006 Ufone became a part of the Emirates Telecommunication Corporation Group (Etisalat). PTCL and Ufone is the property of

Etisalat. Ufone is the subsidiary of PTCL and PTCL is owned by Etisalat by ownership shares only whereas Government has some share in it, but Government has no right of ownership, management and decision-making. Ufone ownership is of Etisalat. Organizational level decisions of Ufone are taken by CEO but decisions of PTCL are taken after the mutual discussion or consultation with Etisalat. Board of Director (BOD) of PTCL, Ufone and Etisalat is the same. Decisions of BOD level are taken by Etisalat. So, the property is of Etisalat. There are roaming partners of Ufone in almost every country. Towers and offices are not there in other countries rather we do networking partnership with roaming partners. Ufone has network coverage in 10,000 locations and across all major highways of Pakistan. Ufone currently provides international Roaming to more than 288 live operators in more than 160 countries. This building of Ufone is in the name of Pakistan Telecommunication Enterprise Towers (PTET) and the offices in the building pay rent to PTET. This is hidden, where this income from rent goes whether in the income of Government or to Etisalat. There is no addition in the income of Ufone from these rented offices. Ufone did not pay rent but that is settled in Etisalat book.

The registrar/secretary of the Federal Ombudsman Secretariat for protection against harassment of women at workplace was interviewed in his office located at 14-M, Ali Plaza, First Floor, Behind Total Parco Petrol Station, Next to Wi-tribe Head Office, F-8 Markaz, Islamabad. The Secretary has to be interview because the Ombudsperson was not available due to her official commitments. The chair person is Ms. Kashmala Tariq.

Chapter 3

Review of Literature

3.1 Literature reviewed

Keeping in view my research problem and operationalization of the same, for the current study I have studied 22 pieces of scholarly work. I have reviewed literature in four domains namely a) sexual harassment and women's experiences of the same b) theories of gender and women empowerment c) power and hegemony and d) legal protection of women and policy challenges.

In the first domain, I have reviewed the work produced by McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone (2012), Chaudhuri (2008), Jones (2016), Gadit and Mugford (2007), Uggen and Shinohara (2009), Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis (2013), Ali and Kramar (2014). The literature in this domain discusses the **sexual harassment as phenomena and women's experiences of the same in various countries around the globe.**

In the second domain i.e. **theories of gender and women empowerment** I reviewed Ingraham (1994), Kabeer (2005), Diebolt and Perrin (2013), Agassiin (1989), Chaudhry, Nosheen and Lodhi (2012), Balme and Bulbeck (2008), Bergvall (1999), Donno and Russett (2004). This domain is about conceptualization gender as social construct and includes many articles on different strategies on women empowerment.

In this third domain of **power and hegemony** the work of Dahl (1957), Stoddart (2007), and Walther (2014) has been reviewed. The literature in this domain deals with differential ways that scholar have reviewed by looking at Gramsci concept of hegemony and rule of consent.

I have studied the work produced by Musarrat and co-author Noreen (2013), Critelli (2012), Chicktay (2010) and Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010 given by Government of Pakistan to see **legal protection of women and policy challenges**. The

literature in this domain discusses different laws for women harassment at workplace as well as policy challenges of the same over time and space.

The first domain, namely, **sexual harassment and experiences** covers and discusses the concept and perception of sexual harassment in social science scholarship, experiences, reporting and various factors including norms and socio-cultural factors. Heather McLaughlin, Christopher Uggen and Amy Blackstone (2012) define the idea as to how and why supervisory authority, gender nonconformity and workplace sex proportion affect harassment. They point out that workplace power structure and location of gender within it plays a significant role with reference to women facing harassment the authors argue that women in supervisory positions within organizational structure experience more sexual harassment than those on the lower rungs. This is so because it is difficult for patriarchal forces to accept women in powerful places. They further argue that women working in more male oriented settings mostly reported their experience of sexual harassment then those who work in gender balance setting or environment. Women supervisors who work in male dominated industry are mostly the target of harassment. They put forth the idea that woman's harassment is not a universal experience; rather everyone has her own experiential reality. Heather McLaughlin, Christopher Uggen and Amy Blackstone (2012) cited the work of Eisenberg (2001) and Quinn (2002) where they argue that most of the time men harass women to keep them in their place. Women who are in managing positions supervise sub ordinates, so they get targeted more as their position is powerful and difficult to handle by men. Along with these, another factor which plays vital role is gender non-conformity on part of women workers. The author's stance is that "feminine" women are less likely to face harassment but women displaying authoritative gestures or expressing strong opinions irritate men in their context and thus are more harassed. The women who are dominant, aggressive and independent eventually face more harassment than those who are more feminine. If men behave opposite to what is culturally set for them so they become the target of harassers. Men are reluctant to report themselves as feminine. These scholars have also identified different kind of harassing behavior e.g. touching, offensive and gender intensive behavior, teasing and staring at workplace experienced by victims. Contrary to this Rochelle Jones (2016) talk about the effects of harassment on women who experience it. He argues women face, experience and perceive more harassment than men and it has a negative impact on their professional career as well as on their confidence level. He presents five different levels of woman's harassment and these are the

18

levels are not discussed by the author above. These harassment levels are a) generalized sexist remarks and behavior b) threats to engage in sexual behavior c) coercive advances d) subtle bribery to engage in sexual behavior and e) inappropriate sexual advances. Jones also gives us certain significant statistics, he points out that women were more likely than men to report sexual harassment 30% against 4%. Among women reporting harassment, 40% of women illustrate more severe forms like 41% of them asserts unwanted sexual advances, 9% illustrate coercive advance, 59% notice a negative effect on their confidence as professionals, and 47% reported that these experiences negatively affected their career advancement.

Given the preceding discussion I am arguing that harassment occurs in almost all organization in this regard A A M Gadit and G Mugford (2007) state that although women harassment rates of seems to be higher in healthcare or medical professions and particularly reported higher among psychiatrists who deal with the human psyche in Pakistan. Majority of psychiatrists reported that spreading of rumors against them is very common in the existing medical culture; defamation and passing general uncomplimentary remarks as well as offensive remarks were reported in high frequencies. False accusations, unjustified complaints, humiliation in public and threats were reported frequently, which is similar to the current general environment in Pakistan. The authors argue that many psychiatrists report of being subjected to verbal abuse, personal work, blocking of promotion, termination and even physical attacks. They identify four categories of distress associated with bullying and harassment. Mild distress is perceived when subjects feel nervous and anxious, moderate distress is associated with disturbance in professional and personal life, whereas severe distress leads to depression and continuous anxiety. In Pakistan people are not very open about discussing the issue of harassment due to the perceived fear of victimization. Knowing the nature of society and cultural norms of the region female psychiatrists tend to hide harassment and do not repot it because of job insecurity issue and retribution from family. They do so because since there are few female psychiatrists in Pakistan they want to remain in their profession and hang to their jobs since there is more room for practice and less competition.

Christopher Uggen and Chika Shinohara (2009) compare the experience of harassment in United States with that of Japan. They argued that the emergence and consciousness of this issue arose first in US in 1964 but in Japan in 1992. They point out three periods here, from 1975 to 1987

when consciousness of sexual harassment emerged in the United States but not in Japan, a period from 1988 to 1998 when Sekuhara entered Japanese discourse, but consciousness remained higher in the United States than in Japan and the period from 1999 to the present when consciousness of sexual harassment is roughly similar in the both nations. A greater variation across occupations than across nations is seen and greater occupational variation in sexual harassment in Japan than in the United States. Clerical workers in both nations report high rates of sexual harassment. The only significant occupational difference between nations is found in service sector. Relatively younger women in Japan and relatively older women in the United States are more likely to report sexual harassment. While discussing factors like education, marriage and having children the authors argue that woman with more children reported less harassment in both countries. In the United States there is little effect of income, occupational status, and job satisfaction on sexual harassment. Contrary to the U.S. findings these are strongly predictive in Japan. Like the work of Heather McLaughlin, Christopher Uggen and Amy Blackstone (2012) also argue that authority bearing women and women supervisors report or experience more harassment, here also, in Japan Christopher Uggen and Chika Shinohara (2009) point out that income and supervisory status both increase the likelihood of experiencing sexual harassment, the age has a positive effect on sexual harassment in the United States and a negative effect in Japan. Income they say has a significantly strong and positive effect on harassment in Japan as compares to United States, and job satisfaction has a much stronger negative association with sex harassment in Japan.

The understanding, experiences and terms of harassment are different in different places like Papreen Nahar, Miranda van Reeuwijk and Ria Reis (2013) argue in Bangladesh "Eve teasing[3]" or sexual harassment are the important concerns relating to sexuality by adolescents. The author cited above is of the opinion that owing to the conservative cultural outlook in Bangladesh eve teasing has become a conduit of expression of boys controlled sexuality. They gain pleasure from it and get a chance to show their masculinity. Despite taboos, unmarried adolescents seek information about sex, erotic pleasure and romance from pornographic magazines, mobile phone clips, videos and erotic books, commonly known as choti boi. Mostly boys but also girls talk about romance and sex with their friends, older cousins and in-laws. Boys express masturbation

---

[3] A name for women harassment used in Bangladesh

as an approach of getting sexual pleasure. None of the girls admitted to this, the main reason being that they fear losing their virginity if they masturbate. Boys and girls both like to watch romantic movies and some also get engaged in romantic relationships without sexual intercourse. Some boys admit sexual activity, and some admit that they had gone to sex workers, or got involved in the act of rapes. Interviews with reproductive health care service providers confirm that non-married adolescents despite the barriers and taboos come for services i.e. abortion or contraception. Romance and pleasure is important to boys and girls to their self-esteem and to their feeling of being mature, feminine or masculine. They are afraid of stigma and punishment, especially the girls. For girls the consequences are worse, including restrictions on movement, having to leave school, being expelled from an orphanage, being forced to marry, being abused by a future husband, and hampering future marriage options. Papreen Nahar, Miranda van Reeuwijk and Ria Reis also identify that in Bangladesh gender inequality leading to sexual harassment is intensely entrenched in Bangladeshi social structure. Patriarchy, gender norms and the custom of Purdah in Bangladeshi culture result in girls being discriminated from birth and these are influencing factors for the incident of sexual harassment here.

Faiza Ali and Robin Kramar in their (2014) work discuss the issue of women harassment in the Pakistani context. They point out that despite the fact that there are laws and policies to prevent Sexual harassment, cultural factors influence policy implementation. As per the authors there are discrepancies between the traditional culture and behavior patterns in Pakistan and the sexual harassment policies in the workplace in the country. Analysis of documents on Sexual Harassment (SH) policies and practices here reveal that organizations are generally concerned about SH[4], but they lack formal policies and procedures to deal with it. The three major factors which influence SH redressal are socio-cultural factors, institutional factors and managerial expertise/bias. Most of the organizations in Lahore, the capital of Punjab, do not have explicit provisions to deal with SH. They point out that a detailed analysis of policy documents suggests that there is no explicit procedural outline regarding SH complaint and redressal systems. Here, the issue of individual bias exists which leads to negative consequences for SH and this is related to socio-cultural expectations that where good women ought to be home early before sunset. These issues exist at two levels macro-national and meso-organizational. At the macro-national level, socio-cultural and legal issues are noticeable. They point out that females tend to hide SH

---

[4] Sexual harassment

because of socio-cultural practices such as female modesty, shame, and inhibition and blame culture and society for not taking the initiative to report SH at work. When women face SH at work it is assumed that a female would refrain from discussing the issue with her family members due to the fear of being accused of violating the local or religious norms of modesty. At the meso-organizational level of analysis, the experiences of female employees are related to interactions in the workplace. The findings of policy analysis reveal that although there are general policies of SH in existence, the explicit procedures of handling SH issues are missing. When victims try to lounge to lodge a formal complaint against SH, the outcome is often disappointing as they do not get any response since the male recipients of these complaints do not take them seriously. Even in the presence of socio-cultural barriers and hostile environment, female employees sometimes do use their agency i.e. power to deal with SH. The women who take successful action against SH are more likely to face victimization in the workplace. The authors state that it is clear from female employees' experiences that some are even not aware of what exact action they should take when lodging complaints against sexual harassment. Building on the previous discussion of Faiza Ali and Robin Kramar (2014) where they point out the issues or obstacles in the implementation process of harassment laws and policies, Paramita Chaudhuri (2008) argues that complaints committees in the Indian context have not been constituted in most of the organizations and often set these up only after intervention by monitoring. That is why the implementation of the Supreme Court guidelines on sexual harassment at the workplace i.e. Vishaka guidelines remains limited. Indian Supreme Court guidelines express that complaints committee must be headed by a woman and give 50% representation for women, but appointment of women is done at positions that are quite junior in the hierarchy in many organizations and in certain organizations there are no women in senior positions and men continue to hold the position of chairpersons in many complaints committees. Meetings of these committees do not take place on regular basis. Most workplaces dismiss the need for implementation of the guidelines by saying that cases of sexual harassment cannot happen in their workplaces because employees are from good families and highly educated. Complaints committees even when constituted as stated by the guidelines remain largely nonfunctional and sexual harassment is still perceived as occurring in "other" workplaces. Chaudhuri argues that even in the presence of complaints committees, authorities deal directly with nearly half the complaints reported. The existence of such complaints committees indicates official compliance

with the Vishaka guidelines only on paper. In organizations the absence of senior women is the reasons for having male chairpersons. This issue raises concerns about the absence of women in senior positions.

The second domain, namely, **theories of gender and women empowerment,** discusses the concept of gender, linkage of gender inequality with women empowerment, Islamic point of view regarding equality, women rights and empowerment. Chrys Ingraham (1994) points out that material circumstances of patriarchal societies are more linked to institutionalize heterosexuality than they are to gender. They are only concerned to have relationship with opposite sexes which is naturally occurring, but they do not consider relationships with the same sex. She further argues that heterosexuality is not criticized as an organizing institution rather heterosexual imaginary hides the operation of heterosexuality in structuring gender. There are different views and disagreements on the concepts of gender and sex. Chrys Ingraham cited the work of Maria Mies (1986) where she states that this has created a binary of nature and culture as sex is related to the biology or nature and gender refers to culture so, it has closed the way to see as to how culture and biology are linked to each other. Ingraham points out that practice of ideology first criticized by Marx and then by Althusser in the ways that dominant class ideologies are authorized, and these ideologies had influence on various cultural narratives, institutionalized arrangements, and also on gender or heterosexual imaginary. While discussing this, Chrys Ingraham borrows the idea of Mary Maynard (1990) and Lengermann & Wallance (1985) to analyze the society and institutions of gender in a way as to see how women are socially constructed differently from men and what identifies the relations of women and men with each other. Chrys Ingraham has also reviewed the work of Reinharz (1983) where she points out that sociology and feminist theories of gender shows its conservative politics by the current values and order, not taking into consideration differential cultural, ideological and historical context over time and space. Smith is different from Reinharz in a way that she linked women to the political economic dynamics.

Jane Balme and Chilla Bulbeck (2008) have reviewed the works of several scholars that have discussed gender and sex differences. Among the reviewed scholars Edwards (1989) and Ingraham (1994) distinguished between 'sex' as the biological distinction between men and women and 'gender' as a social construction or elaboration built on differently sexed bodies.

Jane Balme and Chilla Bulbeck further point out that the very distinction between sex and gender was challenged, as early as 1975. Gayle Rubin (1975) argued that both sex and gender were socially constructed all the way through kinship systems and associated taboos which separated the sexes into two mutually exclusive social categories linked through obligatory heterosexuality. Feminist philosophers Gatens (1989) and Grosz (1987) argued men possess on the whole a greater quantity of masculinity than women and vice versa, but masculinity is rewarded when performed by male bodies and not generally when performed by female bodies. They finds out that feminism's first intervention was to add women and notice what women did and add it to the story as being just as valuable as that of men. 1970s work on gender archaeology improved the location of women in the story by making them visible and acknowledging their contribution. The authors point out that one feminist archaeological approach to the origins of the gender puzzle gives the idea of division of labor in modern hunter-gatherer societies. Both Females and males are able of hunting different sized animals as Lee and DeVore (1968) state if strength is the important basis to explain hunting done by men then it make more sense to form social categories based on strength rather than genitalia. They explain before gender is created, biological divisions that are men and women have to be recognized. Then gender is a social human construct and not a predictable biological given.

In the literature reviewed within this domain Victoria l. Bergvall (1999) studied the articulation of language with gender. The recent work on language and gender in general draws on three accounts of variation i.e. women's language is regarded as deficient when compared to men's, it fundamentally reflects men's dominance over women and it arises from difference in the socialization patterns of women and men. Victoria l. Bergvall (1999) asserts that a number of tensions rise between the study of gender differences and similarities, difference and dominance, universals and particulars. Victoria l. Bergvall cited the work of Coates (1986) where Coates states that linguists working on language and gender were reluctant to use the term "gender" because of its pre-existing linguistic use referring to morpho-syntactic gender. She point out that theorists generally use the terms male and female to describe basic biological, rather than social variation. However, the resolution of the sex/gender debate comes down to simple substitution of "gender" for "sex" as a more polite term, probably to avoid the taboo implications of sexuality. Butler (1990) states "If the immutable character of sex is contested, perhaps this construct called "sex" is as culturally constructed as gender; indeed, perhaps it was always already gender, with

the consequence that the distinction between sex and gender turns out to be no distinction at all" (Butler, 1990). Bergvall also cited the work of West (1995) where he states it wasn't that women were incapable of vital language rather men took the upper hand in conversation, enacting social dimorphism in echo of physical dimorphism. However, Feminists of the 1970s and 1980s reclaimed women's place as different but equal as linguistic participants, advancing arguments of women's superiority in specific linguistic areas or domains.

Over the centuries, inequality between men and women has existed and because of it women are vulnerable and non-empowered. Naila Kabeer (2005) explains the linkage of women empowerment with that of gender equality i.e. the third MDG[5]. She states that political participation, employment and education empower women. As long as the gender gap gets minimized in education at all stages, the contribution of wage employment for women increases in the industrial sector women will continue working on the path of empowerment. She defines women's empowerment in terms of power where she explains it in three dimensions that are agency, resources, and achievements. Agency is the process by which choices are made and converted into desired outcome. Resources are the means through which agency is implemented and resources are distributed through several institutions in a society. Achievements refer to the results of agency. Access to education brings a great progressive change in their cognitive abilities which are important for women to question, to gain access to knowledge, and to bring new thoughts that help them in their lives. Educated women know more than uneducated ones about family planning, health issues, care more about themselves and women rights. Naila Kabeer points out that change in power relationships within and outside the household is also linked with education; educated women suffer less from domestic violence. Access to paid work increases women's agency in strategic ways. Paid work shifts the balance of power within the family. Large numbers of women are getting involved in the labor market across the world. Women who were not able to help their parents after getting married now insist on their right to do so as they have equal power of decision making in the family. Improvement in gender equality and women's empowerment is also related to the number of seats held by women in national parliaments. Women are clearly entitled to have at least half of the seats in parliament.

---

[5] It stands for Millennium Development Goals

But regardless of political system, proportion of women in national parliaments around the world is extremely low.

Claude Diebolt and Faustine Perrin (2013) analyze the relationship of gender equality with economic growth. They argue that the promotion of gender equality together with economic and social empowerment of women is necessary to attain sustainable development. Development process is linked with the changing economic position of women. They explain this within the context of France. After significant evolution throughout the centuries, per capita income and GDP[6]increased to a higher level which has improved living standard resulting in socio-economic and cultural change. They further argue that demographic changes have taken place that improved the life expectancy, fertility and mortality rates have declined along with the change in marriage patterns. It has changed the composition of the population in France. After the French revolution, the involvement of women in paid activities, women's educational investment and labor force had increased. The emergence of married women into the workforce has increased the income of the household. During the 19[th]century, rise in national investment in women as human capital has reorganized the power imbalance between genders toward greater equality. The falling of patriarchal family with the changing socioeconomic role of women explains the movement from a male bread-winner family to dual-earning family system in France. Women no more stop their professional job on the birth of their children. Both men and women have professional careers, privileged living standard and fewer children.

Judith Buber Agassiin (1989) discusses the unequal status of women to that of men or gender inequality in case of Israeli Kibbutz in her work. She points out that Kibbutz women receive the same basic resources as kibbutz men in meals, clothing, pocket money, housing, foodstuffs, and along with this, they receive the same health care services and have the same rights to be protected in old age. A point to be noted here however is that, due to the polarization of work roles; men have easier access to certain material resources as well as some more basic rewards from occupational work than kibbutz women. Judith Buber Agassiin points out that few kibbutz women work in agricultural or industrial domain long enough to obtain the expertise to become its head or to be a part of economic or financial committees. Women serve in educational and social committees and some also becomes their heads. In Kibbutz differences in standard of

---

[6] It stands for Gross Domestic Product

living are very small. In the kibbutz, women's activities are not equally valued, nor is there full gender equality. In Kibbutz class society and the family structure do not subjugate women. Kibbutz women fully participate in the production outside the house and due to this woman are relatively equal to men. Most of the kibbutz women do not possess equal power in marriage, so there seems gender inequality in Kibbutz. Women of kibbutz will only become equal to men if they gain equal control on surplus resources.

Imran Sharif Chaudhry, Farhana Nosheen and Muhammad Idrees Lodhi (2012) see women's empowerment in context of Islam where they remove the misconception that Islam becomes an obstacle for women's empowerment. They argue that Islam has always favored women's rights and their empowerment. They point out that factors like lack of knowledge about true Islamic teachings and traditions and cultural norms imported from other religions are responsible for Muslim women's misery in Muslim societies. Muslim women are one of the least empowered parts of their society. The authors point out that Islam is a religion of balance, where all are equal in every respect. Qur'an and the Hadith give emphasis to the protection of the rights of women including rights of education, worship, freedom of opinion, choice of spouse, economic freedom, and social role. Islam as a religion ensures maximum women's rights. It is our typical social norms, old traditions imported from other religions and ignorance of the true teachings of Islam, which has made today's Muslim women vulnerable.

70 years ago, Islamic Republic of Pakistan manages to exercise Islamic laws in country and to live the lives according to the ways which Allah Almighty and Prophet Mohammad practically presented. But Government of Pakistan has failed to implement those laws therefore women are still most vulnerable and affected part of the society. In contrast to this, Daniela Donno and Bruce Russett (2004) explain the relationship between Islam, democracy, and female empowerment based on the work or contribution of M. Steven, and point out that countries with a largely Islamic religious tradition have notably more autocratic governments than non-Islamic countries do. They argue that the condition of women is significantly worse in Islamic countries than in others. A low level of women's rights in Muslim countries produces lower levels of democracy and Islamic states are more autocratic and repress women's rights more effectively. Islamic religious tradition and especially characteristics of Arab states or culture seem to support both autocratic government and the repression of women. Donno and Russett state that

27

correlation between democracy and economic development is one of the strongest and oldest in the literature. It is observed that the larger the number of Muslims as a percentage of the total population the lower the country's overall level of female empowerment. State's political neighborhood matters a lot, so it is important to see measure of the degree of democracy in the neighborhood. Since most of the Islamic countries are found in neighborhoods largely composed of undemocratic countries so Islam and other cultures may be inherently antidemocratic, and cultures in turn are largely the product of regional influences as Islamic countries are concentrated in Africa, the Middle East, and South and Southeast Asia. They argue that Islamic culture in particular may not be a major hindrance to achieving women's rights, but there is something about Arab states that becomes an obstacle in achieving women's rights.

The literature in the third domain, namely, **power and hegemony**, discusses the concept of power. Robert A. Dahl (1957) defines "power" in terms of a relation between people. It is seen through the lens of comparability, or the relative degree of power held by two or more persons. The objects in the relationship of power are actors and they may be individuals, groups, roles, offices, governments, nation-states, or other human aggregates. To specify the actors in a power relation he presented four things i.e. base or domain of power, range or scope of power, the amount of power exertion and means or instrument to exert power. He points out that there is a need to define the concepts "more power than," "less power than," and "equal power." He gives five factors to compare the power of two different individuals namely a) differences in the basis of their power b) differences in means of employing these basis of power (c) differences in the scope of their power d) differences in the number of comparable respondents and e) differences in the change in probabilities. Whenever there are two individuals or groups of people, if they are power comparable, they can be only ranked according to the quantity or amount of power which they possess.

M. Walther (2014) introduces main elements of Bourdieu's Theory of Practice as theoretical framework to explain strategy or practice by using his main concepts i.e. field, habitus and capital. In a field social agents make infinite number of interactions e.g. discussions, negotiations or conflicts. Bourdieu (1997) recognizes these social fields as universe where the agents and institutions interact with each other. Bourdieu (1972) states that social field is a "locus of struggles" that represents a system of positions. Bourdieu (1997) states that in the field agents

have dominant and dominated positions which determines what agents can and what they cannot do. In this way, fields are places of power relations where practices of agents are not arbitrary. In afield the positions of the agents are determined by the amount of capital that they possess. Bourdieu distinguishes between four types of capital that are cultural, symbolic, social and economic capital which agents mobilize in order to enter and operate in the social fields. Economic capital is related to a person's fortune and revenues. Cultural capital is transferred by family and education and may be institutionalized in the forms of educational qualifications. Symbolic capital is related to honor and recognition. Social capital is institutionalized in a title of nobility and requires efforts for its creation and maintenance. Bourdieu states that positions in social fields are relative or comparative. Bourdieu & Wacquant (1992) argue that positions are determined by the volume and structure of the capital portfolio possessed by an agent that is compared to that of other agents in the same field, especially regarding cultural capital and economic capital. Bourdieu & Darbel (1969) and Veenstra (2007) state that to differentiate elite or dominant from the mass or the dominated, agent's position in the social field determines through their language, lifestyle and particularly their eating patterns, sports and their political orientation which is strongly mediated by their respective habitus. Bourdieu understands Habitus as a group of people's perception, feeling, thinking, evaluating and speaking that structures all expressive, verbal, practical manifestations and utterances of individuals. Habitus is attained during primary and secondary socialization. The habitus pledges the shared or collective belief in the rules of the social game and that actor's act according to their positions in the field that depends on their relative amount and structure of economic and cultural capital.

Mark C. J. Stoddart (2007) conceptualizes relationship among the cultural production of knowledge and the reproduction of social power by seeing Marx's concept of ideology to the models of hegemony and discourse. Ideology refers to the ways where society as a whole adopts the ideas and interests of the dominant economic class. In a capitalist mode of production, important social relations exist between members of the working class as they engage in productive labor, as well as the relations between the working class and the capitalist class, that owns the means of production. The Frankfurt School emphasizes the cultural realm and the growth of scientific rationality as important factors of domination, where dominant classes exercise power through ideology. They provide a valuable corrective to Marx's focus on economic production as the main site of power, resistance and oppression. Stoddart states that

idea of "hegemony" is embedded in Gramsci's (1992) work in which hegemonic power works to convince individuals and social classes to subscribe to the social values and norms of an inherently exploitative system. It is a type of social power that relies on voluntarism and participation, rather than enforcement and threat of punishment for disobedience. Gramsci attributes a greater level of importance to the cultural superstructure of capitalist societies than it is attributed by Marx. The ideas of the ruling class do not necessarily become the defining values of society as a whole rather ongoing social action creates and reproduces hegemonic power. Compared with Frankfurt School theorists, hegemonic power is something that is always contested, always historically contingent and always unfinished. Foucault (1978, 1994, 2000, and 2003) offers the concept of power having numerous features. First, power operates at multiple levels. Second, power is not control of only one class over the other. Third, Foucault states ideas of a "Great Refusal," as power operates at essentially local sites, "points of resistance" emerge "everywhere in the power network". Stoddart in his work states that Laclau and Chantal Mouffe (1985) argue that hegemony is achieved through the discursive connection of subject positions within the social realm. In the work of Foucault, Laclau and Mouffe propose an acceptance of the fact that social inequality is produced when we incorporate hegemonic discourses into individual subjectivities. Dorothy Smith (1990, 1999) gives the term "relations of ruling" that convinces us to participate in social system of inequality and oppression. For her, women occupy a position of sub-ordination in contemporary societies, marked by gendered and class-based structures of social power. Like Foucault, Haraway (1991, 1992 and 2004) sees power as operating in a dense network throughout the everyday social world. Both Smith and Haraway asserts that individual and collective social actors approve to take part in systems of gendered and class-based social inequality through their commitment with a huge number of discourses about class, sexuality, gender and race. These theories of ideology, discourse and hegemony provide a variety of explanations in which ideology and discourse convince people to accept systems of social inequality as tolerable and incapable from social transformation.

The fourth domain, namely, **legal protection of women and policy challenges,** discusses different laws for women harassment over time and space in different regions of the world. In this regard, I have read the work produced by Mohamed Alli Chicktay (2010) where he points out that despite the constitution of South Africa with founding values of equality, dignity and freedom majority of women remain victims of sexual harassment within the workplace. In1994

South Africa approved a democratic constitution which provided fundamental rights to all South Africans for the first time, irrespective of race. In South African context sexual harassment includes "physical conduct such as unwanted touching, sexual assault, rape and strip searches by or in the presence of the opposite sex, verbal conduct such as sexual advances, comments with sexual overtones, sex related jokes, videos and texts, unwanted talk about a person's sex life, non-verbal conduct such as whistling, unwelcome gestures, and unwelcome displays of sexually explicit picture or objects" (Mohamed Alli Chicktay, 2010: pp 286–287).There are five possible ways that South African law provides redressal to organizational employees who are victims of sexual harassment: two options in terms of common law and three options in terms of statutory law. Under common law, employee's claims against their employers a) by virtue of vicarious liability employers can be accountable for harm caused to their employees, where harm is caused within the course and scope of their employment b) an employee can also sue the employer directly for failing to provide him/her with a safe work environment. However, under statutory law employees can claim against employer a) employee can sue the employer if he fails to comply with the Employment Equity Act (EEA) provides that "no person unfairly discriminate, directly or indirectly, against an employee on one or more grounds, including sex" (Mohamed Alli Chicktay, 2010, p. 294) b) employee can sue the employer on the basis of automatically unfair dismissal. Under the LRA, employers only dismiss an employee on 3 grounds that are operational reasons, misconduct, and incapacity. A dismissal that does not fall in these categories will be considered as unfair however, dismissals that are disgusting, serious and justifying greater compensation are observed as automatically unfair c) employee whose promotion is suspended or denied or an employee who is offered training or benefits in exchange for permitting sexual advances by an employer can sue the employer for committing an unfair labor practice. Despite this law, women still remain exceptionally vulnerable in the country.

Razia Musarrat and Naveeda Noreen (2013) reviewed various rights of women in the context of Pakistani history and list out those treaties which are signed by Pakistan for the legal protection and rights of women. They point out that Thomsen (2010) in his work has stated that United Nation Charter specifies equal rights for both men and women. Women suffrage movement in England was the first which struggled for legal protection of women and it is the movement that won women the right to cast vote. In 1962 Minimum Age for Marriage and Registration of Marriage was adopted. Pakistan participated in 1995 World Conference on women in Beijing

which clearly states that it is a program for women's empowerment which focused on gender equality and human rights and this is also signed by Pakistan. During Zia's government or regime women activists as well as national/international organizations protested against Hudood Ordinance 1979 because they considered it as a discriminatory law towards women. NCOSW (2006) argues that women activists protested against this and did lobbying to abolish this discriminatory law towards women. Then National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) reviewed Hudood Ordinance. The Hudood Ordinance was amended by The Protection of Women Act 2006 which was promulgated by the Federal government in Pervaiz Musharraf regime. Jamat-e-Islami protested against the bill as they considered it un-Islamic and the cause of vulgarity/westernization in the country. This Act (2006) declared sexual acts of men against women under the age of 16 and marital rape as an offense, it also changed the reporting procedure of Zina. The Criminal Law Amendment Act (2010) was a sign of protection of women rights and protection of women in Pakistan. In Gazette of Pakistan 2010, amendments were done in section 509 of the PPC, relating to sexual harassment of women at workplace. It was a wonderful piece of law which was only for women. The law explained it as "whoever intending to insult the modesty of any woman, utters any word, makes any sound or gesture, or exhibits any object intending that such word or sound shall be heard, or that such gesture or object shall be seen, by such woman, or induce upon the privacy of such women" (Musarrat and Noreen, 2013, p. 128) would be labeled an offence. In Senate of Pakistan, Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act 2010 has been approved. In 2011, Senate approved Prevention of Anti-Women Practices that is Criminal Law Amendment Bill Act. Government of Pakistan took a big step to oppose the crime that is "acid throwing" by the enactment of the Acid Control and Acid Crime Prevention Act 2010 in Pakistan. The Women in Distress and Detention Fund (Amendment Act) 2011 is a different bill which provides financial and legal assistance to distressed women languishing in various jails of the Pakistan. Senate passed the Domestic Violence Prevention and Protection Act in 2012 which give the victims easy access to courts to make a complaint or FIR to the court. On 2012, National Commission on the Status of Women Act was approved by the Senate of Pakistan. The rationale underline this Act was to encourage the social, political, legal and economic rights of women.

Filomena M. Critelli (2012) discusses women's experiences of marriage in Pakistan focusing on women's ability to enter and exit themselves from marriage according to the rights and options

given them by law in the country. A large proportion of females cannot make an independent decision regarding entering/exiting from a marriage because of the massive family and societal resistance. This is despite the fact that women are granted by the law the right to make their own choice. Parents consider it a matter of honor for themselves when they choose their daughter's partner. When girls make their own spousal choose they have to cut themselves off from family and community support. The women who do not want to stay with their husbands or want to take divorce or want to save themselves from verbal and physical abuse they go to women's shelter. As per the general policy of these shelters women can stay up to three months or until their legal case such as divorce is resolved. Sometimes shelters also adopt flexible policies based on the condition or issues of individual women. The author argues that it is common place to see Pakistani women entering marriage forced upon them by their families. Sometimes parents force girls to marry in retaliation for having eloped with the man of their own choice. Critelli points out that many women who are pushed into forced marriages are subjected to physical and emotional abuse by their husbands and husband's families. Such women seek protection and divorce from their abusive husbands. Women face many difficulties in pursuing their right to choose their marriage partner and to end abusive marriage due to the patriarchal norms and customs of the society. Even if the groom does not want to marry a particular girl refusal is unimaginable. The author goes on to say that sometimes owing to poverty young women are married to older men because parents do not have to give dowry in such cases and their burden is lightened. Rights which are in formal and religious laws remain unclear for many women and are difficult to understand and enforce. Under Pakistani law a woman achieve adult status at the age of 16 and is entitled to marry without parental consent. Still, women are forced by their parents to marry against their will. Romantic relationships prior to marriage or love marriages are considered as immoral and a risk to family honor. Women face anger and violence by their families in such cases. Some women lose their share in patrimony when they go against their families and want to exit from marriage. Women are often pressurized to leave their children with their fathers or families as a condition for divorce.

Government of Pakistan proposed "Protection against Harassment of Women at the Workplace Act in 2010 in which harassment means "any unwelcome sexual advance, request for sexual favors or other verbal or written communication or physical conduct of a sexual nature or sexually demeaning attitudes, causing interference with work performance or creating an

intimidating, hostile or offensive work environment, or the attempt to punish the complainant for refusal to comply to such a request or is made a condition for employment" (The Gazette of Pakistan, 2010, p. 3).Whereas "workplace" means "the place of work or the premises where an organization or employer operates and includes building, factory, open area or a larger geographical area where the activities of the organization or of employer are carried out and including any situation that is linked to official work or official activity outside the office" (The Gazette of Pakistan, 2010, p. 4). A complainant may report an incident of harassment informally to her supervisor, or to a member of the Inquiry Committee. The complaint may be made verbally or in written form. According to the law, every organization has to compose or constitute an Inquiry Committee within thirty days of the performance of this Act to enquire into complaints under this Act. The Committee must have three members, one member has to be a woman, one member needs to be a collective bargaining agent who represents employees or in case there is no CBA[7], the second member has to be a senior employee and the third member is someone from the senior management. Within thirty days of receiving of a written complaint, Inquiry Committee has to communicate the charges to the accused and declare allegations pointed against him. The accused must submit a written defense within seven days from the day that charge is communicated to him. If the accused fails to submit his defense the committee needs to precede ex-parte without reasonable cause and examine such documentary or oral evidence in support of charge or in defense of the accused. During this procedure each party is free to cross-examine the witnesses against them. Under this law, Minor penalties "include (a) censure (b) withholding, for a specific period, promotion or increment (c) stoppage, for a specific period, at an efficiency bar in the time-scale, otherwise than for unfitness to cross such bar and (d) recovery of the compensation payable to the complainant from pay or any other source of the accused" (The Gazette of Pakistan, 2010: pp6).Whereas in "Major penalties (a) reduction to a lower post or time-scale, or to a lower stage in a time-scale (b) compulsory retirement (c) removal from service (d) dismissal from service and (e) Fine" (The Gazette of Pakistan, 2010, p. 6) are included.

---

[7] It refers to Collective Bargaining Agent

Figure 1: Conceptual Framework-The Pictographic Presentation

Structure and Dynamics of women harassment at workplace

Role of structural division of work and gendered division of labor in women workplace harassment

major factors that influence women harassment

Women harassment on the basis of Ideology

Procedural structure and impact of contextual realities on the incidence of harassment

structural division of work

gendered division of labor

cultural practices and factors stopping women from reporting sexual harassment (Ali and Kramar)

Socio-cultural ideology constructing gender (Rubin)

cultural ideology, women harassment and reporting the incidence of harassment (Gadit and Mugford)

sexual harassment of women in the organization being studied and its interface with ideology of dominant class, in the larger society (Marx)

Larger cultural factors as obstacles in policy implementation (Ali and Kramar)

contextual realities at micro and macro levels causing differential distribution of power into individuals and groups and its impacts on sexual harassment (Dahl)

relationship between supervisory positions and non supervisory positions with women harassment (McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone)

different types of harassment faced by women

gender non conformity by women means higher risk of harassment (McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone)

Habitus and its impact on dynamics of sexual harassment in the organization (Bourdieu's)

Patriarchal custom and social structure being the major causal factors of sexual harassment (Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis)

Ideological practice in the organizational space w.r.t dominant class in larger society (Ingraham)

Discrepancies that exist between the larger culture and implementation of sexual harassment

Differential distribution of power and the nature of power interactions (Dahl)

higher level of harassment faced by clerical workers as well as by supervisors (Uggen, Shinohara)

female harassment as a social field within the organization being studied (Bourdieu)

Ineffectivity and inefficiency of harassment complaint committees in organization (Paramita Chaudhuri)

structure and dynamics of hegemonic contestations between harassed and harasser (Frankfurt School)

cultural hegemony causes silence of harassed women (Gramsci)

relationship between women harassment and gender balance in the organization (McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone)

KEYS:

→ Causes

— Comprises

Figure 1: Conceptual Framework-The Pictographic Presentation

3.2 Theoretical Framework: The narrative

To construct conceptual framework of the current research, I have borrowed several concepts defined and explained by a range of scholars and theorists discussed in my literature review.

To understand the contribution of structural division of work and gendered division of labor towards women harassment I have used the concept of supervisory authority as defined by McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone (2012). I have used this concept to compare women in my locale in more or less authority position to see if this indeed true. I have also used this concept to determine the difference in type of harassment face by women in my locales holding more and less authority in their organizations. I also borrowed Bourdieu's (1972) concept of social field as cited in Walther (2004). For Bourdieu social fields are the "locus of struggles" that represent a system or arrangement of positions. Bourdieu (1997) has also stated that in a social field people have different positions that determine what they can do and what they cannot. The next concept that I borrowed is that of Uggen and Shinohara (2009) who have argued that clerical workers report high rates of sexual harassment as well as supervisory status directly affects rate of women harassment. It helped me in my research to see how and in what manner this structural division based on positions or pay scale affects women harassment in the selected organization.

I have used the concept of gender non-conformity and its connection with women harassment given by McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone in their (2012) work. They have argued that women who are more "feminine", aggressive, confident, and dominant face more harassment then those who are not. I have used in my analysis the concept of gender given by Rubin (1975) as cited in Balme and Bulbeck (2008) to see how gender is constructed in the organizations that I collect my data from by the organizational as well the larger culture. I also employed the concept as argued by McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone (2012) that women who work in more male oriented settings mostly reported more sexual harassment then those who worked in gender balance settings or environments. I have used this concept to see if the incidence of women harassment is higher in gender non-balanced organizations which in my case is Ufone.

I used the concept of Gadit and Mugford (2007) who have argued that in Pakistan because of the cultural factors like norms, nature of society, religion, fear of losing respect, fear of victimization, job insecurity and retribution from family women avoid discussing the issue of harassment at workplace and thus they don't report it when it occurs. Likewise, I have used the

conceptualization of Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis (2013) who believe social structure, patriarchy, custom of Purdah and gender norms create discrimination for girls from birth and these are the causal factors for the incident of sexual harassment. I have also used the concept of Ali and Kramar (2014) who take the stance that women hide sexual harassment due to the socio-cultural practices such as shame, female modesty, blame culture and society and do not report their harassment at workplace. I have used Dahl (1957) concept of power and its operation. He asserts that power is held by individuals and groups and it's an interactional phenomenon. I have used the above stated concepts to understand socio-cultural and economic factors that influence women harassment in my locale.

I have used Bourdieu's concept of habitus as cited in M. Walther (2014), for Bourdieu habitus refers to people's perception, feeling, thinking, acting, speaking and evaluating that structures all expressive, verbal, practical manifestations and utterances of individuals. I have used this concept to see what kind of gendered habitus is created by the organizations cultures in my locale and how does that impact the types and intensity of women's harassment that may be taking place in the selected organization. I also employed Marx's conceptualization of ideology as cited in Mark c. J. Stoddart (2007) work. For Marx's the term ideology refers to all those ways which society adopts the ideas and interests of dominant class. I have used this concept to see if the class background of the employees in the selected organization has a relationship with the phenomena of women harassment taking place in the organizations. In conjunction with the Marx's concept of ideology I have used Chrys Ingraham (1994) perspective on ideological practice in social spaces. For Ingraham practice of ideology occurs in a space when the ideologies of dominant class become authorized and these influence various cultural narratives, institutionalized arrangements, and heterosexual imaginary. I have used this concept to understand how both men and women conceptualize harassment at workplace and how the larger culture and socialization constructs it.

I have also used the concept of Ali and Kramar (2014) that cultural factors influence or become obstacles in policy implementation. I have used this concept to understand situations where women face sexual harassment, but they do not discuss it openly, those who report it face victimization and some women are unaware of the policies and procedures related to women harassment. The application of this concept allowed me to analyze the discrepancies that exist

37

between culture and sexual harassment policies. Another concept used in my analysis is that of ineffective performance of complaint committees and concerned authorizes in case of sexual harassment given by Paramita Chaudhuri in her (2008) work. Chaudhuri has argued that often in presence of complaint committees, authorities do not deal with cases of women harassment in the Indian context. I have used Chaudhuri's concept to understand and analyze the causative factors for organizational complaint committees not dealing efficiently with the reported cases of sexual harassment in my locale. I have utilized Gramsci (1992) concept of hegemony as cited in Stoddart (2007) in my analysis. For Gramsci hegemonic power works to convince individuals and social classes to subscribe to the social values and norms of essential exploitative system. I have used this Gramsci concept to understand the concept of manufacturing consent through hegemony taking place in the organization due to which women become silent and consenting partners in the process of their own harassment and do not report it. I also used the concept of Frankfurt School theorists cited by Stoddart (2007) that hegemonic power is something that is always contested, unfinished and historically contingent. I have used this idea to understand the parameters of hegemonic contestations between the harassed and the harassers at moments in the organization I worked.

Chapter 4

Thematic presentation of data-1

Introduction

This chapter has 3 parts. In the first part I will present the organizational structure of Ufone and the demographic profile of the same. The second and third parts will comprise a thematic presentation of the data obtained from female and male employees of Ufone respectively.

Part 1: (A) Organizational structure of Ufone

There are 7 Business Units (BU) in Ufone and in each Business Unit there are different departments. The seven business units and the departments comprising each unit are as follows:

1. The HR, Admin, Security BU (this BU[8] comprises HR, Admin and Security department).
2. Commercial BU (this unit comprises Sales and Marketing department)
3. The Finance BU (this unit comprises payables, receivables, treasury, business intelligence and taxation department)
4. Customer operation BU (this BU comprises Customer operations, enterprise sales and call center services department)
5. Corporate strategy BU (this BU has only one department which deals with conception, policy formulation and implementation of cooperate strategy)
6. Government regulations and regulatory affairs BU (this comprises two department namely Government regulation and regulatory authority department and Legal department)
7. Technology BU (this comprises have technology planning department, technology operations department, technology strategy department and technology infrastructure department come together to constitute this BU).

4.1.1 Dynamics of Departments:

In HR department, there are 3 sub departments. These include Organizational Development (OD), Staffing Services and Employee Relation (SSER) and Compensation and Benefits (C&B).

---

[8] Business Unit

Also under OD, there are 3 further departments. These 3 departments are learning & training department, performance department and talent management department. The learning & training department is responsible for Training Need Analysis (TNA) where they trains their employees for their job when it is needed. The job of performance department is to keep check on performance of the employees while the Talent management department is responsible for recruiting employees with the right potential and polishing their talent by making them under go different types of trainings. Under SSER, there are 3 sub departments namely Recruitment department, Employee relation department and compliance department. The C&B department, performs the job of employee and systems appraisals. In summation thus, the HR department as a whole is responsible for hiring quality human resource, retaining employees by training them, facilitating the employees, honing employee talents, maintaining time lines, hiring the right person for the right job, making employee compensation and benefits market competitive, providing healthy work environment to employees.

Admin department which is one of the 3 sub departments of the first BU has 3 sub departments. These sub department are facility management, general management and infrastructure management. General management department is responsible for issuance of things and provision of maintenance services like issuance of tissues, tables etc. and providing maintenance of carpets cleaning etc. Facility management is responsible for ascertaining and maintaining the optimal temperature of AC's and heaters, regular supply of water and electricity etc. It is also responsible for provision of regular transport and travel facilities to employees. Infrastructure management is responsible for undertaking any alteration and additions in the building. Security department is responsible for two things, one is tower security and other one is corporate security. Tower security involves various activities to include provision of health services and safe environment to the employees, it is also responsible for the issuance of ID cards and management of fire equipment whereas the corporate security is responsible for creating alliances with Law Enforcement Agency (LEA), FIA[9], and Police etc. All working liaisons with CDA[10] also comes under the rubric of this department.

---

[9] Federal Investigation Agency
[10] Capital Development Authority

Sales department is responsible for increasing sales and generating revenue for the company this is a job that the sales and marketing department share. Sales department is also responsible for selling the company products via 3 department conduits. These conduits include a) retail marketing done through shops, through easy load and through franchise b) cooperate sales include creation of links with other members of corporate sector e.g. Uber, Careem etc. c) Channeling the products through setting up stalls in universities etc. and d) merchandizing which includes marketing products of Ufone through putting the Ufone logo on clocks, mugs, frames etc. and disseminating these products in the market. Marketing department on the other hand does following activities a) provision of call/SMS packages for younger people, children etc., b) provision of Mobile Financial Services (MFS) like Upaisa c) conducting marketing research to figure out the needs of customers and to see what products are demanding by the consumers and d) figuring out the level of product marketing at a given point and creating strategies for increasing this level so that sales can be intensify.

In Finance BU, payables department is responsible for all the payments which the organization has to make to any other company or firm, paying off all types of bills of the organization is also the responsibility of this department. Receivables department is responsible for all those payments which other firms and organization owe to Ufone. Treasury department has all the money of the organization. It is responsible for saving and generating more money through investments. Business intelligence of this unit analyzes the working of organization and reports it to taxation department and then taxation department pays tax to the Government.

Enterprise sales department is responsible for connecting with other firms and organizations and providing them services like Ufone SMS services, Ufone telephone services etc. The organizations that are provided these services pay money in advance to Ufone for utilization of the services and this advance money is paid to the Ufone through their enterprise sales department. For example Careem said they need our connection for SMS, mobile data and calls so they pay money in bulk to organization. Call center services department is responsible for making and attending calls of their customers and resolving their issues regarding connection, packages etc.

Corporate strategy unit is responsible for making 5 year plans for organization and alignment of organizational policy of Ufone with other groups in the telecommunication industry like Etisalat

policy etc. This unit is also responsible for ensuring performance efficient coordination between different departments of Ufone itself. Government regulation and regulatory authority department performs two major activities namely dealing with Ufone's relationship with various government department and addressing all matters that deal with Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA). Legal department is responsible for addressing any license related issues and matters related with courts. This department also represents Ufone in case an employee sues the organization.

Technology strategy department is responsible for making technological strategies for Ufone and for creating any alteration or modification budget for the organization. As they create the budget they have to ascertain if the organization has the amount required or not. After the budget has been created the control department sees whether the alteration suggested is an organizational need or a wish. After the budget is made and approved the Technology planning department reviews it and decide whether to use new equipment or renew the old one. Technology infrastructure department reviews all the details and decides as to what equipment's will used. Technology operations department collects this information from all other departments and then analyzes it to create the final version of the project. This department is also responsible for dealing with any problems that may arise during the implementation of the project.

Part 2: (B) Demographic profile

In Ufone, there are 8 designations for male and female employees. These 8 designations are CEO, Vice President, General Manager, Senior Managers, Managers, Assistant Managers, Senior Executives and Executives. In my locale which was the head office of Ufone in Islamabad there was total of 280 employees. 20 out of the total were female employees while the rest were male employee. This means that 9 percent of employees in this office were women. As per my data, 15 percent of the females occupy the positions of executive and senior executive, 7 percent females are Assistant managers, 10 percent of the females employees are managers and 3 percent of the females are holding senior managerial positions whereas the positions of the CEO, the Vice President and the General Manager have never been occupied by women in the history of the organization. The 8 working positions within the Ufone and their main responsibilities are given in the following table:

Table 1: Designations and Duties

Designations	Duties
CEO	Takes final decision on all matters and manages the entire organization to ensure that his company is competitive with other companies in the market.
Vice President	Creates future strategies for the evolution and expansion of the organization. He does this in consultation with and the approval of CEO.
General Manager	He is the head of HR and his main responsibilities includes recruitment of and to ensure alignment and coordination between different department comprising the organization.
Senior Managers	He overseas and manages the strategic objectives of the organization and plans the evolutionary trajectory of the organizational human resource.
Managers	The main responsibilities of the manager of any department comprise ensuring that departmental objectives are met, overseeing that every functionary of the department is performing his/her job properly, assisting director HR in recruiting the departmental employees and undertaking an overall surveillance of the functioning of the entire department.
Assistant managers	The major responsibilities of AM's across the departments is to supervise the working of senior executives and executives. They also ensure that departmental standards of work are being met by the executives and seniors executives in their respective departments. In case one of the executive or senior executives are performing at a sub optimal level then it is the responsibility of the managers to censure them, give them an explanation call and see that they start operating at the optimal level
Senior executives	In each department works at operational level and attend to the financial matters within their jurisdiction.
Executives	All executives in each department work at the operational level.

Source: Field work

4.2 Part 2: Themes emerging out of data collected from sampled female employees of Ufone

The data collected from sampled women has been divided into 3 clusters. First cluster is conceptualization of harassment, second cluster is socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards harassment and third cluster is factors underlying the reporting and non-reporting of female harassment by the victims.

4.2.1 Cluster 1: Conceptualization of female harassment at workplace

4.2.1.1 Theme 1: Harassment as intrusion in women's sexual and physical space on part of male colleagues

I have interviewed 15 females, out of which 7 respondents said that harassment is when man comes in women sexual and physical space. Dominant voice that comes under this theme according to my data is when a male colleague tries to be physical with female colleague. In dominant voice there are variations like touching, staring, demanding sexual favors, try to come closer, sends pictures or videos with sexual content. This dominant voice is manifested in what my respondents told me and I will now present their direct quotes:

One respondent said *"hath lagana kisi bhi tarah say ya sexual favors mangana harassment hai"*. (Translation: Touching body in any manner or demanding sexual advances is harassment). Another said: *"agar workplace main koi mard kisi larki ko ghooray to wo harassment hai"*. (Translation: If a male colleague stares at a female colleague it is harassment). There also was a middle voice where one of my respondents told me an additional thing and here is the direct quote: "*merey pas office main billa wajah ajata hai bethny aur gup shap lgata hai aur mujy ye bilkul pasand nahi"*. (Translation: He comes to my office without any reason and talks meaninglessly to me and I don't like it). There also was a marginal voice as one of the respondents said staring is not harassment. Here is the direct quotes of the respondent: *"ghoorna harassment mai shamil nahi hai, agr koi ghoorta hai to jao usko eik thapar lagao"*. (Translation: staring is not included in harassment, if someone stares at a woman she should go and slap him).

4.2.1.2 Theme 2: Sexual harassment as men saying things with sexual connotations

Sexual verbalization (saying things with sexual connotations) has various forms e.g. inappropriate comments, double meaning dialogues, sexually inviting facial expressions and gestures, unnecessary comments with sexual connotations on female dress and looks. In my data, 9 out of 15 respondents said harassment is when men verbally harass women and pass lewd comments on our dressing, looks and appearance at workplace. This dominant voice is demonstrated in what my respondents told me and here is a direct quote:

One of the respondent said *"mard ka kehna ky tum bohat achi lag rahi ho aj ye harassment hai"*. (Translation: Harassment is when men say you are looking beautiful and attractive today). Yet another one said: *"aurat ky samny chaar shadiyon ki baat karna aur Jannat main hoory milay gi unki bat karna bhi harassment hai"*. (Translation: When men talk about 4 wives being allowed to them as well as men talking about the fact that they will get Houris in Jannah is also harassing behavior).

4.2.1.3 Theme 3: Harassment as a psycho- emotional phenomena

In the interviews that were conducted, 14 out of 15 respondents said anything that a man says or does that creates emotional or mental discomfort for a women is harassment. I was told that there are different forms of it like if women feel insulted, feel insecure, feel threatened etc. at workplace. This is illustrated in the following quotes by the respondents:

One of the respondent said *"Onchi awaz main bol kar agly ko chup karwana harassment hai"*. (Translation: A man speaking loudly to a women so that she would get intimidated and shut up is harassment). Another one told me that contempt full and discriminatory words spoken by a male boss to a female subordinate at workplace is also harassment like *"tum ye kam eik mard ki tarah nahi kar sakti"*. (Translation: You can't work well as a man). Yet another one of my respondents said that also included in harassment are male comments like *"ye zada kama rahi hai mardo sy kyun ky iski shakal achi hai"* (Translation: When a man says that she is earning more than men because she is beautiful and pretty). Yet another one said it is harassment when male colleague say *"tum bohat achi lag rahi ho aaj"*. (Translation: you are looking very pretty today).

4.2.2 Cluster 2: Socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards female harassment

4.2.2.1 Theme 1: Female harassment as a manifestation of misogynistic upbringing of sons

In my interviews, 6 out of 15 respondents talked about misogynistic upbringing of boys as one of the factor that contribute towards women harassment at workplace. It is so because parents do not bring up their male children well and don't make them gender sensitive. They see it in their families that parents treat their sons and daughters differently. Family has an important role in educating their children morally. Boys are not taught to respect girls by their parents. They don't understand that women have value, self-respect and have equal rights. The women were of the opinion that although these are very important issues but they never become part of male child socialization at home so they can't respect women as grown-ups. This is manifested in the direct quotes of respondents:

One of the respondent said *"larko ki tarbiyat achi honi chahiye".* (Translation: there is a need of good upbringing for boys and young male adults). Other respondent said *"jese ye btaya jata hai ky jhoot nahi bolna, usi tarah ye bhi btaya jaye bachpan sy ky larkiyon ki kiya izzat hai aur kia cheezein nahi krni".* (Translation: Like parents tell children not to lie as are growing up, boys should also be told as to what constitutes female respect and what kind of behaviors should be avoided with reference to girls/women). Yet another one said I know a male colleague who occupies a senior position in the organization but there was a problem in his grooming and up-brining which showed in his speech. She said he would often make sexist comments about female employees who complained of harassment like *"woh konsa koi hoor pari thi jo wo usko daikhy ga, bakwas karti hai wo".* (Translation: Why would a male stare at her lecherously she is not beautiful she is just telling a lie about him).

4.2.2.2 Theme 2: Family authority structure as a causative factor in female harassment

There also was a middle voice according to which some of my respondents said that it is social norm that men are the head of the household and have authority in the house. All the decisions are taken by men. So that is why they consider females sub-ordinate or inferior. But when they don't get authority in their house because females have upper hand then they ultimately harass and shout on women at workplace. Here is a direct quote representing this voice:

One of the respondent said *"jab ghar main authority nahi milti lekin kam wali jagah par authority hoti hai to wo aurat par cheekhty hain"*. (Translation: when men are denied authority at homes but have senior position at workplace they shout and emotionally harass women). Another said *"mardon ko jub authority nahi milti gharon main to phir wo dosri auraton par cheekhtay hain"*. (Translation: When men don't get authority in their homes than they shout on other women).

4.2.2.3 Theme 3: Sexual frustration in men and watching Porn as causes of female harassment

This is a marginal voice in that only 2 out of 15 respondents talked about it. I was told that in a lot of men there is sexual frustration because their sexual needs are not met through proper channel of marriages and that leads them to harassing women at workplace. I was also told that sometimes men harass women because they watch pornographic films and that creates lust in them which comes out in their behavior at workplace. This is substantiated by their direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: Men do this because *"wo desperate hoty hain, asal wajah ye hai k zada tar log akele hoty hain 30 saal ki umer tak bhi, to un ki zarorat puri nahi hoti aur isi liye wo auraton ko harass karty hain ta ky unki frustration kam ho sakay"*. (Translation: they are desperate, the reason is that some of them are single even at their 30's so their sexual needs are not fulfilled and that is why they harass women just to channelize their desperation/frustration). Another one said: *"social media ka bohat bara kirdar hai harassment barhany mai, wahan wo porn videos daikhtein hain aur phir ye is tarah rape wagera jesi chezein hoti hain"*. (Translation: social media is the one major factor that increases this issue of harassment because people see all types of pornographic material there and that is why things like rape happens etc.).

4.2.2.4 Theme 4: Cultural construction of female harassment as a male primal right and a source of enjoyment

There is also a marginal voice. Only 1 out of 15 respondent said men think that being friendly with female colleagues is very normal. They consider it their primal right when they get frank with women or pass sexual comments. It is manifested in following quote:

One of respondent said: *"ye aadmi ki soch hai, yeh un kay liye maza hai, hasi mazak hai jub wo aurat ko harass karty hain".* (Translation: It is men's psyche, its fun for men when they tease or harass women, it's just an entertainment for them).

4.2.2.5 Theme 5: Harassment as insecurity coping strategy of men

This is also a marginal voice. Only 1 out of 15 female respondent told me that men have complex and that is why they harass women so that they can suppress/oppress them. It is in the culture that men have upper hand in society so they can't accept the fact that women can go to higher position or they can have authority. So when women have authority and become independent then men have fear in their minds that women will become stronger and will go to the higher position*s*.

One of the respondent said: *"mard sochtay hain kahin ye na ho k larkiyan hum sy agy nikal jae to chalo un ko harass kr k daba kar rakho".* (Translation: Men when dealing with professional smart women feel threatened and in order to stop them from excelling and leaving men behind men end up harassing them so that their advancement can be curtailed).

4.2.2.6 Theme 6: False consciousness of men created by bad child rearing as a cause of female harassment

From the interviews that were conducted, 2 out of 15 female respondents said that men don't know what constitutes harassment. Men don't understand that they are making women uncomfortable through their actions. They think what they are doing is perfectly fine because they are taught from childhood to be aggressive and intimidating. This is substantiated by their direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: *"mardon ko pata nahi hota ky woh jo kar rahay hain woh harassment hai, woh un chezon ko aam samajhtay hain"*. (Translation: Men don't feel that they are harassing women through their aggressive acts because men find it normal and don't understand that this is harassment). Another one said: *"larkay ye samajhtay he nahi k harassment kiya hai"*. (Translation: Boys don't understand what harassment is).

4.2.2.7 Theme 7: Female harassment as a product of generational gap between older men and younger professional women

2 out of 15 respondents were of the opinion that older men at workplace harass younger professional women because of their misunderstanding of female temperament and proper behavior. It was reported that since in the large generation good women did not dress up in public, did not go out for work and did not talk to men causally. Men of the older generation at workplaces when they encounter younger women displaying such behavior feel that these women are loose of character and game for them. To illustrate this I am going to present direct quote of my respondents:

One of the respondent said *"purany khayalat k mard ye nahi smjhty k larkiyan sirf pese kamany ka shoq nahi rakhti bulky wo apnay kam ko khushi sy krna chahti hain, achy kapre phn'na chahti hain, tayar hona chahti hain. lekin log ye samajh lete hain k ye to aram sy hamary sath bahir jany ky liye maan jae gi"*. (Translation: Men of older generation don't understand that younger girls at work enjoy their work, dress up for their own happiness and like to look good for their own sake, the older men keeping in line with their own generational ideology believe that these women by being extrovert are inviting them and thus they end up harassing them by asking them out etc.). Another one said: *"zada tar larkiyan ghar sy bahir nahi jati is lia wo jo bahir jati hain aur kam krti hain log unko galat samajhty hain"*. (Translation: Since most girls do not pursue careers and are not in the public space therefore, those who are out there are taken advantage of by men).

4.2.3 Cluster 3: Factors underlying the reporting and non-reporting of female harassment by the victims

4.2.3.1 Theme 1: Existence of boldness and confidence level among women or lack thereof as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

Dominant voice that comes under this theme says that women who are bold, straight forward, out spoken and confident they report harassment. Because they have support of their family. It is their liberal and open family that encourages them to report the incidence of harassment. Co-education system build confident in girls because there they study with boys and teachers also teach them to speak for their rights. This is substantiated by direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: *"larkiyan bold aur confident hoti hain apny ghar k khuly aur azad mahool sy"*. (Translation: Girls get bold and confident because of open or liberal family system). Another one said *"larkiyan apni grooming aur upbringing say bold hoti hain"*. (Translation: Girls become bold due to their grooming and upbringing).

4.2.3.2 Themes 2: Awareness of rights or lack thereof as an underlying factor of reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

From the interviews that were conducted, 4 out of 15 respondents said that women who have higher education and more experience in work sector they report harassment because they have exposure of the world, they know about their rights and they are independent. Also they are strong and can handle the situation. This is manifested here in the direct quotes:
One of the respondent said *"Jin larkiyon ko pta hota hai k wo yahan kisi ko entertain karny ky liye nahi hain wo report karti hain"*. (Translation: The girls who know that they are not at work to entertain others they report harassment). Another one said: *"jin larkiyon ko apny rights ka pata hota hai wo karti hain report"*. (Translation: Girls who know about their rights they report incidence of harassment). Yet another one said: *"jo larkiyan parhi likhi hoti hain aur kafi arsy sy kam kar rahi hoti hain wo report karti hain"*. (Translation: Girls who are educated and have been working for extended period of time they report harassment).

4.2.3.3 Theme 3: Mental security or insecurity among women as an underlying factor of reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

From the interviews, 6 out of 15 respondents said that females who have fear of victim blaming and are not mentally strong they don't report harassment. Women who are image conscious they don't report. Those women's who can't face social and economic consequences of reporting, they don't report. This is substantiate by direct quotes:

One of the respondent said *"jo larkiyan ye sochti hain k log kiya kahy gay aur un k kirdar par bolay gay wo report nahi krwati"*. (Translation: women who are image conscious, and are scared of what people would say about them and their morality don't report harassment). Another respondent said "*larkiyan is liye bhi report nahi karti k larky ye kahy gay k oye yaar ye mat bolo report ho jaegi teri us larky ki tarah"*. (Translation: women don't report because they think that her male colleagues would taunt her and make fun of her for being a cry baby in front of others).

4.2.3.4 Theme 4: Level of efficiency of HR and awareness of female rights within the organization as an underlying factor of reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

3 out of 15 respondents said that HR plays an important role in reporting of harassment. If culture of the organization is such that it creates awareness among women about the issue of harassment and they are strict about it then women can easily report. Employees who have supportive bosses and managers they report more harassment. This is supported by the following direct quote:

One of the respondent said reporting becomes difficult *"agar larki karna chahay report lekin us ka boss keh day k nahi mat karo report warna tumhay sabot dyna pary ga"*. (Translation: If a woman wants to complain about harassment but her boss stops her from doing so and tells her that if she report she will have to provide proofs which would be difficult). Another one said: *"agar harassment kay bary main seminars arrange keiye jaye organization main to larkiyan report karti hain"*. (Translation: If the organization arranges seminars about the issue of harassment than more girls would report the incidence of harassment).

4.2.3.5 Theme 5: Strong and weak economic background as an underlying factor of reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

5 out of 15 respondent said women who are in need of job and economically weak in terms of their family background they don't report. Because they are have to support their family and if they face these issues at workplace they don't report it because they have fear of losing their job. So they can't take risk of their job and continuously tolerate issue of harassment at workplace. I am going to present direct which my respondent told me:

One of the respondent said *"jo larkiyan zarort ki wajah say job kar rahi hoti hain aur jinho ny ghar ko chalana hota hai wo report nahi karti"*. (Translation: The girls who are working out of financial compulsions and they are the soul bread winners of family do not report harassment). Another one said *"jin larkiyo ko job ki zarorat hoti hai wo report nahi karti hain"*. (Translation: Girls who need the job they don't report harassment). Yet another one said *"jo larkiyan financially weak hoti hain wo report nahi karti"*. (Translation: Girls who are financially weak don't report incidence of harassment).

4.3 Part 3: Themes emerging out of data collected from sampled male employees of Ufone

The data collected from sampled men has been divided into 3 clusters. First cluster is conceptualization of harassment, second cluster is socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards harassment and third cluster is factors underlying the reporting and non-reporting of female harassment by the victims.

4.3.1 Cluster 1: Perception of female harassment at workplace

4.3.1.1 Theme 1: Harassment as intrusion in women's sexual and physical space on part of male colleagues

I have interviewed 8 male employees, out of which 5 respondents said harassment is when men try to get physical with women. Dominant voice under this theme asserts that any sexual advances made or sexual favors demanded by men like touching, rape etc. is included in harassment. This is manifested in the following direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: *"aurat kay sath ksi bhi tarah sy physical hona ya qareeb hona harassment hai"*. (Translation: Getting physical and getting into physical proximity of a women by a man comprises harassment). There is a marginal voice as well where one of my respondent said *"kisi ko marna bhi harassment hai"*. (Translation: When a man strikes a women it also comprises harassment).

4.3.1.2 Theme 2: Harassment as a psycho-emotional phenomena

In my data, 6 out of 8 respondents said anything that makes a women mentally or emotionally uncomfortable is also a part of female harassment. It has variations in it like women can feel uncomfortable in various forms e.g. if a woman feels insecure, feels insulted, feels inferior then all of these adversely affects her psyche. This dominant voice is substantiate in what my respondents told me and now I am going to present some of the direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: *"agr koi kisi larki ka phone uthaye aur usko kholny ki koshish kary beshak us par password laga bhi ho, phir bhi ye cheez harassment mai ati hai kyun kay dosra banda is say pareshan ho ga"*. (Translation: If someone pick up the phone of women and try to open it even if it is password protected, it is harassment because it will create stress for the owner of the phone). Another respondent said: "*larki ko bezat krna kay wo mardon ki tarah kam nahi kar sakti ye bhi harassment mai shamil hai kyun kay is cheez ka us kay zehan par asar paray ga"*. (Translation: Insulting a woman and making her feel inferior to men as professionals also comprises harassment because it would create mental stress for the women in question). Yet another one said: *"agar larki ki chutti approve na ki jaye lekin larky ki kar di jae to wo bhi harassment hai"*. (Translation: If a male and female employee apply for leave and the boss approves the leave for the former but does not approve the same for letter this is also a form of female harassment). There also was a marginal voice where 1 out of 8 respondent said even shouting on women is harassment. Direct quote is: *"larki par cheekhna kay us ny kam dair say keiya ya galat keiya wo bhi harassment hai"*. (Translation: If a women can't meet her deadline or does not meet the requirement of as assignment and the boss shouts at her it is also a form of harassment). The point that respondents is trying to make here is that reprimand for not meeting deadlines or doing substandard work is okay but not by insulting women.

4.3.2 Cluster 2: Socio-cultural and economic factors that contribute towards harassment

4.3.2.1 Theme 1: Female harassment as a manifestation of misogynistic up-bringing of sons

I have interviewed 8 sampled male employees out of which 2 respondents said poor and bad upbringing of sons leads toward incidences of female harassment at workplace. They said that men don't learn to be respectful towards women as adults because they are not taught so through child socialization. This is substantiate by the respondent's direct quote:

One of the respondents said *"mard samjhtay hain k aurat ki koi value nahi hai, unko pta he nahi hota k kiya cheez galat hai aur kiya cheez theek hai, unko pata he nahi hota kay kis had tak jana hai"*. (Translation: Men are not taught to value women through the process of socialization. They can't differentiate between proper and improper behavior towards women. They also do not know their limits when interacting with women). Another one said *"maa baap nay larkon ko sikhaya he nahi hota kay larkiyon ki kiya izzat aur value hai"*. (Translation: Parents as they are bring up sons do not teach them the honor and value of girls).

4.3.2.2 Theme 2: Sexual and social frustration as a causative factor of female harassment

In my data, 3 out of 8 male respondents said that men are either socially/sexually frustrated due to their circumstances at home and this frustration gets manifested as female harassment at workplace because men don't know other ways of channelizing frustration. This frustration can be channelized in a healthy fashion through exercise of different types but normally our men don't do it. This is manifested in following direct quotes of respondents:

One of the respondent said *"admi frustrated hotay hain kyu k unhy apnay relation mai wo chezein nahi mil rahi hoti jo wo chahty hain is lia wo harass karty hain dosri khawateen ko"*. (Translation: Men are frustrated because they are not satisfied sexually and otherwise in their family relationship and this frustration gets manifested in the form of female harassment at workplace). Another one said *"Frustration society sy, ghareebi sy aur ghar ki pareshanio sy ati hai"*. (Translation: Male frustration come from the society, family instability and poverty). There also was a marginal voice in which 1 out of 8 male respondents said: *"jab mard apni zindagi mai rejection mahsoos karty hain tb woh harass karty hain dosri auraton ko"*. (Translation: When

54

men feel rejected by women in their households they end up harassing their female colleague and subordinates at workplace).

4.3.2.3 Theme 3: Female harassment as a product of men exercising power over women

In my data, 3 out of 8 respondents said men want to control women that is why they harass them. It is in the culture that men have authority, power and dominant so to maintain this power, they keep women lower to them. This is manifested in the following quote below:

One of the respondent said: *"mard sochty hain k unk pas power hai, aurat kuch nahi kar sakti, aur wo aurat ko qabu mai kar sakty hain"*. (Translation: Men are socialize to think that they have power over women, and women can't defend themselves and they can control women so they do it through harassing them). Another one said *"mard auraton ko control karna chahtay hain is liye wo harass karty hain"*. (Translation: Men want to control women that is why men harass them).

4.3.2.4 Theme 4: Female harassment depends on the way women carry themselves

From the interviews 4 out of 8 male respondent said if women dress up fashionably and look beautiful then men harass them. Dominant voice that comes under this theme according to my data is that it's fine if women dress up for themselves but first of all they should see the environment where they are working, and then dress up according to organizational environment. I was told that if a girl wear jeans, then everyone will look at her but if she wears hijab or dupatta, then automatically men will lower their gaze. So problem resides in is that how female carry themselves. This dominant voice is manifested in what my respondents told me and I will now present direct quote:

One of the respondent said: *"tali dono hath say bajti hai, larkiyan makeup karti hain aur achy kapre pehnti hain to naturally nazar us taraf jati ha"*. (Translation: Both parties contribute towards female harassment. When women put on makeup and look beautiful it is natural for men to be sexually provoked and it ends in female harassment. Another respondent said: *"agar auratien aise provocative dressing kar kay aye gi kam karny kay liye bagair ye jaany kay wahan ka mahool kesa hai to phir kuch naa kuch to ho ga"*. (Translation: If women are dressed do

provocatively and have a lack of understanding of workplace environment harassment would result inevitably). Yet another one said: *"hum Islam ko follow nahi karty lekin maghrib ko follow kar rahy hain. Islam main mard aur aurat ka milna kam sy kam hai, aurato ko pata hona chahye kay unho nay mard ko kese inkaar karna hai aur kese khud ko bachana hai"*. (Translation: We do not follow Islam but we are following west. Islam prohibits free inter gender interaction. Women should know how to counter the unsolicited sexually advances of men and how to safe themselves and integrity). Another one said *"agar sab say zada auratein hee affect ho rahi hain to wohi kyun nahi lay laiti precautions"*. (Translation: If women are so adversely affected by harassment on hands of men why don't they ensure that men do not harass them?).

4.3.2.5 Theme 5: Cultural and religious invisibility of women in public instigates female harassment when a women is visible

2 out of 8 respondents told me that a very important cause of female harassment in Pakistani culture is the fact that culturally and religiously speaking women do not mingle with men and they wear clothing in which their contours are not visible which makes them semi or totally invisible. A lot of them, observe purdah and should not be seen by men without an outer covering. I was told that given this fact, whenever a women in public wearing jeans and displaying her curves and contours men get provoked and end up harassing them. They also told me that western men do not harass women like this because they are used to seeing women who are dressed in a modern fashion and are out there in public so for them it's not a big deal. Local men due to lack of exposure on the other hand to seeing women in public get provoked. Here is the direct quote: *"aurat ko dor rakha gaya hai, chupa kar rakha gaya hai"*. (Translation: In our culture, women are concealed distant and invisible). Another one said *"agar larkiyan jeans pehnay gi to har koi daikhay ga lekin agar hijab ho ga to automatically nazar nechy ho jati hai"*. (Translation: if girls wear jeans everyone would ogle at them but if they wears hijab or dupatta, then men would lower their gaze).

4.3.3 Cluster 3: Factors underlying the reporting and non-reporting of female harassment by the victims

4.3.3.1 Theme 1: Existence and lack of boldness and confidence level as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

In my data, 4 out of 8 respondents said confident and bold girls report harassment. They have this personality because of their family support and their upbringing. They said parents have taught their daughters to be themselves and up hold their individual rights. These are the girls from open/liberal family background. Parents allow their daughters in co-educational institutes and have male friends. This is substantiated by respondent's direct quote of respondent:

One of the respondent said: *"wo larkiyan report karti hain jo khuly aur azad mahool mai rehti hain, aur jo parhay likhay khandan say hoti hai".* (Translation: Those girls report harassment who have been brought up in open/liberal environment and belong to educated families). Another one said *"jo larkiyan bold hoti hain wo report karti hai".* (Translation Girls who are bold they report harassment). Yet another one said *"jo confident hoti hain wo report karti hain".* (Translation: Girls who are confident they report).

4.3.3.2 Theme 2: Strong vs weak economic background as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

From the interviews, 5 out of 8 male respondents said girls who are in need of job they don't report harassment. They have to support their families as they are financially weak. Those who have strong economic background they report. Those who are in a need of job and have fear of victim blaming i.e. people will blame them that so they don't report. Here is the direct quote:

One of the respondent said: *"jin larkion ko peso ki zarorat hoti hai kyun kay unhay ghar ko sambhalna hota hai wo report nahi karti".* (Translation: Girls who need money to support their family they don't report harassment). Another one said *"jin ko job ki zarorat hoti hai wo nahi krti report".* (Translation: Those girls who need the job they don't report the incidence of

harassment). Yet another one said *"jo larkiyan ghareeb hoti hain wo report nahi karti"*. (Translation: Girls who are poor they don't report incidence of harassment).

4.3.3.3 Theme 3: Mental insecurity among women or lack thereof as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

5 out of 8 male respondents said women who have fear of victim blaming they don't report harassment. Women don't report because they have fear of losing reputation in organization and think that were they to report an incidence of harassment against them people would blame them and talk ill of their character. This is substantiate by the respondent's direct quotes:

One of the respondent said: *"auratein sochti hain kay log un kay bary main batein karay gay aur un ka mazak uraye gay to is tarah say un k liye wahan kam karty rehna mushkil ho jaye ga is liye wo report nahi karti"*. (Translation: Women think that people will gossip about them and make fun of her so it will be difficult for her to continue working there thus they don't report female harassment). Another respondent said *"jin larkiyon ko victim blaming ka dar hota hai wo report nahi karti"*. (Translation: Girls who have fear of victim blaming they don't report harassment).

4.3.3.4 Theme 4: Level of efficiency of HR and awareness of female rights within the organization as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting of female harassment

2 out of 8 respondents said HR has a strong role in promotion of reporting incidence of sexual harassment. They said effectiveness of HR and support of the managers makes it easy for girls to report. The direct quote of the respondent is stated here:

One of the respondent said *"larkiyan report nahi karti kyun kay organization aur HR unko support nahi karta"*. (Translation: Harassed girls don't report it because environment of organization and HR is not supportive of them). Another one said *"hamary yahan HR support karta hai, is liye larkiyan zada report karti hain"* (Translation: in our organization the HR is supportive of women staff that is why more and more women now reporting cases of sexual harassment).

Chapter 5

Thematic presentation of data-2

5.1 Introduction:

In this chapter I will present the data obtained from the harassment committee members of Ufone. The data will be presented in the forms of themes emerging out of the data collected by me during the focus group discussion with the members of the harassment committee of the Ufone headquarters.

Thematic presentation of data obtained from harassment committee of Ufone Head quarters

The data collected from the interview with harassment committee members has been divided into 4 clusters. First cluster is conceptualization and types of harassment occurring in the organization, second cluster is causative factors underlying harassment in the organization, third cluster is factors underlying reporting or non-reporting of female harassment in organization and fourth cluster is procedure of addressing cases of female harassment followed by the committee.

5.1.1 Structure of committee:

The harassment committee in Ufone comprises 3 members, 1 female and 2 males. Designation of female member is Executive employee relations, the designation of one of the 2 male members is Lead compliance and services support. The other male member of the committee holding the position of Lead regional manager (Karachi). The Criteria of recruitment to harassment committee includes experience of problem solving and expertise in techniques of probing and investigation. The members of harassment committee are selected from "Employee Relation Committee". Cases of harassment are dealt by the "Employees Relation Committee" since members of this committee have knowledge and experience about the problems of employees.

5.2 Cluster 1: Conceptualization and types of harassment occurring in the organization

5.2.1 Theme 1: Harassment as intrusion in women's sexual and physical space on part of male colleagues

All of the respondents said harassment is when men try to get physical with women and intervene in their personal space. It has variations like touching, physical striking, getting closer to women, unnecessary conversation with women and rape etc. It is presented in the direct quote:

One of the respondent said: *"jab bhi koi apki zaati space mai anay ki koshish kary to woh harassment hai".* (Translation: Harassment is when someone tries to enter in your personal space). The other 2 member's agreed with it.

5.2.2 Theme 2: Sexual harassment as men saying things with sexual connotations

All 3 had the same opinion on this issue. They said harassment is when men pass inappropriate comments on female colleagues and say things that carry sexual connotations and suggestions. This would include passing inappropriate comments about dressing, looks and appearance. This is manifested in the direct quote of 1 of the 3 respondents:

One of the respondent said *"kisi bhi tarah kay gair munasib comments larkiyon ko pass karna harassment mai shamil hai".* (Translation: Any type of inappropriate comments which men pass on women includes in harassment).

5.2.3 Theme 3: Harassment as a psycho-emotional phenomena

2 out of 3 respondents said anything that has adverse effect on her mentally or emotionally constitute harassment. The committee members told me that there is a variation in female harassing behavior to include causing mental torture to women, insulting them, victimization of women and discrimination against them. Now I am going to present what my respondents told me and here it is presented in their direct quote:

One of the respondent said: *"agar boss larki ko ye bolay kay tum ye kam nahi kar sakti ya yeh kay tum is kam ko karny mai zada time lo gi to ye harassment hai".* (Translation: If a woman boss told her she is incapable of performing a certain task and she would take longer time to

accomplish particular task then this would constitute harassment). Another one said: *"agar boss larki ka kam appreciate na karay lekin mard ka kam appreciate karay to wo harassment hai"*. (Translation: If a boss does not appreciate performance of a female subordinate but appreciate the task of male subordinate constantly then that constitute harassment).

5.3 Cluster 2: Causative factors underlying harassment in the organization

5.3.1 Theme 1: Female harassment as a manifestation of misogynistic up-bringing of sons

2 out of 3 respondents were of the view that misogynistic upbringing of sons in the larger culture is one of the factors that contributes toward women harassment at workplace. Bad or poor mentality of men lead towards the incidence of harassment. Parents don't teach their sons how to respect women and value them. This is presented in the respondent's direct quote:

One of the respondent said *"mardo mai buri zehniyat un k km parhay likhy aur tang nazar gharelu mahool ki wajah say banti hai"*. (Translation: The bad or poor mentality in men is because of the conservative/uneducated environment of their family). Another one said *"maa baap bachon ko morally teach nahi kartay"*. (Translation: Parents don't educate them morally).

5.3.2 Theme 2: Gender segregation in the larger culture is an underline cause of female harassment at workplace

One of the respondent said it is part of our culture that women do not often go out the house. Men are kept away from girls from childhood and it is considered improper and incorrect if both genders interact or work. Owing to this cultural restrictions, when men and women work together men don't know how to interact with women without harassing them and they behave in inappropriate manner. This is presented in direct quote by respondent:

One of the respondent said *"larko nay larkiyon k sath parha nahi hota is liya jab wo kam karnay atay hain aur larkiyon ko daikhtay hain to phir woh ajeeb ajeeb harkatein kartay hain"*. (Translation: Boys normally do not stay with girls so when they get together with girls at workplace they do not know how to behave with women properly thus they end up behaving in odd fashions and harassing manner).

5.3.3 Theme 3: Family disturbance and frustration as an underline cause of female harassment

I was told by one of the respondent that family disturbance is the cause of the harassment. Men get frustrated when there is any issue in their family and to release/channelize that frustration they harass women. This is substantiate in the direct quote of respondent:

One of the respondent said: *"Frustration ki wajah say mard auraton ko harass kartay hain aur ye frustration un kay ghar kay maslon aur pareshanion say ati hai".* (Translation: Because of frustration men harass women and it comes from their family disturbance or problems).

5.4 Cluster 3: Factors underlying reporting or non-reporting in organization

5.4.1 Theme 1: Financial insecurity or lack thereof as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting harassment

In my data 1 out of 3 respondent said women who are economically weak they don't report harassment because they have fear of losing the job. They have to support their family that is why they simply ignore it. This is presented in the direct quote:

One of the respondent said *"jin larkiyon ko nokri ki zarorat hoti hai wo report nahi karti".* (Translation: women who are in need of job they don't report).

5.4.2 Theme 2: Fear of victim blaming or lack their off as a factor underlying reporting or non-reporting of harassment

Women who concerned about victim blaming they don't report. They are afraid that people will blame them for the act and say they must have provoke men. Some women feel that they can't find another job and are not confident enough so they decide not to report. This is substantiate in direct quote:

One of the respondent said*: "Jo larkiyan ye sochti hain kay rehna to idhar hee hai wo report nahi karti".* (Translation: women who know that they can't leave their current job they go on tolerating harassment but never reported). I was told that another respondent women also do not report because they feel that reporting the incidence of harassment will intensity their harassment

"jo yeh sochti hain kay report karnay kay bad wo larka mere pechy aye ga, ya number day day ga apnay doston ko ta kay woh tang kar sakay mujy, wo report nahi karti". (Translation: Women who think that after reporting that can follow her, he can give her number to his friends so that they can tease her, they don't report).

5.4.3 Theme 3: Existence and lack of boldness and confidence level as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting female harassment

One of the respondents said those who are bold and confident they report harassment. They knew about their rights. It is their family which makes them confident and blunt. They grow up in a way where parents teach their daughters to speak for themselves. This is manifested by the direct quote of respondent:

One of the respondents said *"jo larkiyan bold aur mou phat hoti hain wo report karti hain"*. (Translation: Girls who are bold and blunt, they report harassment).

5.4.4 Theme 4: Efficiency of HR and awareness of female rights within the organization as an underlying factor for reporting or non-reporting

One of the respondent said efficiency of the organizational HR and aware of their rights among the female employees is a major factor of reporting harassment. Reporting by women increases if HR works efficiently, takes action against the offender and deliver justice to the victim. Organizational culture which women about their rights leads towards the incidence of reporting. This is manifested in direct quote:

One of the respondent said *"agar HR strong ho aur larkiyon ko safe environment day, to larkiyan report karti hain"*. (Translation: If HR is strong and provides women safe working environment and support to female employees then girls report harassment).

5.5 Cluster 4: Procedure followed by the committee

5.5.1 Theme 1: Reporting of the incident of harassment

Whenever a case is reported in Ufone, first of all victim has to send written email of the incident with all details to both HR and committee. It includes the information about offender, his/her designation, at what place and time incident took place in organization, what actually happen to complainant etc. If there are any proof or witnesses then victim also provide those details to the committee. Proof can be in any form i.e. recording, texts, videos, chat, both in oral and written form. When the committee received this email, then before starting investigations committee confirms from the complainant to start the procedure.

5.5.2 Theme 2: Questioning and investigation of all the stakeholders

After reporting, the committee calls all stakeholder (victim, offender and witnesses if any) one by one to listen to everyone. The committee then goes on to analyze the statements given by stakeholders plus any other evidences by the stakeholders. After listening to all, committee find out the gaps and then do cross questioning.

5.5.3 Theme 3: Proclamation of decision by the committee

After all the investigation, if it is proved then offender is fired because there is a zero tolerance policy in Ufone.

Note: Although committee members did not talk about it, but one of my male interviewees told me that if the committee cannot find solid proof of harassment in any case, then committee does one of the 3 things namely sending warning to the accused, deducting an amount from his salary or delaying the promotion of the accused.

Chapter 6

Thematic presentation of data-3

Introduction:

This chapter has 2 parts. In part 1, I will present data collected from interviewing Secretary of Federal Ombudsperson office that deals with issue of women harassment at workplace. In the second part I will present four case studies obtained from the Ombudsperson office in the narrative form.

6.1 Part 1: Themes emerging out of data collected from Secretary of Ombudsperson office

6.1.1 Theme 1: Conceptualization and types of female harassment at workplace

When asked from the respondent about the perception and types of harassment he was of the view that harassment includes getting physical with women, misuse of authority at workplace by men, and any type of texts from male colleagues with sexual connotations. He said *"agar koi male colleague apni female colleague say ye kahy kay aap aaj achi lag rahin hain to is ka ye matlab nahi hai kay wo usko harass kar raha hai, agar usko acha nahi lga to wo keh day ye kay aynda is tarah say bat mat kary, agr wo dobara kahay to phir wo complain kar sakti hai, ho sakta hai kay us nay behan ya beti ki tarah samajah kar kaha ho kay tum payari lag rahi ho"*. (Translation: If a male employee praises his female colleague and says you are looking pretty/beautiful, this is not harassment. If she does not like it then she should tell him not to say it again but if he repeats the same act then she should complain about him because then it is harassment. It should be ignored the first time around because there is the possibility that the man praised her as his daughter or sister). I was told by the respondent that girls who report harassment against their bosses/managers because they are reprimanded time and again for not meeting the deadlines is not included in harassment. He said *"agar main kasi female employee ko koi kam karnay kay liye dun, aur wo kaam naa karay, aur mere bar bar pochnay par wo mere khilaf harassment report kar day to ye harassment nahi hai, kyun kay boss aur managerial*

authority nay organization chalani hai aur wo apny employees ko kam day gay". (Translation: If I give a task to a female employee but she fails to do it on time and I have to reprimand her and she says I will not do this work and when I asked her again and again to do that work and she files a case of harassment against me than it is not harassment. It is because a boss or managerial authority has to run the organization and if the employee does not do it on time then it is the right of the boss to reprimand him/her). He said if a women does not work properly or does not work on time then I have a right to ask her to correct her ways.

6.1.2 Theme 2: Causative factors that contribute towards the incidence of female harassment

I was told by the respondent that incidence of harassment occurs because of the bad mentality of men. Harassment also occurs when women try to become equal to men. This is manifested by the respondent direct quote:

"mardon ki buri zehniyat ki waja say ye masla hota hai". (Translation: Poor mentality of men becomes a cause of female harassment). *"Religion nay kbhi bhi mard aur aurat kay liye barabari ka lafaz istemal nahi keiya, to jab autarain barabar mai ana chahay gi to phir is tarah kay maslay to ho gay"*. (Translation: Our religion has never used the word of equality when talking about men status via women thus when women try to be equal to men then harassment type issues will inevitably emerge).

6.1.3 Theme 3: Organizational structure and positions of female

I was told by the respondent that total number of regular male and female employees in Federal ombudsperson office are 53. Designations in the office are Chairperson, Secretary, Deputy Sectary, Registrar, Consultant, Stenographer, and Naib Qasid etc. Out of the 53 regular employees in the office there are only 3 females. One of these 3 females is the Chairperson namely Miss. Kashmala Tariq who is the Ombudsperson. The other 2 females hold the position of Assistant Private Secretary (APS). In addition to these permanent 53 functionaries in the office there are 7 interns also. 4 out of these 7 interns are women and 3 are men. They work on the cases of harassment and also attend hearing of cases.

6.1.4 Theme 4: Positive impact of the formation of Ombudsperson office on reporting of female harassment

When asked from the respondent about reporting of the incidence of harassment. I was told that after the formation of the office reporting of the incidence of female harassment has increased to a great extent. Not only the cases of female harassment at workplace are reported here but even rather the cases of harassment within the households are registered herein. This is manifested by the respondent's direct quote as given below:

"jab say office bana hai tab say reporting hona zada ho gayi hai, agar pehlay 100 cases registered hotay thay to ab 1000 cases aty hain". (Translation: Since the formation of the office the reporting of cases of harassment has increased from 100 to 1000 cases).

6.1.5 Theme 5: More incidence of female harassment in public sector

I was told by the respondent that incidence of female harassment is higher in government sector. The reason is that employees know that they are regular employees and it is not easy to dismiss them from the service. This is manifested by the respondent direct quote:

"Harassment kay cases zada tar public sector mai ho rahy hain private sector ki nisbat, Logon ko pata hota hai kay wo permanat hain aur unko nikal dyna muskhil hai jab kay private sector mai mardon ko dar hota hai kay kahin nokri na chali jaye". (Translation: The incidence of female harassment is higher in public sector than in the private sector. This is so because men in public sector know that they are permanent employees and firing them is not so easy whereas in private sector men are afraid of losing their jobs if accused of harassment).

6.1.6 Theme 6: Awareness of phenomena of harassment as a factor to minimize incidence of female harassment

Respondent were of the view that issue of harassment can be minimized in the larger culture and at workplaces by creating awareness among women and men. There must be seminars where it is explained what constitutes harassment, what is the procedure for reporting etc. This is manifested by the respondent's direct quote:

"logo ko aware kar kay, campaigns run kar kay ye issue kam ho sakta hai". (Translation: This issue can be minimized through awareness raising and by running campaigns about the issue of female harassment).

6.2 Part 2: Cases of female harassment at workplace dealt with by the Federal Ombudsperson Office

6.2.1 Case 1:

A complain about workplace harassment was made by Ms. Alina Anwar who was working in the dispensary as a medical helper in Oil and Gas Development Company Limited (OGDCL) on 19.01.2018 to the Ombudsperson office. This complain was against Mr. Muhtashim Hassan working as Medical Attendant in the same organization. Although the complainant made the complaint against Mr. Muhtashim Hassan in the office of the Ombudsperson in the year 2018 but the case had the history. The complainant was first subjected to the workplace harassment in 2013 and she reported it in writing to the organizational inquiry committee on 19.03.2013. In her complaint, it was written that accused was talking and acting vulgar towards her. In her application, she also stated that the accused threatened her that if she was to complain against him he would get her services terminated. Upon an investigation by the committee the accused was found guilty, he admitted his fault and tendered an unconditional apology to the complainant. Slightly, more than a year after her first complain Ms. Alina Anwar put in a second complain to her organizational committee. In the second complain she informed the committee that Mr. Muhtashim Hassan was sending love letters to the complainant. The investigation of the committee found Mr. Muhtashim Hassan guilty again. The accused again admitted his guilt and tendered an apology and the organization accepted the apology and he was not punished.

Around four years after the second complain Alina Anwar put in a third complain against Muhtashim Hassan on 19.01.2018. This time around however instead of complaining to her own organizational inquiry committee she filed a complaint in the office of Ombudsperson. As per the contents of the third complaint and statement of the complainant, the allegation against the offender was that he had made objectionable and obscene gestures in front of the complainant. Moreover, Mr. Muhtashim Hassan was accused by Alina Anwar that he had forced the complainant to touch his private body parts and had done the same with her. Upon the resistance

of the complainant, the offender retaliated and threatened to get her fired from the organization. The complainant also attached picture taken in a van with her complain that showed the offender was holding the legs of the complainant. The complainant also attached two videos with her complain wherein the offender was making obscene gestures in front of the complainant and playing with his private body part. The videos and pictures were examined by the office of the Ombudsperson. The offender was confronted with the videos and pictures to which he admitted that it was him and as a response he said he was just being "easy" in the workplace when there were no people around. As a result of her 2018 complain, the Ombudsperson office reached the conclusion that the accused was definitely guilty and could not prove his innocence. It was ruled that the conduct and actions of the offender amounted to unwelcoming sexual advances and sexually demeaning attitude towards the complainant thereby creating a hostile working environment for the complainant.

The Ombudsperson office decided that the offender deserves no leniency and shared their findings with the organizational harassment committee of the accused and the complainant. Although the Ombudsperson office and the organizational committee agreed in principle on the issued that the accused had harassed the complainant and should be punished. There was a difference of opinions on the punishment given to the offender between the two. The organizational committee recommended that penalty be levied on the offender but the ombudsperson office overruled that decision of the organizational committee and the accused Mr. Muhtashim Hassan was dismissed from service w.e.f. 19.03.2018.

6.2.2 Case 2:

Ms. Noreen Bibi (Complainant/appellant) worked as Assistant Manager Gym in Islamabad Club on contract basis which was extended for two years one in 2015 and then again on 2016. She filed a case against Mr. Shakeel Khan (accused) who was working on probono/honorary basis as a convener of Managing Committee for sports, Discipline, Human Resource and Staff Welfare in Islamabad Club. The complainant wrote complain to General Manager of Islamabad club on 23.10.17 which was received in the club on 27.10.17. The complainant accused Mr. Shakeel Khan for calling her to his office numerous times on petty issues. She also wrote in her complain that when he called her to his office he shared details of his personal life, was flirtatious and used

sexually explicit language. The complainant also reported that during these visits to his office, Mr. Shakeel Khan also put forth the proposal for sexual relationship to her, and asked her to comply with his wished and threated her that there would be no place for her in the club in case of refusal. The complainant in her application also stated that on one interaction, whenever she tried to leave his room accused would stand up from his seat and stopped her from doing so but the complainant managed to rescue herself after one and a half hour when someone walked into the office. When inquiry committee of the Club talked to the accused, he denied all charges against him and stated that this complaint against him is a result of malafide and ulterior motives of the complainant as there was an inquiry on the complainant for misuse of club facilities i.e. swimming pool wherein she was served a notice on 10.10.17 resulting in an outstanding payment along with five other employees of the club. Further on, he asserted that the complainant came into his office six times for professional purposes only. The contract of the complainant was due for yearly extension on 21.10.17 which fell after the complaint was filed. Her contract was not renewed by the HR committee of the club.

The complainant also lodged a complaint before the chairman of National Human Rights Commission (NCHR) reiterating her allegations against the accused on 12.11.2017. The senior consultant of NCHR requested the General Manager of the Club to investigate the matter thoroughly so General Manager of Club formed a new committee. When Committee asked the complainant to appear before the committee for investigation, she decided not to appear before the inquiry committee and sent a letter dated 04.12.17 wherein she showed her lack of faith and questioned the impartiality of Islamabad Club inquiry committee as accused was Convener of the HR committee which was assigned to investigate the matter. In her letter to the club she pointed out that the Capital Administrative & Development Division (CA&DD) inquiry committee is looking in to her complaint. The club inquiry committee decided to proceed ex-parte. The accused submitted his written statement dated 30.11.17 where he wrote that all his interactions with the complainant were purely for official purposes and restricted to work. It was stated that the contract of the complainant was not renewed based on her unsatisfactory work performance. The committee reached the conclusion that the complainant does not qualify to be an employee as her contract expired on 21.10.17. No evidence was quoted in support of the allegations, except that she informed HR Manager about the incident. The committee feels that complaint has been filed just to pressurize the Club management for securing an employment contract as well as to

70

protect the employment of other employees, whose services have been terminated by the Club due to their misconduct and unsatisfactory performance. Also no circumstantial evidence has been found in support of the complaint and probably for that very reason the complainant is not willing to join the proceedings. This report was also sent to the Chairman NCHR and case was closed dated 12.12.17 by the Chairman NCHR, where it is submitted that the allegations made by the lady do not stand established. NCHR chairman also pointed out that this was an attempt to defame the person concerned after her services were legally terminated.

On parallel, CA&DD inquiry committee on 12.12.17 investigated the case and examined the whole record and analyzed the matter deeply. The committee in their investigation concluded that Ms. Noreen Bibi was denied extension in her contract period in an abrupt manner without giving any notice. The only charge against her was that she misused Club facilities for which she was fined. Otherwise, her performance was more than satisfactory and the HR committee of the Club recommended 4 increments for her on 03.07.17. The committee recommended that Mr. Shakeel Khan be separated from all the positions assigned to him or held by him on regular and honorary basis in the Islamabad Club. On 08.02.18 Member inquiry committee CA&DD submitted a report to the club declaring the club's inquiry committee as unlawful, it was also stated that it is the right of both parties to appeal against the decision of that committee to the Ombudsman. Whereas, Islamabad Club prepared another report on 15.2.18 adding the above mentioned development and dismissed the complainant without informing her about the inquiry report by CA&DD. The same report was submitted before the office of Ombudsperson on 29.05.2018 after notices were issued by the Ombudsperson office to the club dated 10.05.18 and 23.05.18.

Now the office of Ombudsperson has the lawful jurisdiction to confirm, set aside, vary or modify the decision on the basis of available record and reach its own conclusion. Keeping in mind the available record and subsequent series and sequence of events, the complainant was alleging that her contract was not extended because she refused to comply with the wishes of the accused who as a result influenced the Club management to not extend her contract. Though accused has maintained that the HR committee had decided not to extend her contract due to her unsatisfactory performance but he admitted, that there were six such occasions when he interacted with the complainant for professional purposes. In six meetings, four were in private

between the complainant and accused. Out of which two meetings were regarding her poor performance and for upkeep, maintenance and standard of the gymnasium.

Although, it does not attract prudent mind as to why an honorary/probono member of the committee will take suggestions from an Assistant Manager for improvements of the gymnasium. Most importantly, accused did not produce any explanation or warning letter issued by him to the complainant regarding her poor performance. Examination of the record show that on the last meeting in private dated 21.09.17, it was alleged that meeting was detained for one and a half hour. The accused did not deny the duration of the meeting and stated that this meeting was to verify the disability of an employee's child. But there is no justification why meeting was held for such a long time during office hours. The most important fact was that in the HR committee dated 20.10.17, it was decided that the contract of the complainant will not be extended due to the misuse of club facilities. It is observed that the penalty of the complainant is not proportionate to the other employees who also misuse the club facilities, they were fined only. Moreover, the alleged harassment took place behind closed doors. The present facts support the version of the complainant and hence, the complainant has been successful in making out a case of harassment against the accused. The office of the Ombudsperson totally disagreed with the decision of inquiry committee of the Club. It was concluded by the Ombudsperson office that the complainant's/appellant's position prior to her complain dated 23.10.17 be restored with all benefits. It was further decided Mr. Shakeel Khan (accused) must be separated from his position and shall not hold any such position in future. Membership of the accused shall be suspended for 6 months along with this Rupees 1,000,000 was imposed on Shakeel Khan, out of which Rupees 500,000 was to be payed to the complainant as compensation. The Ombudsperson also decreed that amount of Rupees 100,000 be imposed on Islamabad Club for not having a duly constituted inquiry committee.

6.2.3 Case 3:

A case was filed in the Ombudsperson office by Ms. Fatima Munir against her ex-husband Mr. Asad Ali on 02.05.2018. The complainant and accused were previously wife and husband but their marriage was dissolved through the civil court proceedings before the filing of complain. The complainant was working as a lecturer in a university in Lahore whereas the accused was a

former police officer. After the dissolution of their marriage, the accused started harassing the complainant at her workplace by using different modes such as fake email IDs and profiles on social media like LinkedIn and Facebook. The accused also sent a defamatory letter to the workplace of the complainant causing mental torture, harming the complainant's professional repute and integrity. The accused also initiated a spree of frivolous cases on the complainant and her family by virtue of being an influential police officer and attempted to evict the entire family from their legitimate house by adopting illegal means.

After necessary compilation of the file, the accused was issued summon through proper channel. No one appeared on his behalf. Various summons were issued to him repeatedly but all in vain. Hence, the office of the Ombudsperson proceeded to ex-parte decision against the accused. After fulfilling all the legal technicalities, the complainant was allowed to prove her case by providing evidences. The complainant provided screenshots of fake profiles of the complainant on "LinkedIn". Moreover, the complainant also shared screenshots of conversations on Facebook, where one profile in the name of "Sarfraz Muzaffar" has messaged a student of the complainant claiming to be the accused and wrote "LSE Slut very high rate". The complainant also exhibited documents regarding legal proceedings including FIR (First Information Report) in police stations and FIR in FIA (Federal Investigation Agency), family court record and writ petition before the Honorable Lahore High Court.

All the records revealed that the accused was habitually harassing his ex-wife as he was retaliating against her for the calling off of their marriages. The fake profiles have been verified by the FIA being operated by the accused. The accused was also proclaimed an offender for not joining the court proceedings against him. Accused has been found guilty of harassing his ex-wife by defaming her repute, sexually baseless allegation, hindering her job at her workplace, uploading immoral material and creating fake Facebook IDs with the name of complainant, hence found guilty of harassment at workplace. The opponent Asad Ali was dismissed from service w.e.f. 19.09.2018 with a fine of Rupees 1,000,000 out of which Rupees 500,000 was payable as compensation to the complainant.

6.2.4 Case 4:

A complaint was filed by Ms. Naseem Tahir working as a resource person in Pakistan broadcasting corporation (PBC) Islamabad against Mr. Shoaib Waseem working as Driver in National Broadcasting House (NBH), Islamabad on 05.04.2018. The offender teased her again and again at the workplace, making her uncomfortable by stopping her on the way and trying to go in female quarters where she live. Before approaching Federal Ombudsman for protection against harassment of women at workplace, a complaint was also filed and was pending within the departmental inquiry committee as per record during pendency of first compliant before the Director General PBC Head Quarter, Islamabad. After the inquiry, Mr. Shoaib was found guilty for creating misconduct and major penalty of "Dismissal from service" has been imposed dated 30.07.2018.

Chapter 7

Analysis of the primary data and concluding remarks

In this chapter analysis of primary data collected during fieldwork presented in chapters 4, 5 and 6 will be analyzed. Starting from the analysis of the data collected from female and male employees of Ufone, the chapter include analyses of data collected from members of harassment committee and Secretary of Ombudsperson office. The analysis will be done by keeping in mind research questions and objectives of the study. The analysis will apply the theoretical concepts delineated in the conceptual framework to explain the primary data.

To start with the conceptualization/perception of female harassment at workplace. It has been found on the basis of primary data that harassment is of different types that includes physical, verbal, emotional and psychological harassment. Dominant voice among my female and male respondents was that when women get emotionally and mentally disturbed by men's acts that is harassment. When men shout on women at workplace and make them feel belittled, insulted and threatened then it adversely effects them mentally. Many of the respondents were of the view that male bosses discourage their female subordinates by saying that they do not work like men and insult them in front of colleagues. The second largest voice that emerged from my interviews indicates that any type of interactions where men get physical with female colleagues without the consent of the latter is harassment. Female employees and harassment committee members of Ufone mentioned about verbal harassment where male employees harass women by saying things with sexual connotations. Here I find 2 concepts of Bourdieu applicable. The conceptualization of harassment as described here is indicative of the fact that the organizational workplace of Ufone constitutes Bourdieuian **social field** which is a locus of struggle between people having different positions of authority that determines what they can do or what they cannot. The other concept of Bourdieu that I find applicable here is of **habitus**. Habitus is defined by Bourdieu as people's behavioral practices and utterances in a **social field.** My assertion here is that, Ufone as an organization manifests different types of practices and utterances of male authority position holders against women who hold lesser authority and this creates a **habitus** leading to female harassment at workplace. By habitus Bourdieu means people's perceptions/thinking/feelings which are built during their socialization. In my study, it

has been seen that society and culture has a very important role in the incidence of female harassment. It was found on the basis of interviews that during their childhood parents do not make their sons gender sensitive. Men see discrimination in their homes and culture. They are not taught to respect girls. They think that women are inferior and weak and it starts from their homes during child rearing. It is in the patriarchal society that men have authority and power and because of it they control women. My respondents were of the view that men harass women at workplace because of this. So, Habitus is a causative factor in the incidence of female harassment. Also concept of Uggen and Shinohara which states that clerical workers face more harassment do not match with the findings of this study. My respondents were of the view that the organizational position does not matter in the incidence of harassment. Men do not think about it before harassing women. There is no difference in the type of harassment faced by employees on higher or lower positions.

In the 4 case studies that I have presented in chapter 6 as well as the data obtained from the interview guides administered to male and female employees of Ufone presented in chapter 4 negates the concept of supervisory authority of women safeguarding them from harassment by men as put forth by McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone as well as a similar concept linking higher authority of women with lesser threat of harassment by Uggen and Shinohara. These scholars have argued that women holding higher supervisory authority are at a lower risk of harassment as compared to those who do not have the supervisory or higher authority in an organization. My data is indicative of the fact that this concept is not applicable in my locale and that the authority held by the women in the organization does not save them from being harassed. The concept of Uggen and Shinohara which states that clerical workers face more harassment than managers does not match with the findings of this study. My respondents were of the view that positions do not matter in the incidence of harassment. Men do not think about it before harassing women. There is no difference in the type of harassment faced by employees on higher or lower positions. I am saying this because in the 4 case studies that I have presented, two of the harassed women had the same authority position as their harassers while one of them had lesser authority than the harasser and one of them actually had greater authority than the harasser. The same picture emerges from my interview guides.

McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone in their 2012 work have given us the concept of gender non-conformity on part of women argue that women who do not conform to feminine identity are at a greater risk of being harassed. My data points out towards the fact that gender conformity in terms of display of socially constructed feminine behavior like shyness, being soft spoken e.t.c on part of working women or lack thereof is not a factor that puts them at the risk of harassment at workplace. My respondents were of the opinion that men would harass women because of their biological sexual category and irrespective of their conformity or non-conformity to feminine behavior. Thus this concept of McLaughlin, Uggen and Blackstone is negated by my data.

Rubin in her 1975 work as well as Gadit and Mugford in their 2007 work have pointed out that in Pakistan harassed women do not report their harassment to their organizational harassment committees due to cultural factors like fear of losing respect, job insecurity and retribution from family etc. The same point is made by Ali and Kramer in their 2014 work. This point is substantiated and validated by my data as presented in chapter 4, 5 and 6. Most of my interviewees told me that women when harassed often do not report their harassment because of these and other cultural factors. Nahar, Reeuwijk and Reis in their writing have argued that there are factors in the larger Pakistani culture to include patriarchy, custom of purdah and subordinated female normative behavior according to which both little boys and girls as well as adult men and women are socialized and because of the internalization of these factors men when they start working end up harassing women and a lot of women again because of the internalization of these cultural factors tolerate harassment and do not do anything about it. Thus my assertion is that Nahar's, Reeuwijk's and Reis's concept as delineated here is highly applicable in my locale as per my data. Dahl talks about power differentials in individuals/groups. My data from female interviews indicates that in the larger culture and the patriarchal system men have more power and authority. To maintain this power men control women because they consider them inferior and that is why they harass them. Owing to this fact, when men have female bosses or they have to interact with women who have greater authority than themselves it scares them and they cannot handle it. The findings of my study shows that economically strong or weak family background influences reporting of harassment by the victims, but does not influence the incidences of harassment. Those who belong to strong economic background would report harassment but those who are financially weak would not.

This study explores various factors that become obstacles in the reporting of female harassment at workplace. Female employees, male employees, harassment committee members and secretary of Ombudsperson office were asked about the factors that influence victims to report harassment or vice versa. Members of the organizational harassment committee identified that because of the fear of losing their jobs and victim blaming women don't report harassment. The Dominant voice among male employees was that women don't report harassment because they have fear of victim blaming. They think that people will say that, there must be something wrong and provocative about the women. They also have fear of losing reputation and respect in the organization. Those women who are financially weak and in need of job they don't report as they have fear of losing their job. The data obtained from the Secretary of Ombudsperson office supports the data taken from Ufone employees. An additional factor which my respondents told me was level of efficiency of HR committee of the organization. Marginal voice among my respondents said that if the organizational culture and HR department is such that it supports women in reporting harassment and are strict about it then women can easily report harassment.

When I look at Marx's concept of ideology and Chrys Ingraham concept of the same, where both of these scholars talk about the fact that in any culture the ideas held by the dominant economic class are accepted by members of the society at large. They also argued that patriarchy and heterosexual imaginary where male is the active part of the equation and the female is the subordinate part of the same comprises an ideology that serves the interest of the dominant economic classes in any society. I am asserting here that, the popular gender and sexual ideology promoted by the dominant classes in Pakistan is in line with what Marx's and Ingraham are saying. I am also arguing that men and women as they are raised in Pakistani society internalize this ideology and when they go to the workplace it pushes men towards harassing women and pushes women towards accepting and tolerating it. Thus my argument here is that, the concept of ideology as put forth by Marx's and Ingraham is totally applicable in my locale as per my data.

Paramita Chaudhuri in her 2008 work has pointed out that the sexual harassment complaint committees in the Indian context are not working very efficiently. When I take this idea of Chaudhuri and juxtapose it with my data I see that when harassed women reported their plight to their organizational committee in Ufone the cases are dealt with quite efficiently in that, many of the respondents told me that when a case is reported either the offender is highly fined or

dismissed. Having said that, I need to point out the fact that the case studies obtained from the ombudsperson's office however are indicative of the fact that many organizational harassment committees (other than Ufone) could not stop the offender from harassment effectively and the victims had to go to the ombudsperson's office and the ombudsperson's office dealt with and punished the offenders very efficiently and severely. This also needs to be pointed out that all four of the cases that were dealt with by the Ombudsperson's office had occurred in public sector organizations. On the basis of my data thus, it can be argued that organizational harassment committee in Ufone which is a private sector organization is much more efficient than public sector organizational committees. On the basis of this my assertion is that Paramita Chaudhuri's concept is applicable in the public sector organizations but not in private sector organizations.

Moving towards the concept of hegemony given to us by Gramsci who has argued that hegemonic power works to convince individual and social classes to subscribe to the social values and norms of the larger exploitive social system. My data indicates that the gendered exploitative system in the larger Pakistani society is generally accepted by men and women in my locale around the issue of harassment. However, this should not be understood as the exploitative system going totally uncontested by the harassed women in my locale which is what Stoddart in his 2007 work points out towards. His argument is that although hegemonic power can maintain exploitative relationships as a general rule but hegemony is contested every now and then by the exploitative social class and group. My data is indicative of the fact that many women do not question and report female harassment at workplace ensuing out of the exploitative patriarchal system in which they gr ow up but women who are bold and belong to economically secure backgrounds do question patriarchy at workplace and report the incidence of harassment to their organizational harassment committees every now and then. Given this fact my assertion is that the concept of hegemony given by Gramsci and concept of contested hegemony given by Stoddart are both partially applicable in my locale.

8. Significance of the study

Given my research topic and questions, the current study has both theoretical and applied significance. The aim of the study was to examine the structure and dynamics of women harassment at workplace. The study aimed at analyzing the role of structural division of work and gendered division of labor towards women's harassment in the selected organizations, to

analyze socio cultural and economic factors responsible for sexual harassment, to identify the perceptual and ideological structures held by both men and women regarding women's harassment, to understand the procedural structures of the organizations that dealt with women's harassment and to examine contextual realities that lead to the incidence of harassment. This study would be a significant addition in the existing scholarship in the Pakistani context because of its depth and multidimensionality. This constitutes theoretical significance of the study.

The applied significance of the study is that it would provide important and relevant data and findings to the policymakers who deal with the issues of women rights, women empowerment and women's workplace harassment. It is hoped that the findings of this research would enable policy makers and implementers in the country to effectively reduce women's workplace harassment. Further, the results and finding of this study would be helpful for law makers and legal advisors to deal with the issue and to make laws that would reduce the incidence of this issue at workplace. The data that has come out of this study would also be beneficial for the NGO's, INGO's, social workers and women activists who try to address the issue of women and development generally and women's workplace harassment particularly.

9. Limitations of the study:

Document analysis could not be done because of the Ufone policy as they do not give access of policy documents to any research student. Owing to the shortage of time, women in the professional cadre were focused upon leaving out women working in non-professional capacities like janitors etc.

10. Recommendations for Government Organizations and NGO working on women harassment at workplace:

1. Both types of outfits should work to ensure that human resource departments of private as well as public organizations give on job trainings to stop women's harassment at workplace and improve their harassment policies.

2. Both kind of outfits should work on organizing gender sensitization workshops for professionals working in private as well as public organizations working in the country.

3. Both kind of outfits should launch female empowerment projects in public as well as private organizations so that more women would report workplace harassment when they face it.

4. The government should review the penalty levied on people who harassed women at workplace to make them severer.

References

Agassi, J. B. (1989). Theories of gender equality: lessons from the Israeli Kibbutz. *Gender & Society*, *3*(2), 160-186.

Ahmadya, G. A., Mehrpour, M., & Nikooravesh, A. (2016). Organizational Structure . *Social and behavioral sciences* , 230, 455-462.

Ali, F., & Kramar, R. (2015). An exploratory study of sexual harassment in Pakistani organizations. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, *32*(1), 229-249.

Balme, J., & Bulbeck, C. (2008). Engendering origins: Theories of gender in sociology and archaeology. *Australian Archaeology*, *67*(1), 3-11.

Basch, C. E. (1987). Focus group interview: an underutilized research technique for improving theory and practice in health education. *Health education quarterly*, *14*(4), 411-448.

Bergvall, V. L. (1999). Toward a comprehensive theory of language and gender. *Language in society*, *28*(2), 273-293.

Bernard, H. R. (1994). *Research Methods in Anthropology* (2nd ed.). USA: Sage Publications.

Bryman, A. (2015). *Social research methods*. New York: Oxford university press.

Chaudhry, I. S., Nosheen, F., & Lodhi, M. I. (2012). Women empowerment in Pakistan with special reference to Islamic viewpoint: An empirical study. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, *32*(1), 171-183.

Chaudhuri, P. (2007). Experiences of sexual harassment of women health workers in four hospitals in Kolkata, India. *Reproductive health matters*, *15*(30), 221-229.

Chaudhuri, P. (2008). Sexual harassment at the workplace: Experiences with complaints committees. *Economic and Political Weekly*, *43*(17), 99-106.

Chicktay, M. A. (2010). Sexual harassment and employer liability: A critical analysis of the South African legal position. *Journal of African Law*, *54*(2), 283-297.

Cohen, P. N. (2004). The Gender Division of Labor: "Keeping House" and Occupational Segregation in the United States. *Gender & Society*, *18*(2), 239-252.

Critelli, F. M. (2012). Between law and custom: Women, family law and marriage in Pakistan. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, *43*(5), 673-693.

Dahl, R. A. (1957). The concept of power. *Behavioral science*, *2*(3), 201-215.

Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, Y.S., (2008). *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials*. (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage publications.

Diebolt, C., & Perrin, F. (2014). The Foundations of Female Empowerment Revisited. *Revue d'économie politique*, *124*(4), 587-597.

Donno, D., & Russett, B. (2004). Islam, authoritarianism, and female empowerment: What are the linkages? *World Politics*, *56*(4), 582-607.

Edmunds, H. (1999). *The focus group Research Handbook.* Chicago: American Marketing Association and Ntc Business Books.

International labor organization. (2007). *Gender, Poverty and Employment*. Ejderyan, O., & Tuor, K.

Elgarte, J. M. (2008). Basic income and the gendered division of labour. *Basic Income Studies*, *3*(3), 4-4.

Esmiol, E. E., Knudson-Martin, C., & Delgado, S. (2012). Developing a contextual consciousness: Learning to address gender, societal power, and culture in clinical practice. *Journal of marital and family therapy*, *38*(4), 573-588.

Fontana, A., Frey, J. H., Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). *The Sage handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, Calif: Sage.

Gadit, A. A. M., & Mugford, G. (2008). A pilot study of bullying and harassment among medical professionals in Pakistan, focusing on psychiatry: need for a medical ombudsman. *Journal of medical ethics*, *34*(6), 463-466.

Gerring, J. (1997). Ideology: A definitional analysis. *Political Research Quarterly*, *50*(4), 957-994.

Gruber, J. E. (1998). The impact of male work environments and organizational policies on women's experiences of sexual harassment. *Gender & Society*, *12*(3), 301-320.

Harrell, M. C., & Bradley, M. A. (2009). Data collection methods. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups. *Rand National Defense Research Inst Santa Monica ca*.

Heppner, P.P. and KivlighanJr, D.M., 81. Wampold, BE (1999). *Research design in counselling* (2nd ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth

Ingraham, C. (1994). The heterosexual imaginary: Feminist sociology and theories of gender. *Sociological theory*, *12*(2), 203-219.

Jagsi, R., Griffith, K. A., Jones, R., Perumalswami, C. R., Ubel, P., & Stewart, A. (2016). Sexual harassment and discrimination experiences of academic medical faculty. *Jama*, *315*(19), 2120-2121.

Kabeer, N. (2005). Gender equality and women's empowerment: A critical analysis of the third millennium development goal 1. *Gender & Development*, *13*(1), 13-24.

Kothari, C.R. (2004). *Research methodology: Methods and techniques.* New Age International.

Kumar, R. (2005). *Research Methodology*. Dorling Kindersley (India) Pvt Ltd.

Majumdar, P.K., 2005. *Research methods in social science*. New Delhi, India: Viva Books.

McLaughlin, H., Uggen, C., & Blackstone, A. (2012). Sexual harassment, workplace authority, and the paradox of power. *American sociological review*, *77*(4), 625-647.

Nahar, P., Van Reeuwijk, M., & Reis, R. (2013). Contextualising sexual harassment of adolescent girls in Bangladesh. *Reproductive health matters*, *21*(41), 78-86.

Noreen, N., & Musarrat, R. (2013). Protection of women rights through legal reforms in Pakistan. *Journal of Public Administration and Governance*, *3*(4), 119-142.

Perera, S., & Abeysinghe, S. (2017). Combatting Workplace Sexual Harassment of Female Employees in Sri Lanka: An Empirical Analysis. In *Proceedings of APIIT Business, Law & Technology Conference, 2017*.

Quine, L. (2002). Workplace bullying in junior doctors: questionnaire survey. *Bmj*, *324*(7342), 878-879.

Rajasekar, S., Philominathan, P., & Chinnathambi, V. (2006). Research methodology. arXiv preprint physics/0601009.

Razmjoo, S. A., & Movahed, M. (2009). On the Relationship between Socio-cultural Factors and Language Proficiency (Case Study: Shiraz University MA Students). *Journal of Pan-Pacific Association of Applied Linguistics*, *13*(2), 59-76.

Sadruddin, M. M. (2013). Sexual harassment at workplace in Pakistan-Issues and remedies about the global issue at managerial sector. Journal of Managerial Sciences, Volume VII Number 1.

Sarantakos, S. (2012). *Social research*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Saunders, M. L., & Lewis, P. (2009). P. and Thornhill, A. (2009). Research methods for business students, 4.

Stoddart, M. C. (2007). Ideology, hegemony, discourse: A critical review of theories of knowledge and power. *Social Thought & Research*, *28*, 191-225. http://dx.doi.org/10.17161/STR.1808.5226

Uggen, C., & Shinohara, C. (2009). Sexual harassment comes of age: A comparative analysis of the United States and Japan. *The Sociological Quarterly*, *50*(2), 201-234.

Walther, M. (2014). Bourdieu's theory of practice as theoretical framework. In *Repatriation to France and Germany,* 7-23. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-658-05700-8_2

Yasmin, N., & Jabeen, S. (2017). Workplace Harassment: Psychological Effects and Coping Strategies in Public and Private Organizations of Lahore-Pakistan. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences*, *11*(1).

Zainal, Z. (2007). Case study as a research method. *Jurnal Kemanusiaan*, *5*(1).

http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/divisional-structure.html

http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/socio-cultural-environment.html

https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/sociocultural

https://www.investopedia.com/terms/s/social-economics.asp

https://www.britannica.com/topic/economic-sociology

https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/ideology

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ideology#cite_note-1

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Social_reality#cite_ref-1

https://www.britannica.com/topic/division-of-labour

https://ctb.ku.edu/en/best-change-processes/defining-organizational-structure/overview

Annexures

Interview Guide for UDC 1 and UDC 3: Female and male employees of Ufone

Profile

Name of the respondent:

Age:

Marital Status:

1) What is your educational history?
2) What your parents do?
3) What is the family structure?
4) Who is the head of household, what is the criteria of being head and why?

Economic background

1) Do you get allowance from head of the household if yes, on what basis?
2) Who makes consumption, investment and management decisions?
3) Are you a part of any club, national and international organizations, if yes name those organizations?
4) Do you have any knowledge about the rights of women in inheritance?

Socio-cultural background

1) What religion and denomination of religion you have?
2) In the cultural background from which you belong, what is the primary role/duties of an ideal women?
3) What does your religion say about the nature of men and women?
4) In your culture practice how men and women ontology is understood in comparison?

Women harassment

1) How do you define harassment or what is harassment?

2) In your opinion, are women at workplace in Pakistan harassed a lot or not? If yes, then why?

3) Do you think there is also an issue of harassment at your workplace?

4) In your opinion, what are the major causes of women harassment at workplace in organization?

5) What are the push factors that lead women to report or not to report harassment?

6) Do you know any harassment case at your organization that was dealt by harassment committee in your organization?

7) Do you think there is a need to change organizational culture to cut down on the incidence of harassment at your organization?

8) Is there a need of any changes in the larger culture that would minimize women harassment at workplace?

Questionnaire for UDC 2: Focus Group Discussion of Harassment committee members

Profile

Name:

Age:

Designation:

1) How do you understand the phenomena of harassment at workplace?

2) How many people are there in committee to which you are part of and when you become a member?

3) What was the procedure followed by the organization to enable you to become a part of committee?

4) Number of harassment cases that you dealt with since, you are a part of committee and details of these cases?

5) In your opinion, why it is that some women report, and some don't?

6) In your opinion, what is the role of larger culture of the employees in committing harassment and of the employees dealing with it?

7) What in your opinion, has been the impact of creation of office of women Ombudsperson and passing of the bill against women harassment at workplace on the incidence of workplace harassment in your organization?

8) What changes in your opinion, need to be made in the structure and dynamics of your organization to reduce the incidence of women harassment at workplace?

9) What changes in your opinion, need to be made in the larger society to decrease the incidence of women harassment in your organization and others?

Interview guide for UDC 4: Sectary of Ombudsperson Office

Profile

Name:

Education:

Marital Status:

1. What different offices have you held within the government and in the parliament in your entire career?
2. How do you understand the phenomena of harassment against women at workplace in Pakistan?
3. Please tell me in detail the structure of your office of Ombudsperson office?
4. Please give me the details of four most important cases of women harassment that was decided or deal by you in last 1 year.
5. What was your experience as women Ombudsperson, where there is more harassment in private or public sector, discuss why and give reasons?
6. In your opinion, has the formation of your office contributed positively towards women harassment at workplace please discuss.
7. In your opinion, what are the major organizational factors that are responsible for women harassment at workplace?
8. How in your opinion, does the larger cultural value system contribute towards workplace harassment and reporting?